ATHABASCA UNIVERSITY

AN EXPLORATION OF THE POTENTIAL OF MUSIC AND NARRATIVE SONG AS AN INSTRUMENT FOR LEARNING, WITH A FOCUS ON DISTANCE EDUCATION

BY

Kirk Longpré

A thesis submitted to the Athabasca University Governing Council in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF DISTANCE EDUCATION

Athabasca, Alberta

April, 2004
ATHABASCA UNIVERSITY

The undersigned certify that they have read and recommend to the Athabasca University Governing Council for acceptance a thesis – AN EXPLORATION OF THE POTENTIAL OF MUSIC AND NARRATIVE SONG AS AN INSTRUMENT FOR LEARNING, WITH A FOCUS ON DISTANCE EDUCATION. Submitted by KIRK LONGPRÉ in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of MASTER OF DISTANCE EDUCATION.

Patrick J. Fahy, Ph.D.
Supervisor

Jonathan Baggaley, Ph.D.
Committee Member

Eila Lamb, Ed.D.
Committee Member

Date: April, 2004
DEDICATION

I would like to dedicate this thesis in memory of my father, Bernard Longpré, for demonstrating to me the significance of hard work and instilling the value of education.
ABSTRACT

This thesis uses the qualitative research methodologies of Educational Criticism and Grounded Theory to explore whether expressive culture in the form of popular narrative song can play a constructive role as an instrument or agent for learning in the context of distance adult education. In chapter one, the author provides a theoretical framework for incorporating popular narrative song into the distance adult learning experience. Chapter two reviews the research literature related to the themes discovered through the interview process involving eighteen individuals that served as the foundation for this study and the research literature associated with several theories of adult learning. In chapter three, the methodology of Educational Criticism and Grounded Theory is explained, the informants and the research sites are described. In chapter four, the themes that evolved as a result of the researcher’s interviews are analysed and presented. Chapter five provides an examination of the relationship between the eight themes that were discovered through analysis and several adult learning theories. In the final chapter, the author reflects on the implications of the relationship between popular narrative song and distance adult learning, and draws conclusions regarding the use of popular narrative song and distance adult education. Conclusions drawn from the research are discussed in portions entitled “Theme 8: Overcomes Distance,” and “Implications of this Research to the Field of Distance Adult Learning.” The chapter closes with recommendations for further study and with reflections on the research. The author suggests that there is sufficient justification, supported by research literature, and brought to life by the experiences, thoughts and reflections of those with an intimate knowledge of song for incorporating popular narrative song into appropriate distance adult learning experiences. Also included are the lyrics to twenty-two songs either
connected in some way to the comments made by, or specifically cited by the informants of this study.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

It has been an amazing experience putting this research study together. Many people contributed to the conception and completion of this project. I would like to acknowledge the following individuals for their friendship and encouragement, as well as their inspiration and support throughout my graduate education.

- My wife Marion and my children, Nicole and Justin, who were always there for me providing love, comfort, as well as ongoing encouragement and support.
- My supervisor, Dr. Patrick Fahy, for his valued suggestions and ongoing support throughout this journey.
- Thesis committee members, Dr. Jon Baggaley and Dr. Eila Lamb, for their interest in my study and their contributions to my learning.
- Dr. Bruce Spencer who, in my second MDDE course, encouraged and stimulated my curiosity relative to song and adult learning.
- To my Research Validation Team, Mr. Colin Campbell and Mr. Fred Hagan, who took the time to read, comment, and contribute their insight into my research findings.
- Athabasca University, Centre for Distance Education Administrative Assistant, Glenda Hawryluk who, from a distance, has always provided constant, cheerful, professional and personal support.
- The Graduate Student Disciplinary Research Fund (GSDRF) committee who generously contributed funding support for my research.
- Finally, my sincere appreciation to all the singers, songwriters, and musicians who were willing to spend time with me. All who were involved, were supportive, hospitable,
inspirational, and so generous with their time and so passionate about their work. Their openness and rich insights gave me strength to carry on. I am eternally grateful.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER I

Background ........................................................................................................................ 1
Statement of Purpose .......................................................................................................... 3
Significance of the Study ................................................................................................... 5
Assumptions of the Study .................................................................................................. 7
Research Questions ............................................................................................................ 7
Limitations ......................................................................................................................... 8
Delimitations ...................................................................................................................... 8
The Researcher’s Role ....................................................................................................... 8
Definitions ........................................................................................................................ 10
Overview of the Chapters ................................................................................................. 14
Summary .......................................................................................................................... 15

## CHAPTER II

Research in Education and the Arts ................................................................................. 16
Themes Associated with Song ......................................................................................... 19
Adult and Distance Learning Theories ............................................................................ 30
Summary .......................................................................................................................... 31

## CHAPTER III

Characteristics of Qualitative Research ........................................................................... 33
The Tenets of Educational Criticism ................................................................................ 36
Description ....................................................................................................................... 37
Interpretation .................................................................................................................... 38
Evaluation ........................................................................................................................ 39
Thematics ......................................................................................................................... 40
CHAPTER V .............................................................................................................. 144
Background - Adult Learning ................................................................. 145
Theories of Adult Learning........................................................................ 146
Characteristics of Adults as Learners (CAL)........................................... 147
Andragogy ..................................................................................................... 147
Anchored Instruction .................................................................................... 148
Cognitive Domain Model ........................................................................... 149
Cognitive Constructivism Theory ................................................................. 150
Cognitive Flexibility Theory ....................................................................... 150
Conditions of Learning ................................................................................ 151
Constructivist Theory ................................................................................... 152
Experiential Learning Theory ...................................................................... 154
Levels of Processing ....................................................................................... 157
Multiple Intelligences Theory ..................................................................... 158
TABLES

Table 1: Correlation Between Themes Related To Song and Theories of Adult Learning...175
CHAPTER I
INTRODUCTION

“You can learn more about people by listening to their songs than any other way, for into the songs go all the hopes and hurts, the anger, fear, the wants and the aspirations.” (John Steinbeck)

Background

The purpose of this study is to explore whether expressive culture in the form of popular music, specifically narrative song, through its unique characteristics, can play a constructive role as an instrument or agent for learning in the context of the process of distance adult education.

Lindeman (1926) has stated that “If learning is to be revivified, quickened so as to become once more an adventure, we all have need of new concepts, new motives, new methods; we shall need to experiment with the qualitative aspects of education” (p. 4). I propose that if a relationship can be found between popular narrative song and distance adult learning, this study may provide a vehicle for or another tool to the distance educators’ repository of techniques and technologies. This in turn may assist distance educators in making distance education the adventure Lindeman alludes to.

Coming upon a suitable definition of popular music is a challenge. If we ask what the terms popular music or popular song mean we are inevitably able to think of a diversity of possible answers. “The criteria for what counts as popular music and popular song, and their application to specific musical styles and genres are open to considerable debate” (Shuker, 1998, p. viii). Defining popular music is riddled with complexities (Cassara & Gates, 2000; Gammond, 1991, Middleton, 1990, cited in Shuker, 1994; Negus, 1992; Shuker, 1998; Williams 1983). Part of the problem with attempting to define popular music is the difficulty
of differentiating between pop, rock and folk music as well as other genres or styles (Llewellyn, 1998). This issue becomes less problematic when one considers that all popular music consists of a hybrid of musical traditions, styles and influences (Firth, 1983; Shuker, 1998).

Historically, the term popular music has meant music ‘of the ordinary people’ (Gammond, 1991; Shuker, 1998, Williams, 1983). Woody Guthrie summed it up by stating that “Every song is a song, by the folks and for the folks. I don’t recall really ever writing any songs for cows, chickens, fish, monkeys nor wild animals of any kind” (Russell & Tyson, 1995, p. 101). Popular music reflects the musical repertory and tradition of communities and deals with the various phases of daily life (Apel, 1962; Green, 1999). It has a close relationship to the society from which it comes, because it in some way replicates and reveals the forms and processes of that society. Examples such as working songs, love songs, cradle songs, drinking songs, patriotic songs, dancing songs, political and protest songs, spirituals, blues, and narrative songs all examine and reflect societies, communities, and cultures in some manner (Apel, 1962, Shuker, 1998). Another characteristic of songs is that they can also be passed from person to person or generation to generation (Shuker, 1998). “The essence of popular music is that it should be readily comprehensible (and perhaps performable by) a large proportion of the populace, and that its appreciation presupposes little or no knowledge of musical theory or techniques” (Lamb & Hamm, 1995, p. 87).

Will Schmid, chair of the music department at the University of Wisconsin, provides a suitable summary definition which pertains to this study. He contends that “Popular music is any style of music that is currently well known by large groups of people. Originally, popular music was spread by oral tradition, later it was influenced by stage productions,
travelling musicians, printed music, piano rolls, recordings, radio, TV, and the Internet” (Cassara & Gates, 2000, p. 23).

Popular music for the purposes of this study will focus on song, which is defined as a piece of music for voice or voices, both accompanied and unaccompanied (Apel, 1962; Cassara & Gates, 2000; Chew, 1995). Song has been made the focus because “songs of every kind exist among every nation, race, or tribe, and they form an immense wealth of material which is of great interest and importance. Just as singing is the most ancient and most widespread kind of music-making, so song stands out among all the forms and types of music for the age of its tradition and for the largeness of its repertory” (Apel, 1962, p. 698).

**Statement of Purpose**

Music, as an ancient form of communication, is known to influence (sometimes profoundly) the thinking and actions of learners. Historically, song has been the most instructive of musical forms, serving as a vehicle for articulating, conveying, expressing, and celebrating the central themes and beliefs of cultures (Apel, 1962; Blacking 1973; Dewey, 1934; Dissanayake, 1995; cited in Upitis, Smithrim, & Soren, 1998; Green, 1999; Kennedy, 2000, cited in Upitis, 2000a; Rowland, 1999; Shunker, 1998; Upitis, 2000a). Education strives for these same effects, but it is rare for education to employ song as an instructional medium (Rowland, 1999). This raises several questions regarding the impact of song on the learning experience and on the process of learning itself. Since song is undoubtedly a valid and powerful form of communication among human beings, is it possible song might be employed to foster learning? Is it possible that lyrics and music can combine to attract listeners’ attention, capture their interest, and promote their creative imagination? As well, is
it likely that song can reflect human experience, and if so, can song aid listeners in constructing meaning in their lives? Is it possible for song to stimulate cognition and enlightenment or even take one beyond the cognitive realm of the mind? Does song have the ability to initiate change and transformation in the learning process and if so, how does it achieve this? Most importantly for the purpose of this thesis, can song overcome the barriers posed by distance? These questions and others raise several important issues which relate to the role of popular narrative song and distance adult learning.

This study will explore the views of musicians, especially the writers and performers of songs, about the capability and potential of song to "educate"; that is, to fundamentally change the perceptions and behaviour of human beings, by altering their understanding of themselves, others, and the world. The views of musicians and songwriters will be captured through interviews. The conversations and viewpoints captured will be compared with those of other musicians in the study, as well as theoretical research related to music and song. Finally, it will contrast the emerging consensus about song as an educational tool with adult educational theories.

Perraton (2000) argues that distance educators should develop research strategies that started with the kind of hierarchy of learning proposed by Gagné and research approaches designed to achieve learning at the upper end of that hierarchy. While I would agree that explorations relating to the learning theories of Gagné (1985, Gagné & Driscoll, 1988; Gagné, Briggs & Wagner, 1992) are important I would put forward that research strategies relating to other theories of learning might be equally as useful.

The research for this study will draw upon the principles of Educational Criticism as found in the qualitative tradition (Barone & Eisner, 1997; Eisner, 1991, 1998). It will attempt
to determine whether there are characteristics, qualities, or themes associated with popular narrative song by those who practice the crafts of song-writing and/or singing, that relate to various theories of adult learning employed by distance educators and which apply to distance adult learning environments.

**Significance of the Study**

This study is unique in that it addresses aspects of music and distance adult education that have not previously been systematically and thoroughly studied. The intent of this study is to provide contributions both to the building of theory and to the provision of practical solutions in the form of tools or guides for the use of song in the field of distance education.

Bresler (1998), Colwell (1998) and Seidman (1991) contend that the most important criterion for any research is that it be about something important—important to policy makers and researchers, as well as practitioners. The appropriateness of ideas and knowledge drawn from research for this study will depend on the extent to which educational practitioners, administrators, and policymakers view them as speaking to their concrete, practical concerns associated with the distance adult teaching-learning transactions (Garrison, 2000; McIsaac & Gunawardena, 1996; Perraton, 2000).

The arts and the humanities have provided a long tradition of ways of describing, interpreting, and appraising the world. History, art, literature, dance, drama, poetry, and music are among the most important forms through which humans have represented and shaped their experience (Eisner, 1998; Upitis, 2000a; Upitis & Smithrim, 2002a). Through creative forms we are given the opportunity to see, experience the ordinary, and to learn to understand in new and different ways (Brearley, 2000; Dewey, 1934; Dissanayake, 1995,
cited in Upitis, Smithrim, & Soren, 1998; Eisner, 1994; Gardner, 1973, 1983; Greene, 1995; Gourlay cited in Bjorkvold, 1992; Upitis, 2000a). Dewey (1934) asserts that “if all meaning could be adequately expressed by words, the arts of painting and music would not exist” (p. 74). Eisner, (1981, 1982, 1992, 1997), maintains that we need not limit meaning to the meanings that language can convey since there are other forms to convey meaning. A number of researchers support the idea that creative forms invite us to see more clearly and feel more deeply. They argue that creative forms provide opportunities to achieve insights and perceptions that go beyond our previous level of understanding and allow us to develop insights and perceptions that would otherwise be inaccessible (Arnheim, 1969, 1974; Banks & Banks, 1998; Bjorkvold, 1992; Brearley, 2000; Dewey, 1934; Eisner, 1981, 1994, 1998, 2002; Eisner & Barone, 1997; Ellis, 1997; Gardner, 1973, 1983; Howard, 1992; Richardson, 1997; Upitis, 2000a). The choice of forms of representation used by teachers or instructors to help students understand can have a major influence on what they have an opportunity to learn (Eisner, 1998; Epstein, 1998), since each form of representation imposes its own cognitive requirements and requires its own skills (Eisner, 1981, 1982). Traditional communication methods, such as music, can therefore be important channels for facilitating learning, behavioural change, people’s participation, and dialogue (Carter, 1994).

Music is a way of communication. Distance education is also a way of communication. How does one communicate a communication? How can we convey music and song through distance education (Ottem, 1982)? These questions raise the important issue of relating the use of music and song to distance education and how songs might be delivered to the adult learner.
Assumptions of the Study

The following assumptions are fundamental to the purpose and design of this study:

1) participants will be willing and able to relate their experiences and perceptions related to popular narrative song and learning;

2) encounters with participants will provide the researcher with insights into popular song and distance learning;

3) the purpose of the study is to generate descriptive theory;

4) the use of Educational Criticism and Grounded Theory methodologies are appropriate for this study;

5) information gathered from this study will be useful to distance learners, practitioners, and administrators.

Research Questions

The research questions to be examined in this study are:

1) Are there any characteristics, qualities or attributes of popular narrative song that have the potential to instruct, educate or produce learning in their audience, in the view of performers of this craft?

2) Are any of the qualities, characteristics, or attributes, identified by the musicians/songwriters interviewed, related in some way to the various learning theories associated with adult distance education?
Limitations

This study must be viewed in light of the following limitations: The interviewees have information that will contribute to this study as well as the willingness, interest, and ability of informants to participate in the interview process. The accuracy of the interview process to reflect the informant’s experience; and the ability of the researcher’s tools to accurately recall the events related to the research.

Delimitations

This study will be delimited to a study of theory, a focus on distance adult education, and to interview participants who have worked with or have an intimate association with popular songs. In addition, only those individuals located or performing on tour in the Greater Victoria, Vancouver Island, or Lower Mainland region of British Columbia were interviewed.

The Researcher’s Role

Eisner (1991) states that the most important “instrument” in qualitative inquiry is the researcher. One strength of qualitative research is that researchers are asked to reflect on their involvement in the inquiry process (Chenail, 1994). Since qualitative research is interpretative research, the biases, values, and judgement of the researcher should be explicitly in the research report (Burke, 1997; Cresswell, 1994). They recommend that statements about past experiences of the researcher that provide familiarity with the topic, the setting, or the informants can contribute to the openness of a study.
From a personal standpoint I have had a life-long recreational interest in popular music as an amateur musician, researcher, concert-goer, and avid record collector. I have felt the presence of song to communicate, inspire, touch, influence, uplift, heal, educate, and transform. At times I have wondered whether other individuals have had similar experiences. Several years ago it occurred to me that there may be more to song than just being vehicle for entertainment. As an educator with close to thirty years experience at the secondary school level I have observed that the primary learning resources used in classrooms have been, in most cases, primarily a combination of print and visual media, formal lecture, and discussion. This is the case despite the pervasive existence of popular music in our lives. As a result, I have been surprised at how infrequently music and song has been adopted or utilised by educators. This observation prompted my curiosity and fuelled my interest in this research project.

Initially I examined the use of music and song as an instrument for social transformation in an assignment for MDDE 611 - Foundations of Adult Education course in 1999. In MDDE 613 - Adult Learning and Development I was struck by the effectiveness of using documentary and feature films as a way to exemplify adult learning theory. It occurred to me at that time that if it is possible to use film as a distance learning tool might it be possible to use music and song? As I progressed through additional courses in the Athabasca University Master of Distance Education Program I continually returned to the same questions. In a project for MDDE 610 - Introduction to Technologies in Distance Education and Training I argued for the use of music videos as a tool in distance education. In MDDE 617 - Program Planning in Adult & Continuing Education I developed a proposal to connect music educators and musicians at a music festival with the notion of examining like-minded
ideas related to learning and song. This was followed by an examination of the use of music and song as an instrument for distance education in the Caribbean and Latin American Region in MDDE 614 - International Issues in Distance Education. I have viewed each one of these projects as a stepping stone towards this research study.

I recognise the important role of the researcher in qualitative research and feel that it is critical that readers know and understand any potential for bias on my part. Every effort has been made to promote openness and truthfulness by conducting this study openly and with complete explanation of each step involved in the research process.

As described in the next chapter, there is a scarcity of literature on the issue of popular narrative song and distance adult learning. I designed this research for the purpose of exploring whether popular narrative song can play a constructive role as an instrument or vehicle for learning in the context of the process of distance adult education. I will explain the design of this study in more detail in Chapter 3.

Definitions

Cresswell (1994) explains that “researchers define terms so that readers can understand the context in which words are being used or their unusual or restricted meaning” (p. 106). In addition, Cresswell recommends that terms should be defined when they first appear in a research study. He also states that definitions and explanations are generally embedded in text of this thesis. Since this a qualitative inductive study most terms will be “defined as they emerge from the data collection” (p. 107). Therefore only a limited number of terms have been defined at this stage.
**Adult education**: “Activities intentionally designed for the purpose of bringing about learning among those whose age, social roles, or self-perception define them as adults” (Meriam and Brockett, cited in Raiskums, 2001, p. 23). Houle (1972, p. 26 cited in Cookson, 1998) adds that the process of adult education is a “process by which men and women (alone, in groups, or in institutional settings seek to improve themselves or their society” (p. 4).

**Adult learner**: “One who has an independent self-concept, a depth and breadth of prior experience that can be used in learning, a readiness and orientation to learn related to the roles and responsibilities of adult life, and who is internally motivated” (Knowles, 1984; Mancuso, 2000, cited in Raiskums, 2001, p. 3).

**Adult learning**: “A cognitive process internal to the learner; it is what the learner does in a teaching-learning transaction, as opposed to what the educator does” (Merriam & Brockett, 1997, cited in Raiskums, 2001, p. 3).

**Distance education / learning**: There seems to be no one definition of distance learning. Rather there are many approaches to defining the term (Calder, 2000; Commonwealth of Learning, 2000a). Common aspects of the various definitions include separation of teacher in time and place or in both time and place. The learner is not constrained to be physically present in the same location as the teacher. The use of information technologies to unite the teacher and the learner in distance learning situations (Commonwealth of Learning, 2000a; Moore & Kearsley; Shin, 2000, cited in Raiskums, 2001). In addition, McIssac & Gunawardena (1996) explain that distance education is a concept that covers the teaching-learning activities in the cognitive, psycho-motor, and affective domains of an individual learner and a supporting organisation.
Educational Criticism: “Its aim is to illuminate a situation or object so that it can be seen or appreciated” (Eisner, 1998, p. 7). Criticism is an art of identifying useful things about complex and subtle objects and events so that others can see and understand what they did not see and understand before (Eisner, 1998).


Informal learning: “Unplanned, incidental learning from daily experiences” (Muhamad & Merriam, 2000 cited in Raiskums, 2001, p. 44)


Narrative: Various Oxford (1983, 1984, 1997, 1998) dictionaries define narrative as a story, history, tale or recital which can be long or short; of past, present or future; factual or imagined; written or spoken; told for any purpose; and with or without much detail.

The words “narrative” and “story” can both be traced back to an original meaning of “to know.” It is through narrative that we construct and maintain our knowledge of the world (Pradl, 1984) through the application of story as a metaphor for life (Egan, 1992; Norman, 2000; Rossiter, 1999). Hardy (1968, p. 5, cited in Norman, 2000) contends that “we dream in narrative, daydream in narrative, remember, anticipate, hope, despair, believe, doubt, plan, revise, criticise, gossip, learn, hate and live by narrative.” By means of narrative we see the
life-view embodied, enter into it, understand how it looks and feels to construct the world in its way, and we are consequently stimulated to reflect on our own way of construing the world (Mitchell, 1991; Toolan, 1988).

Many researchers have become interested in narratives and the insights they have often provide (Berger, 1996, Baumgartner, 2000, cited in Raiskums, 2001; Casteleden & Kurszewski, 2000, cited in Raiskums, 2001; Hill, 2000, cited in Raiskums, 2001). Consequently, the concept of narrative has played a role in wide range of fields including psychology, literature, communication, linguistic research, biographic research, theology, philosophy, anthropology, and sociology (Baumgartner, 2000, cited in Raiskums; Berger, 1996; Brooks & Clark, 2001; Pradl, 1984).

**Non-formal learning**: “Any organised educational activity outside the established institutional system” (Muhumad & Merriam, 2000, cited in Raiskums, 2001, p. 63).

**Thematics**: “The formulation of themes within an Educational Criticism means identifying the recurring messages that pervade the situation about which the critic writes. Themes are the dominant features of the situation or person, those qualities of place, person, or object that define or describe identity. These themes are distillations of what has been encountered” (Eisner, 1998, p. 103).

**Transformational learning**: “The emancipatory process of becoming critically aware of how and why our perspectives are so [sic] through critical self-reflection, which results in the reformulation of a meaning perspective to allow a more inclusive, discriminating and integrative understanding of one’s experience, and acting, or deciding not to act, upon these new meanings (Mezirow, 1991, cited in Raiskums, 2001, p. 90).
**Triangulation / Structural Corroboration**: A research technique involving the confluence of multiple methods, data collection, strategies, and/or data sources, in order to get a more complete picture and to cross-check information (Eisner, 1998; Narushima, 2000, cited in Raiskums, 2001, p. 91).

**Overview of the Chapters**

In Chapter I the reader will be provided a theoretical framework for incorporating popular narrative song into the distance adult learning experience. Chapter II will review the research literature related to the themes discovered through the interview process involving eighteen individuals that served as the foundation for this study and several theories of adult learning. In Chapter III, the methodology of Educational Criticism and Grounded Theory will be explained, the informants and the research sites will be described. In Chapter IV, the themes that evolved as a result of the researcher’s interviews will be analysed and presented. Chapter V will provide an examination of the relationship between the eight themes that were discovered through analysis and several adult learning theories. In the final chapter, the author will reflect on the implications of the relationship between popular narrative song and distance adult learning, and will draw conclusions regarding the use of popular narrative song and distance education. Conclusions drawn from the research will be discussed in portions entitled “Theme 8: Overcomes Distance,” and “Implications of this Research to the Field of Distance Adult Learning.” The chapter will close with recommendations for further study and with reflections on the research. The author will suggest that there is sufficient justification, supported by research literature, and brought to life by the experiences, thoughts, and reflections of those with an intimate knowledge of song for incorporating
popular narrative song into appropriate distance adult learning experiences. Also included in this paper are the lyrics of twenty-two songs either connected in some way to the comments made by, or specifically cited by the informants of this study.

Summary

This is a qualitative study of the educative potential of popular narrative song as seen from the perspectives of performers. The intention of the study is to determine if there are characteristics, qualities, or themes associated with popular narrative song that relate to various theories of adult learning employed by distance educators, and which apply to distance adult learning. In addition, this study may provide a valued contribution both to the building of theory and to the provision of practical tools or guides for the use of song in distance education. The study is significant in that it addresses aspects of music that have not previously been systematically and thoroughly studied. Chapter Two will contain a review of the research to date that is related to the themes associated with popular narrative song and distance adult learning as discovered through this study.
CHAPTER II
A REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

“The mind’s ear is larger than the literal eye.” (Jan Zwicky)

Cresswell (1994) explains that one of the main “reasons for conducting a qualitative study is that the study is exploratory, not much has been written about the topic being studied” (p. 21). This study addresses aspects of music, specifically popular narrative song, and distance adult education that have not previously been systematically and thoroughly studied. The role of music and song in distance education is one that has been largely ignored. In fact, a search of the literature revealed a scarcity of information on the subject. A query of Educational Resources Information Centre (ERIC) revealed only 45 distance education and music related documents and a search of the International Centre for Distance Learning, The Open University (ICDL) found only 13 records relating music and distance education. These references focused on the use of distance education techniques and technologies to teach music appreciation, performance, or history. None of the references examined the use of music or song as a learning tool or vehicle to enhance distance education in areas unrelated to the study of music. While research studies on the educational potential of song in distance learning environments were scarce, there were a surprising number of studies on the use of music and song in other educational situations.

As this study is exploratory and qualitative in nature, the literature review is used inductively and does not direct the questions asked by the researcher (Cresswell, 1994). The main purpose of this literature review is to establish where the emerging theory is situated in relation to the existing bodies of literature. For this thesis “the term literature is employed to include anything appropriate to the topic, such as theories, documents, newspaper accounts,
empirical studies and so forth” (Mauch & Birch, 1998, p. 109). Based on the recommendations of Mauch & Birch (1998) sources of literature included journals, major books, monographs, as well as other relevant sources on the subject of narrative, music, song, adult learning, and distance education.

**Research in Education and the Arts**

Selecting an appropriate methodology to investigate the potential of popular narrative song as a tool or vehicle for distance adult learning posed a significant challenge. The first step taken was to review some of the literature related to research methods used in education and the social sciences in order to determine what research methodology might be appropriate for this thesis. Initially the text on research methods by Simon & Burstein (1985) was consulted for advice on how to initiate research projects. Next the collection edited by Jaeger (1997) was examined because it presented a variety of approaches to research problems written by ten leading authorities in the field of educational research. Considering that this was an arts-related study, my attention was drawn to an article by Barone & Eisner (1997), which was located in the Jaeger (1997) collection. Barone & Eisner (1997) maintain that artistic modes of inquiry are useful modes of inquiry for exploratory research and for generating observations and hypothesis in areas where little prior investigation has occurred. This method demands that the inquirer attend to the subtleties and nuances of educational materials, settings, and events. From this article I was lead to other work by Eisner (1998, 1991) who contends that history, art, literature, dance, drama, poetry, and music are among the most important forms through which humans have represented and shaped their experience. In this work, Eisner described the features that make Educational Criticism a
form of qualitative study. Once I determined that Educational Criticism would provide a suitable methodology for this thesis, I then had to determine a way to organise the data that was to be collected into a form that could be analysed. It was at that point that I determined that Grounded Theory methodology might enable me to accomplish this purpose. I consulted several sources that supplied the required information on Grounded Theory. Dick (2000a, 2000b) provided a useful outline of the basic concepts and practices related to the Grounded Theory methodology, and Strauss & Corbin (1990) contributed the details for understanding the tenets of Grounded Theory methodology, as well as its concepts and procedures.

Cresswell (1994) and Dick (2000) both recommended that those using Grounded Theory methodology use literature as something to which they can compare emerging explanations gathered from informants rather than something used to set the stage for the study. Cresswell (1994) explained that the literature review in Grounded Theory is an inductive process that is an aid once the themes have been discovered, rather than being something which directs or guides the study. As well, both Dick (2000b) and Eisner (1998) have encouraged the treatment of literature as just more data, similar in status to the data collected in other ways during a study. Dick (2000b) describes the Grounded Theory methodology and process as having a strong emphasis on the simultaneous collection and interpretation of data that allows the data to guide the interpretation and methodology. Based on the advice of these authorities, the literature review for this study evolved as the thesis progressed through its various stages of development. In addition, Chenail (1994, 1995) contributed suggestions relating to openness, primacy of data, juxtaposition, use of metaphor, and data presentation in qualitative research. Based on the recommendations made by Cresswell (1994), Dick (2000b), and Eisner (1998), the literature reviewed in this chapter has
been selected to expose the reader to research literature which connects this study to the literature related to popular narrative song and distance adult learning.

Themes Associated with Song

In order to select the literature of most pertinence to this study, this literature review focused on research relating most clearly to the eight themes discovered through the analysis of the interviews conducted for this study. As previously mentioned in this chapter, no studies were found that were specifically connected to distance adult learning and popular song. Therefore several diverse bodies of related literature consisting of material associated with narrative, song, learning theory, and distance education were examined. This first portion of the literature review has been organised relative to the eight categories that reflect the themes which emerged in this study. These themes are: song is a means of communication; song reflects human experience; song fosters community; song embodies emotion; song stimulates cognition, enlightenment and learning; song facilitates transformation; song exhibits a transcendental or spiritual nature; and song overcomes distance. The *Canadian Oxford Dictionary* (Barber, 1998) and *Rodale’s Synonym Finder* (Rodale, 1986) provided the standard for English usage and definitions. As well, standard sources of terms and definitions associated with song, music, and learning were consulted. The *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians* (Sadie, 1980) provided essential music—related terms, concepts, and definitions, and Shuker (1998) provided a comprehensive glossary of the main terms and concepts used specifically in the study of popular music.

The first theme that was discovered described how song is a means of communication. Suzanne Langer (1952) contends that music as a vehicle for the conception
of reality is as valuable to humans as language. Her theories are part of an effort to clearly show that works of art are symbolic vehicles for understanding the world, and that musical experiences are an important part of knowing the world. Kazemek & Rigg (1997) support these theories and have elaborated on how music and song speak to us. Carroll (2001) and Masterson (1994) expanded this concept and have explained that music and song contain symbolic content that is capable of communication. In addition, Glatt (2000) has described how music and lyrics combine to become an effective communication system. Fay (2001) states that music is a universal language that is capable of communicating ideas in learning experiences. Baird (1999, 2000) has explained how the arts, and specifically music, are valuable in helping the marginalized find their voice and acquire critical literacy since the act of making art exposes a society to itself.

From the perspective of the role of narrative as communication, Bruner (1992) and Margarini (1996) have explained that narrative is a universal form of communication. Research described by Coles (1989), Mitchell (1991) and Rossiter (1999) support this view. Mitchell (1991) and Gudmundsottir (1995) have both elaborated on how narrative has the power to hold the audience or listeners’ interest. As well, Mitchell (1991) analysed the significance of fiction through the aesthetic theory of narrative art. She has argued that fictions are communications that seek and make possible understanding of the world. She concludes that narrative forms invite the listener into another view of life which can the lead to reflection of their own life.

The second theme which was discovered determined that song reflects human experience. I began to explore this theme by looking at the work of Hodges & Haack (1996) examined the biological, anthropological, sociological, and psychological perspectives
related to the influences of music on human behaviour. Merriam (1964) contributed additional insights into the all-pervasive anthropological implications of music on human behaviour, and Elliot (1994, 1995) synthesised studies from ethnomusicology, anthropology, feminism, semiotics, and analytic philosophy in his exploration of how music works. Elliot (1995) proposed that since music is a social-cultural endeavour and that musical works such as songs are a social-cultural construction they “both constitute and are constituted by culture-specific beliefs and values” (p. 184). Again, the work by Kazemek & Rigg (1997) supports the contention that music of all kinds speaks to us as humans. Robinson (1997) contributed to this topic by summarising the work of several musicologists who have argued that music has the ability to express feelings, thoughts, and important ideological messages that both reflect and create attitudes toward work, class, gender, and other classifications of human life. Tolbert (2001) viewed music as a vehicle for cultural truth since it is a universal process of symbolic thought. Garnett (1998) elaborated that cultural codes are inevitably built into musical configurations which can tell us something about the reception of music and the interpretative framework which people bring to bear on music. From a more practical perspective Cooper (1998) stated that popular song recordings are pieces of oral history and while they do have limitations they should be considered valuable instructional resources. To support his views Cooper also provided numerous examples of how particular songs might be integrated into specific learning experiences.

With regard to narrative and human experience, Rossiter (1999) described an approach to adult learning and development based on narrative. She suggested that by using a narrative approach to learning our understanding of adult learners and their learning processes is enhanced. Her article discussed what constitutes a narrative approach, narrative
knowing, and the contribution of narrative to meaning making. She also described the temporal, retrospective, and contextual nature of narrative development and its role in adult learning. The references associated with the Rossiter (1999) article provided an essential source of additional research literature. Cassidy (2001) expanded on the role of nature and human experience by explaining how the narrative perspective can enhance experiential learning of individuals. She viewed narrative as an important transformational tool that fosters understanding and aids individuals in communicating their ideas, thoughts, and experiences to others. Her paper is based on the notion that individuals learn through experience and a common way to express and communicate that experience is through story. As with Rossiter (1999), the references cited by Cassidy (2001) provided a valuable source of other research literature for this thesis. Norman (2000) expanded upon the work of Rossiter and Cassidy by examining the role that imagination plays in narrative and how it helps cultivate the meaning of experience and understanding in adult learning. Pradl (1984) suggested that, because narrative is so pervasive in our environment, educators, regardless of level, as well as those outside of the classroom, should explore narrative with their learners. Pradl viewed narrative as the collective wisdom about our world and about social-cultural behaviours, and argued that narratives are key mediating structures for each person’s encounters with reality. From another perspective, Brooks & Clark (2001) explored the possibilities for using narrative as a construct for understanding and theorising transformational learning, and expanding the possibilities for research and practice in adult education.

Theme three examines how song fosters community. Mitchell (1991), whose work has been previously mentioned with regard to the communicative aspects of narrative, also
provided some significant observations with regard to narrative and its role in promoting community. Gregory (1997), in his ethnomusicological study on the role of music in culture, described the vital role of music in community. This view was supported by work done by Elliot (1994, 1995) with regard to the role of music education and how it provides an important overview of the role of music and song in the community. The research undertaken by Tolbert (2001), which has been previously cited with reference to song and human experience, also referred to the role of music and song in forming a sense of community among individuals. A study by Stokes (1994) looked at this theme from a sociological and geographical perspective, by outlining how music can contribute to a sense of community. Morris (1999) contributed to the literature relating to this theme through his study of specific examples that illuminate the role of music in fostering community in Latin American and Caribbean music. Wald & Junkerman (1999) also supported this theme with specific examples from a musical tour along the length of the Mississippi River.

The fourth theme discovered examines the ability of song to embody emotion. Several researchers and theorists have investigated the role of emotion in music and song. Langer (1952) theorised that music is a representation of emotions. More recently the processes of affect and meaning in music have been examined by Shepherd & Wicke (1997), as well as Weinberger (1998a), who explained in more detail the emotional power of music. From the perspective of narrative, Brooks & Clark (2001) have found that narratives frequently appeal to emotions and affect. Based on research studies from the fields of neurobiology and psychology, Taylor (2001) has explored the emotional nature of knowing. Taylor (2001) offers a physiological explanation of the role of emotion in the transformative learning process. Based on the research examined by Taylor (2001), emotions are a vital
component of learning. Dirkx (2001) has theorised on how emotions experienced as
imagined engagement are central to making meaning from our experiences. Dirkx (1997) has
also argued that music has the potential to initiate transformative learning by involving very
personal and imaginative ways of knowing, grounded in a more intuitive and emotional sense
of human experiences.

The next theme explored how song stimulates cognition, enlightenment, and learning.
The literature identified in this category focuses primarily on theory and the findings from
several major reviews of educational research related to the arts.

Standley (1996) described a meta-analysis of 98 studies in diverse fields, which
reported success in using music to effect changes in childrens’ and adults’ behaviour inside
and outside of schools. A meta-analysis is a methodology used for synthesising a large body
of literature for the purpose of describing its characteristics, and for providing a basis for
generalising based on the data collected (Scripp, 2002; Standley, 1996). This study suggests
that music used as a reward effectively reinforces learning and behavioural changes. Standley
summarises her work by stating that music listening can be “adapted creatively to any
classroom and that it is applicable across a wide variety of musical, academic, and
behavioural objectives” (p. 129).

Catterall, Chapleau & Iwanaga (1999) analysed data on more than 25,000 learners
from the U. S. National Educational Longitudinal Survey, to determine the relationship of
engagement in the arts to student performance. Their findings were summarised in three main
sets of observations. First, they found positive academic developments for learners from
grades 8 through 12, with gains increasing over time. Second, they found that students who
reported high levels of involvement in instrumental music demonstrated higher levels of
mathematical achievement. Third, they found that sustained student involvement in theatre arts were associated with a variety of developments in reading proficiency, empathy, tolerance, and gains in self-concept and motivation. They concluded their study by suggesting the value of future phenomenological and longitudinal research to probe the meaning of arts experiences to individual learners as well as exploring changes in learning and development of learners involved in arts related experiences.

Fiske (1999) collected evidence, based on rigorous research, that examines the impact of arts experiences on young people in an effort to explore why and how learners were changed through their arts experiences. His report provided important findings on actual learning experiences involving the arts as well as presenting research findings, complete with groundbreaking, quantitative and qualitative data and analysis. The researchers cited by Fiske (1999) investigated the content, process, and results of learning through the arts. In brief, the research in this collection found that “learners can attain higher levels of achievement through their engagement with the arts” (Fiske, 1999, p. vii). As well, some of the studies cited in this collection found much evidence “that learning in the arts has significant effects on learning in other domains” (Fiske, 1999, p. vii). Fiske (1999) also reported a consensus among the findings presented in the collection. They found that the arts reach students who are not otherwise being reached and in ways that they are not otherwise being reached. As well, the arts connect students to themselves and each other. In addition, they concluded that the arts can transform the environment for learning and provide new challenges for learners (Fiske, 1999).

Work undertaken by Deasy (2002) provided a compendium of research on learning in the arts. In this compendium scholars summarise 60 studies connected to the social and
academic effects of learning through the arts, and outline the contributions of knowledge in each. The purpose of the collection was to recommend to researchers, and those funding research, promising lines of inquiry and study suggested by recent, strong studies of the academic and social effects of learning in the arts. Another purpose of the compendium was to provide designers of arts education curriculum and instruction with insights found in the research that suggest strategies for deepening the arts learning experiences that are required to achieve those effects. The essayists and commentators whose work was summarised in this compendium found support for the role of “arts learning in assisting in the development of critical academic skills, basic and advanced literacy and numeracy among them. They also offer suggestions, based on the studies, for restructuring curricula and instructional practices” (Deasy, 2002, p. iii).

Scripp (2002) has also compiled an overview of research papers on music and learning which found that music draws on and engages learning processes across many subject areas. He described how meta-analysis studies based on large bodies of research reveal consistent positive connections between music and learning in other subject areas. He concluded that this research now offers a theoretical basis and evidence on the effects of learning shared between music and other measures of academic achievement.

Burton, Horowitz & Abeles (1999, 2000) studied arts education programs in schools and investigated the ways that learning in the arts affected learning across the curriculum. They found that the complex and creative capacities typical of arts learning are similar to those capacities required in subjects such as science, mathematics, and language studies.

Three works by Jensen (1998, 2001, 2002) explored how numerous studies focusing on the arts have found that arts such as music and song promote the development of valuable
human neuro-biological systems which enhance the process of learning. The evidence cited by Jensen (1998, 2001, 2002) points to the arts as having positive effects on learner dropout rates, school attendance, increased engagement in the learning process, increased self concept, enhanced creativity, and greater cultural awareness.

Research and development related to teacher transformation through the arts undertaken by Upitis and Smithrim and their associates (1996, 1998, 1999, 2000, 2001, 2002), has produced several reports related to music and learning. This ongoing research has been supported by the Social Science and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SSHRC) and the Royal Conservatory of Music. Their ongoing longitudinal studies have attempted to assess the effects of learning through the arts on student achievement in mathematics and language, as well as attitudes towards school. While their work has focused primarily on children, measures of adults, including teachers and administrators, have also been taken. While these studies are ongoing there has been some early evidence of success. The findings reported in these studies suggest that involvement in the arts contributes to engagement in learning. As well, they found that involvement in the arts motivated learners, referring to the emotional, physical, cognitive, and social benefits of learning. In addition, teachers involved in the study program believed that the arts were an effective way to teach language, science, and math. The researchers involved in these studies concluded that the learners involved in studies benefit through gains in computational test scores. As well, they cited benefits which were more ephemeral, but perhaps more important in the long term, as students’ and teachers’ personal transformation through the arts.

Focusing solely on adult education Kerka (1997a) has summarised the value of the arts and music in helping adults learn. Her article looks at trends and issues related to the arts
in adult in education in three areas: ways of knowing, informal sites for learning, and cultural pluralism. While her article is not a research study it did provide a useful annotated list of resources related to the arts and adult learning.

Neuenfeldt (1997) studied how indigenous popular music can be used as an educational resource by music and non-music educators as a springboard to musical and extra-musical learning. While he does not offer a specific strategy for using popular music as a teaching / learning vehicle he does encourage educators to “think about using popular music as a teaching resource that has value as artistic expression and popular culture that addresses key issues in society” (p. 42). He provides several examples of how popular music may be used for educational purposes.

The sixth theme discovered explores how song facilitates transformation. Brooks & Clark (2001) have explored ways to conceptualise transformative learning as a narrative process. They explain that the concept of narrative is important, since narratives allow us to learn by constructing and reconstructing narratives to make meaning of information and events. They conclude that narrative offers enormous potential for understanding and theorising transformative learning by offering individuals a window through which they can view themselves, as well as a way of integrating new information and ideas into their lives. Several other theorists also viewed narrative as an important component for constructing meaning from experience, which constitutes a vital component of transformational learning. Miller (2000) elaborated on how autobiographical narratives contribute to perspective change. Brookfield (1987), Cranton (1996), Dirkx (1997), Kerka (1997), and Norman (2000) have all described how imagination, cultivated through narrative and the arts, can provide opportunities for changes in individuals’ perspectives. From a musical perspective Elliot
(1994, 1995) contributed to this theme, as well as those previously mentioned, by commenting on how music reinforces self-growth and self-knowledge. Carter (1994) described how music and song contributes to social transformation by citing specific examples of how it has been used in the past at Highlander Folk School. Chase (2002) also provided examples of music and song as tools to promote self-examination and the reconstruction of personal ways of thinking and the assumptions made by individuals.

The seventh theme that was discovered explored how can song exhibit a spiritual or transcendental nature. Brooks & Clark (2001) contribute to this theme just as they have to the previous themes. In their paper they theorise that in addition to transformative learning narrative has enormous potential for understanding the affective, spiritual, and somatic dimensions as well. Several authorities, including Dirkx (2001), English (1999), Griffin (2001), Lerner (2001), and Tisdell (2001), have studied the role of spirituality in adult learning. Each one of these authorities has contributed to understanding of the spiritual and transcendental nature of learning. From a musical perspective Csikszentmihalyi (1997) described the transcendent dimensions of music and song, and Hodges & Haack (1996) have argued that music represents a knowledge system that embraces all eight themes disclosed in this thesis.

The final theme discovered dealt with the ability of song to overcome distance. As stated in the introduction to this chapter, little has been written that connects popular narrative song to the field of distance education. What is provided here is the foundation literature associated with distance learning that will be explained in more detail in the final chapter of this thesis. Nania (1999) has compiled an annotated bibliography of research on distance education that served as a foundation for further research for this thesis. Kerka
(1996), Rowntree (1994), and Verduin & Clark (1991) provided a useful overview of effective distance education practices. Garrison (2000) has discussed how the focus in the study of distance education has recently shifted to educational research associated with teaching-learning transactions, and Collins (1998) contributed a useful link for understanding the relationship between adult education and distance education. Blum (1999) has examined the results of numerous literature searches associated with distance education, in an effort to discover learning theories and practices that support both male and female adult learners. Finally, Kirkwood (1998) described the importance of selecting a medium for a particular learning situation because no other can achieve the learning outcomes desired.

**Adult and Distance Learning Theories**

The final portion of this literature review focuses on research and theory, as well as accounts of practice in the fields of distance and adult education. Descriptive pieces were included as well as those where the authors took an analytic or evaluative approach, and where the content was considered to be of particular interest to the focus of this study. Raiskums’ (2001) guide was conceived and developed to be a handy, specialised tool for North Americans entering adult education graduate programs. It has been compiled in order to provide a shared basis for communicating adult education concepts, and has supplied many of the definitions connected to adult education that have been used in this thesis. The *Theory Into Practice (TIP)* database (Kearsley, 2001) contains descriptions of 50 theories relevant to human learning and instruction. Each description includes an overview, scope and application, example, principles, and references. The purpose of the database was to identify theory relevant to particular instructional settings. The *TIP* database provided the foundation
for most of the learning theories described Chapter V of this thesis. In addition, several
textbooks that focus on adult learning supplemented this database. Merriam (1993) and
Mackeracher (1996) both provided a collection of articles examining the major perspectives
and theories on learning in adulthood. MacKeracher (1996) described characteristics of adult
learners which affect learning, examined models for matching learner characteristics to
facilitating activities, and explained the emotional, cognitive, social, physical, and spiritual
aspects of adult learning. Barer-Stein & Draper (2001) provided an update of current theory,
practice and research related to adult learning. These primary texts provided a gateway to
other literature cited in the text of this thesis. Finally, Clover, Follen & Hall (2000) in their
work on environmental adult education brought together a wide range of learning theory that
was also combined with strategies and practices to assist those working with adults and
young people. Their work provided a different perspective on adult learning theory, which
has drawn on the “methodologies, methods, theories, and principles of adult, popular,
feminist, indigenous and environmental education” (p. 5). Additional information regarding
each learning theory was obtained by using the theory name or the name of the proponent of
the theory to search the ERIC database, online periodical and journal databases such as
EBSCOhost and the World Wide Web.

Summary

As seen in the literature, researchers and theorists in an array of disciplines have
commented on the social and educational impact of song. As well, educators have presented
many theories on how adults learn. This study will attempt to explore whether song and
distance adult learning can intersect in some meaningful way. One of the difficulties
encountered in conducting the review of literature for this thesis was that several of the works cited crossed thematic boundaries, and were related to more than one of the themes that were disclosed as the study progressed, facts which caused a degree of unavoidable repetition in this chapter. The next chapter will explain in detail the specific research methodologies used for this thesis.
CHAPTER III
THE RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

“A whole repertoire of techniques has evolved to meet the aspiration of research to be a way of bringing what is hidden into the open, to articulate and develop intuitive hunches” (Swanick, 1994, p. 71).

This qualitative study will explore the stories, experiences, ideas, and thoughts of musicians, songwriters, and others knowledgeable about songs. McIssac & Gunawardena (1996) explain that interdisciplinary exploratory research contributes to field of distance education as a “result of interest in an education application from other related disciplines.” Face-to-face interviews elicited stories and experiences from the participants/informants. As well, other pertinent documents and artifacts were used to contribute to the database for this study as it evolved.

Characteristics of Qualitative Research

Qualitative research has been selected as the most appropriate methodology due to the exploratory nature of this study. Research, whether qualitative or quantitative, is a systematic investigation of an issue or problem (Colwell, 1998). As mentioned previously, qualitative research is ideal for a program or a set of procedures for designing, conducting, and reporting about research phenomena that are patently complex and about which little is known with certainty (Bogdan & Biklen, 1992; Cresswell, 1994; Lancy, 1993). Education in general and distance education in particular provide a rich source of complex phenomena, events, institutions, problems, persons, and processes that constitute the raw materials for inquiry of many kinds (Cresswell, 1994; Shulman, 1997).
First, qualitative studies tend to be field focused. Qualitative researchers observe, interview, record, describe, and interpret settings as they are (Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Marshall, 1996; Robson, 1993). This study focuses on the characteristics of popular narrative song, the various learning theories that relate to the field of distance adult education, and the connection between the two.

A second feature of qualitative studies relates to the self as an instrument. The self is the instrument that engages the situation and makes sense of it (Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Marshall, 1996; Robson, 1993). In this study the researcher contributes personal insight as a source of meaning, and provides evidence and reasons for interpretations reached, in attempting to understand how popular narrative song might be used as a learning tool or vehicle in distance adult education.

A third characteristic that makes a study qualitative is its interpretative nature (Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Marshall, 1996; Robson, 1993). In this study the researcher accounts for what has been described with the expectation that interpretation may therefore contribute to the creation of new theory or practice.

A fourth feature that qualitative studies display is the use of expressive language and the presence of voice in text (Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Marshall, 1996; Robson, 1993). In this study expressive language and voice is evident in the form of quotations gleaned from the data collected during the study.

A fifth characteristic of qualitative studies is their attention to particulars. This is attained through the use of what Geertz (1973) describes as “thick description” to uncover the meaning of how popular narrative song may be used in an educational manner. The thick description in this study takes the form of both transcription data gathered from interviews,
as well as data retrieved from other literature, documents, and artifacts (Marshall, 1996). The role of thick description will be discussed in more detail in the data analysis component of this chapter.

A sixth feature of qualitative studies pertains to the criteria for judging their success, or validity. “Qualitative research becomes believable because of its coherence, insight, and instrumental utility” (Eisner, 1998, p. 39). In this study multiple forms of evidence will come from a wide range of sources, such as interviews with individuals who possess an intimate knowledge of popular song, published personal accounts, historical documents in the form of lyrics or written accounts, audio recordings, secondary sources, and other significant artifacts. Persuasion will be based on what Eisner (1998, p. 39) calls the cases’ “weight,” which refers to the coherence of the study and by the cogency of the interpretation. As a long-term outcome, the success of this study will be judged by those who will determine how practical and useful it is as a guide for distance education practitioners, and how beneficial it is as a learning device or vehicle for distance learners.

Eisner (1998) attests that the most important test of any qualitative study is its usefulness. He states that “the good guide deepens and broadens our experience and helps us understand what we are looking at” (p. 59). Can it help individuals understand a situation? Can it anticipate the future? Can it serve as a guide and call to the attention of distance educators aspects of their relationship with each other, their discipline, and their learners which have been previously missed? If this study can serve as a useful guide allowing distance educators to understand more than they have without the benefit of this guide, it will have achieved a level of success.
Eisner (1998) and Bresler (2001) contend that the qualities comprised by art inform and have the potential for revealing the social world. Therefore, I would argue that utilising qualitative inquiry is an appropriate method for this study.

As stated in Chapter Two of this paper, the role of music and song in distance education is one that has been largely ignored. A search of the literature revealed a scarcity of information on the subject. A query of Educational Resources Information Centre (ERIC) and the International Centre for Distance Learning, The Open University (ICDL revealed few distance education and music related document. None of the references examined the use of music or song as a learning tool or vehicle to enhance distance education. While research studies on the educational potential of song in distance learning environments were scarce, there were studies on the use of music and song in other educational situations. Since there has been little previous research or literature to guide the study, qualitative research serves as an appropriate methodology (Bogden & Biklen, 1992; Colewell, 1998; Cresswell, 1994; Geertz, 1993; Lancy, 1993; Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Marshall, 1996; Robson, 1993; Schwarzman, 1993; Shulman, 1997). In addition, adult educators place substantial emphasis on qualitative studies as compared to experimental designs (Brookfield, 1995). Educational Criticism methodology (Barone & Eisner, 1997; Eisner, 1998) will provide the primary theoretical framework for the study.

The Tenets of Educational Criticism

As with other modes of qualitative research, artistic modes of inquiry are useful for exploratory research and for generating observations and hypotheses in areas where little prior investigation has occurred (Barone & Eisner, 1997). Eisner (1998) explains that the
Educational Critic perceives and appreciates the important qualities of educational artifacts, materials, and events, and discloses them through the evocative and expressive language of an art critic. These critics aim to re-educate readers’ perception of educational phenomena. Their role is to help others see and understand. They “have the formidable task of making sense of some of the most complicated and subtle works that humans have created—works of art” (Eisner, 1998, p. 3).

Eisner (1998) has identified and discussed four important dimensions in the structure of Educational Criticism that serve to re-educate readers’ perceptions of educational matters. These dimensions are *description*, *interpretation*, *evaluation*, and *thematics*. In describing this inquiry method he describes how these elements are interwoven throughout a criticism, with description preceding interpretation and then giving way again to description, which flows into evaluation and back to interpretation, and so on. The dimensions are not totally independent of each other. He asserts that because “language is involved, for example, pure, evaluation-free descriptions or interpretations are impossibilities. Still, naming and describing these dimensions can offer insight into the complex structure of the educational critique” (Barone & Eisner, 1997). This methodology provides an appropriate and convenient approach to meet the convergence of the wide range of music-related disciplines and the field of distance adult learning.

**Description**

Eisner (1998, 1991) has identified four dimensions that provide the framework for Educational Criticism. The first being description, is one of the most arts-related.

“Descriptions help readers to visualise what educational phenomena are like. To grant
readers access to these phenomena, critics describe in language that is ‘literary’; that is, it is expressive and vernacular. This use of language provides access to a virtual reality and promotes vicarious participation in (i.e., empathetic understanding of) a previously alien form of life” (Barone & Eisner 1997, pp. 80-81).

In order to assist readers to visualise the phenomenon of popular narrative song, this study will rely on “thick description.” Geertz (1973) and Eisner (1998) describe thick description as an effort aimed at interpretation, at getting below the surface of the most puzzling aspect of the human condition, the construction of meaning. In order to achieve a thick description this study will rely primarily on transcribed interviews, but will also examine data from other sources. Data will include, but will not be limited to, primary and secondary sources, recordings, lyrics, other relevant artifacts, published personal accounts, as well as interview conversations. It will include an examination of historical, philosophical, and sociological writings relating to popular song. Eisner (1998) states that “whatever is relevant for seeing more accurately and understanding more deeply is fair game” (p. 82). He adds that in Educational Criticism the array of events and artifacts that can be used as a source of data is limited only by the researcher’s insight. What is deemed relevant depends on the connections the researcher is able to construct and make meaningful.

Interpretation

The second dimension of Educational Criticism is interpretation. It performs a different service from that performed by description. In this dimension interpretative text explains meaning. The purpose of interpretation is to make obvious the importance of events and situations. The interpretative dimension moves the researcher beyond the realm of a
literary writer to the realm of discursive critic (Barone & Eisner, 1997). “For Eisner (1991), interpretations can involve the use of theories – even social science theories – that put particular qualities into meaningful contexts. The purpose of employing theory in Educational Criticism, however, is not to predict or control events. It is rather to edify – identify the factors that bear upon a particular educational practice, and to shed light on potential consequences of that practice” (Barone & Eisner, 1997, p.81).

One of the challenges in this study is to combine description that is engrossing and convincing with analysis that goes to the heart of the phenomenon. The analytical procedures must be made sufficiently clear so that the reader can follow the steps from evidence to conclusion (Coats, 1989, Lancy, 1993, Wolcott, 1990). Through the application of Grounded Theory (Strauss & Corbin, 1990) this study will identify and draw out common themes, and/or qualities related to popular narrative song (Eisner, 1998). Transcripts of audio-taped interviews will be read and re-read multiple times in an effort to identify quotes that seem important. These in turn will be sorted into groups of similar quotes in an effort to discover common qualities or themes. As well, ATLAS/ti (2000) workbench computer software, designed for qualitative analysis of large bodies of textual and audio data, will be employed to identify common characteristics and themes.

Evaluation

Barone and Eisner (1997) explain that “the third structural element of Educational Criticism is evaluation, the making of explicit assessments of the goodness of the educational events and situations described and interpreted” (p. 81). A critic, therefore, renders judgements – not opinions – about the quality of phenomena under investigation. Barone and
Eisner (1997) contend that “a judgement differs from an opinion in that the latter is a bald, terse, and often uninteresting, statement of personal taste, but the former is suspended within an elaboration of reasons for the critic’s conclusions about matters at hand” (p. 81). The evaluation process for this study will include an appraisal of the educational potential of popular narrative song interpreted in the context of adult learning theories employed by distance educators.

**Thematics**

The final dimension in Educational Criticism is one that is common to all literary writings. It is the dimension of thematics (Eisner, 1998). In this phase the critic will develop a work around a particular controlling insight or issue. Specifics that address the central issues related to the connection between popular narrative song and distance adult learning will be folded into the text. The themes will provide coherence and unity in the study. Any insights will be critically analysed, explained, and recommendations will be made. The themes discerned will also contribute to the process of generalising this work of educational criticism. The themes will provide a summary of the essential features of this study and they may also provide clues to the perceptions of other in similar situations.

Eisner (1998) does caution, however, that generalisations in education need to be treated as tentative guides rather than a prescription to follow. He states that “it all depends” is probably the most useful qualifier to attach to questions about the effectiveness of particular educational methods.

Grounded Theory methodology (Dick, 2000; Glaser & Strauss, 1967; Strauss & Corbin, 1990) will guide the research process and subsequent data analysis to help identify
major themes, issues, and patterns within and among participants’ experiences, stories, thoughts, and ideas, as well as providing a method of assembling and analysing the interview data. In order to reduce inappropriate certainty and permit triangulation, a combination of these methods (Robson, 1993) will be used to explore and discover if there are themes, qualities, or characteristics that can be cross-referenced or connected to various theories of adult distance learning.

**The Tenets of Grounded Theory**

This study will use the Grounded Theory methodology to guide the research process and data analysis to enable the identification of major themes, characteristics, issues, and patterns within and among participants interview stories. The phrase “Grounded Theory” refers to theory that is developed inductively from a large body of data (Strauss & Corbin, 1990), in this case, interview transcripts. It is termed Grounded Theory because of the emphasis on the generation of theory and the data upon which that theory is based. In other words, theory is grounded in the data. Grounded Theory begins with a research situation. In this study, the research situations consist of the interviews conducted to gain an understanding of the characteristics of popular narrative song. The two main characteristics of Grounded Theory design are the constant comparison of data with emerging categories, characteristics, or themes, and theoretical sampling of different groups to maximise the similarities and differences of information (Cresswell, 1994; Dick, 2000; Glaser & Strauss, 1967; Strauss, 1984; Strauss & Corbin, 1990).

The Grounded Theory approach begins with reading (and rereading) a textual database (in this case interview transcriptions). During these readings the researcher looks for
concepts, in one form or another, by continually asking questions such as “what does this mean?”, “what is this about?”, or “what is being referred to here?” (Glaser & Strauss, 1967; Strauss & Corbin, 1990). These concepts may consist of any idea, thing, person, event, activity, or relation that can be conceptualised for the purpose of the research study (Glaser, 1984). These concepts (known as codes) are sorted and resorted in an effort to find patterns (Corbin & Strauss, 1990). Eventually, when certain codes begin to emerge repeatedly they are grouped into categories (Strauss & Corbin, 1990). Dick (2000) describes a category as a theme or variable that makes sense of what your informant has said. A category is interpreted in the light of the interview being studied, and later in relation to the other interviews. During this process the researcher continually makes memos for future reference which consist of a brief report on the research concept, its implications, further questions, hypothesis, etc. The next step is to then compare one set of data (or interview) to another set of data (or interview). Again the search for codes will take place which will be compared to the previous and succeeding interviews. This process of the analysis concerned with identifying, naming, categorising, and describing phenomena found in the data is classified as coding (Glasser & Strauss, 1967; Strauss & Corbin, 1990). Once similar categories are uncovered they are grouped together to eventually become the basis for themes. Eventually this process enables theory to emerge in the form of specific themes. The specific steps followed in analysing the data collected from interviews and other data for this study will be outlined in more detail in the data analysis portion of the study.
Collection Strategies

Since the interview is such a powerful resource for learning how people perceive their experience, and given the exploratory nature of this study, it will be the primary method for collecting data for theory development in this study (Eisner, 1998). Both Robson (1993) and Eisner (1998) contend that the interview is a flexible and adaptable way of finding things out. Interviews are also valuable in that they can capture the experience of other individuals as well as the meanings and values they construct (Bresler, 2001; Seidman, 1991). However, as Eisner (1998) asserts, other related data may also be useful and may be included in any study using Educational Criticism methodology. He argues that “the use of multiple forms of data tends to provide the material that contributes to credible interpretation” (p. 185). Mauch & Birch (1998) support this view and maintain that the purpose of any data-recording instrument should be to help produce or gather data to answer questions raised in the problem statement. Others contend that in order to make sense of a situation anything that allows us to deepen our understanding by using multiple data sources is useful (Cresswell, 1994; Corbin & Glaser, 1990; Eisner, 1998; Lincoln & Guba 1985; Marshall, 1996). In short, “whatever is relevant for seeing more acutely and understanding more deeply is fair game” (Eisner, 1998, pp 81-82). It should be noted, however, that the other data sources utilised in this study were not investigated until the interview process had been completed.

Population Sample

Since those who know the tradition of song, understand the history, are familiar with the genres, and can see what settings and practices consist of, they are most likely to have something useful and informed to say (Eisner, 1998). A list of potential
participants/informants was compiled from information gathered from a wide range of sources (Angelillo, July-August, 2002; Connolly, 1998). These sources included music directories, media sources, local entertainment and daily newspapers, web sites, music festival rosters, telephone directories, and word-of-mouth. Informants were personally selected through a process of purposeful convenience sampling (Seidman, 1991). Participant recruitment for the study was based on the following criteria:

- Those individuals who have experience in the use of popular song either as a musician, songwriter, performer, music critic, or music programmer
- Those individuals who voluntarily agree to an audio-taped face-to-face interview.
- Both genders
- Those individuals located in the Greater Victoria, Vancouver Island, or Lower Mainland regions of British Columbia.
- A minimum of six individuals from the informant pool were asked to participate in the interview process.

As soon as approval was received from the Athabasca University Research Ethics Board potential informants were contacted by email. The initial batch of email was sent in early April 2002 to potential informants who resided in the prescribed geographic area. A second batch of email was sent out in May 2002 to musicians who would be attending the Rootsfest Music Festival in Victoria, between August 15 and 17, 2002. A third batch of email was sent to potential informants who would be performing at Victoria Folkfest from July 1st through 8th. Once individuals agreed to participate, additional correspondence took place via email and telephone in order to confirm and set up a schedule to conduct the interview. Two individuals were contacted to participate in the pilot for this study. The transcripts of these
interviews were not used or included in this study. Over a two-month period of time 45 individuals were contacted requesting an interview; of those contacted, 12 did not reply, 7 respectfully declined, and 8 agreed to participate but were unable to due to scheduling difficulties. The remaining 18 individuals formed the basis of the study.

As I have explained, the list of potential participants was expanded twice. This was done to compensate for those who chose not to, or who were unable to participate in the study. The selection of the additional informants was based on the same criteria as those who were part of the initial pool. This was done in order to reduce any negative impact of non-participation on the study and keep the pool of informants consistent. Based on this procedure I did perceive that non-participation had a negative impact on this study.

Over the period of time when informants were being interviewed, a fourth list of potential informants was compiled on an ongoing basis in the event that additional individuals would be needed for the study. Often additional participants may be added to a study as new dimensions are revealed through the initial interviews (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). However this supplementary list was never used since it was determined at the end of August 2002 that saturation of information had been achieved. Several scholars (Douglas, 1976; Glaser & Strauss, 1967; Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Siedman, 1991) describe saturation of information as being that point where the researcher begins to hear the same information being reported. In other words, the point at which the interviewer recognises that nothing decidedly new is being learned is the time when “enough” participants will have been interviewed; hence, the saturation point (Seidman, 1991).

The meaning of any kind of art is inseparable from the context or conditions under which it is generated and experienced. Context is defined as the whole situation, background
or environment relevant to some happening (Bresler, 2001; Crafts, Cavicchi, & Keil, 1993). Context is central to the understanding of arts education and therefore demands a more detailed examination of the informant pool created for this study.

Most of the participants were singers and instrumentalists as well as songwriters, while a few participants focused solely on writing or solely on performing. The instruments played by participants included piano, guitar, dobro, lute, mandolin, Irish harp, dulcimer, violin, bass guitar, and a variety of percussion instruments. Some informants were multi-instrumentalists. The informants selected for this study represent a wide range of musical styles or genres (distinct form of expression) including: country, rock, Conjunto, alternative country, classical, pop, blues, reggae, bluegrass, folk, choral, Chimurenga, electric mbira music, Celtic, Klezmer, punk, childrens’ music, and musical theatre.

As well as being musicians and/or lyricists a number of informants were also poets, actors, script-writers, television musical theme composers, television producers, recording producers, and theatrical producers. Some were administrator’s in music organisations, and others radio and television program hosts. The informant pool included a member of the Order of Canada, a number of JUNO Award winners and nominees, Pacific Music Industry Award winners, Prairie Music Award winners, Irish Song-Writer Award winners, and West Coast Music Award winners.

For convenience, the primary geographic location for the interviewing was Victoria, British Columbia. However, I also travelled to Protection Island (outside Naniamo), Cortes Island, Courtenay, Comox, and Vancouver, British Columbia, in order to meet with some participants. Interviews took place in cafes and restaurants, marine pubs, public parks, hotel rooms, backstage at music festivals, participant’s homes, and my home. Some interview sites
were quiet with little interruption, others were extremely busy and fraught with interruptions and external noise, making the audio-tape recording and transcribing of the interview quite challenging.

**Ethical Issues**

Informed consent should apply to any investigation involving human participation. This concept means that participants may exercise free power of choice without coercion, promise of future benefits, or other forms of influence (Robson, 1993; Mauch & Birch, 1998). Guidelines on the use of human subject in research from the “Tri-Council Statement: Ethical Conduct for Research Involving Humans” (1998) and the Athabasca University (2001) “Policy for Research Involving Humans” were reviewed for this study prior to application for approval from the REB. In addition, the research projected by this study does not violate human rights or animal care obligations. Ethical approval of this study was granted by the *Athabasca University Research Ethics Board (REB)* on March 25, 2002. Having received approval for the study, recruitment of informants was initiated. All participants were informed as to the nature of the research being conducted prior to their consent to participate in the study. Permission to audio-tape record the conversations was requested and all subjects were informed in advance when such an audio-tape was to be recorded. As well, participants were required to sign an approved informed consent form prior to the interview. The researcher retained a signed copy, and another copy was given to the informant.
Finally, there are no actual, apparent, or potential conflicts related to this study, as there are no power relationships between any of the interview participants and the principal researcher. In addition, the researcher and the Research Validation Team are peer colleagues.

**Interview Process**

Cresswell (1994) and Eisner (1998) remind us that qualitative research can often take weeks, months, or even years to conduct and that it is not possible to predict the flow of events as they unfold. I had hoped to have the interview process completed within two months. However, that was not the case.

Once approval was granted the interview process began. Interviews were initiated in May 2002, and were completed at the end of August that year. Scheduling interviews for this study was a challenging and complex procedure as the participants in this study are busy individuals with many commitments, and windows of opportunity for conducting interviews were at times restricted due to performance schedules. As well, gaining access to some individuals took additional time.

In the initial email contact each informant was asked to participate in an hour-long, in-depth, semi-structured, open-ended interview that would be audio-tape recorded and later transcribed.

After participants responded to my email request for participation, additional communication took place via email or telephone in order to set up an appointment and arrange a convenient time and place to conduct the interview. This pre-interview contact also provided an opportunity to further explain the purposes of the inquiry, how the informants could contribute, the length and kind of interview, and the outcome proposed. As well, other
questions and concerns raised by participants were addressed at this point. This pre-interview contact was also used to make sure the participant felt comfortable and secure (Seidman, 1991). Reassurances about confidentiality and anonymity were given on several occasions (Powney & Watts, 1987). A follow-up email was sent to each participant prior to the interview date.

Before proceeding with each interview, I checked that the informant was still willing to participate and briefly shared some of my own background. I again asked each participant if they had any additional questions prior to the interview. Each interview took approximately one hour. The primary objective of the interview process was to gain knowledge (data) from the participants’ experience (Mauch & Birch, 1998).

In a semi-structured interview the interviewer has worked out a set of questions in advance, but is free to modify their order, change the way they are worded, give explanations, leave out particular questions, and include additional ones (Robson, 1993). This method was selected as it provided considerable flexibility, but also allowed the conversation to be somewhat focused on the issues of the study (Powney & Watts, 1987; Boeree, 1998). Interviews can be a sensitive form of verbal inquiry, a technique that is able to take the researcher deep into the thinking of other people. They can also capture the meanings and values that participants construct (Bresler, 2001). Such semi-structured conversations were helpful in understanding how people interpret music even at the risk of having data that spreads becoming more difficult to interpret (Swanwick, 1994).

An interview protocol was employed to provide a focus for every interview in the series. The interview schedule included the following (Robson, 1993):

- Introductory comments
A list of topic headings and key questions to ask under these headings
Set of associated prompts
Transition messages for the interviewer
Closing comments

The interview schedule was revised as the interview process progressed, with the addition of one question. This addition became the final question of the interview guide (Appendix 1). Seidman (1991) states that minor revisions may occur since there may be some issues that are perhaps not relevant until new and important concepts emerge.

I considered it a privilege and honour to interview these individuals, and as a result made every attempt to maintain a level of integrity in the process. I was a stranger to all but one of the participants. Since the interviews took place in casual settings I presented myself casually in an effort to put each participant at ease. However, there were many instances were the informant was more at ease than I was, as they were seasoned subjects and being in the entertainment business had experienced many interviews. I made every effort to be visible as a person in addition to functioning as an interviewer. I made certain that they knew they had the power to terminate, interrupt, or give feedback to any aspect of the interview that was not to their liking. I tried to aim my questions in such a way that they would provide vital and valuable answers that would reveal the nature of popular song and provoke thought.

Notes were taken during the interview to help me remember new facts, clarify questions, retrieve missing words, or note recurring terms (Koenig, 1989). Once the interview was terminated additional ideas or questions were noted. The notes were reviewed as soon as possible in order to retain the continuity and understanding of the interview. Biographical details and notes and any information which had direct relevance to the
research study were noted immediately after the interview and recorded on the participant information form.

Dates and names, or interview codes were written on tapes, tape boxes, and interview schedules before the interview took place (Powney & Watts, 1987). I personally transcribed all audio-tapes in an effort to get a feeling or essence of each interview. I hoped to get a wide-angle picture of what was being said by each informant prior to the analysis of the transcripts.

Prior to the analysis stage of this study, transcriptions were returned to each participant in September 2002, which enabled them to review the data collected from the interview and make any changes that they felt important.

Pilot Study

Pilot studies or interviews provide researchers with an opportunity to try out their interviewing design with a small number of participants. By running a few pilot interviews the researcher has the opportunity to identify potential biases and data collection problems. Pilot studies also give the interviewer a chance to clarify and modify sequencing and interviewing practices before the investigation proper begins (Powney & Watts, 1987; Robson, 1993; Seidman, 1991). A pilot study with two individuals was set up to serve three major functions.

- A check that the structure or organisation of the interview meets the requirements of this study;
- A practical test of the logistics of the interview process, including the choice and wording of the interview questions and the time required to complete them for the intended use of the interview;
- An opportunity to practice the social interactive skills necessary for the interview process.

As a result of the pilot study two changes were made to the interview process. First, each informant was provided with a copy of the interview schedule prior to the interview. This allowed each informant to have some time to reflect on each question prior to the interview. However, when the time came for the interview some informants preferred to have the interview questions at their disposal while others preferred to participate in the interview without prior knowledge of the questions. I felt that it was important to provide this option for the participants.

The second change was to add one more question to the interview schedule that might provide some further insight into the nature of popular narrative song.

Two volunteers were asked to pilot the research instrument and analysis method. These interviews were not included in the study. The pilot studies were successful in that they allowed me to check the structure or organisation of the interview, and that the interview schedule met the requirements of this study. In addition the pilots allowed me to practically test the logistics of the interview process, and provided me with an opportunity to practice the interactive skills necessary for the interview process.
Research Validation Team

Two music educators/musicians working with the Greater Victoria School Board were purposefully selected and recruited to form a research validation team, to assist me in reviewing the data collected from the interviews, and in interpreting the data. The purpose of the research validation team was to act as a sounding board to verify my interpretation and analysis of the data collected (Corbin & Strauss, 1990). In addition, the validation team insured credibility through the identification of any biases in my interpretations. The expectation was that the use of the validation team would help provide validity for this study and provides new insights (Corbin & Strauss, 1990).

Both team members were selected based on the following criteria:

- Had direct familiarity with popular narrative song,
- Was a music educator with a Masters degree and had worked with students, from elementary school students to adults,
- Was a practising professional musician and had worked with a wide range of musical genres and styles in a variety of locations,
- Had experience and an interest in a wide range of musical styles and genres,
- Had expressed an interest, willingness, and ability to participate in the study,
- Was easily accessible to the principal researcher and was conveniently located in Victoria, British Columbia.

Research Validation Team Members:

- One member has taught students at the elementary, secondary and adult level in Ontario, the Yukon, and British Columbia. He has also performed as a professional musician in
Canada and Mexico and has backed-up many well-known West Coast musicians.

Presently he is the music director of a secondary school band program in Victoria, BC.

- The other member is the music director of at a middle school band program in Victoria, BC. He has taught students at the elementary, secondary and post-secondary level. He has also been a sessional instructor in Music Education at the University of Victoria where he has conducted a music education seminar studying programs and materials for secondary schools with an emphasis on general music. He has also been a recipient of the 1999-2000 *Prime Minister’s Award for Teaching Excellence, Certificate of Achievement*. In addition, he is also a practising professional musician.

**Trustworthiness**

One of the critical goals of qualitative research is to establish trustworthiness (Turner, 2001). A number of researchers (Cresswell, 1994; Easton, McCormish & Greenberg, 2000; Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Seidman, 1991) maintain that while qualitative methods yield rich data, researchers are responsible for establishing trustworthiness of the findings in a variety of ways. Chenail (1994, 1995) explains that trust between the researcher and the reader comes down to a spirit of openness that the researcher builds in that interaction. He states that this is best accomplished by giving as much detail of the design and process as possible, then following the plan while clearly communicating each step taken during the study. This includes explaining what choices were made along the way and what might have been considered but was not done. If any adjustments needed to be made, Chenail recommends that researchers describe such changes in detail and follow through with a new plan. Glaser & Strauss (1967) emphasise that there should be no part of the interview process where it is
uncertain what has been done. The following procedures were undertaken in this study to ensure trustworthiness.

The first technique used was peer debriefing. Peer debriefing is a technique of including others in the research process. These others may include participants and colleagues who comment on and read the research in order to assist the researcher in recognising any biases in interpretations (Chenail, 1995; Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Turner, 2001). Peer debriefing has been used in this study to provide an objective look at the feasibility of the methodology. Eisner (1998) names this process “consensual validation” (p. 112), which is agreement, among others, that the description, interpretation, evaluation, and thematics of a study are right. For this study the Research Validation Team will play the peer-debriefing role thus contributing to the openness and trustworthiness of the study.

The second technique used to achieve openness and credibility is called member checking (Burke, 1997; Cresswell, 1994; Lincoln and Guba, 1985). This technique involves allowing the participants to review the data that has been collected. In this case, copies of each interview transcript were given to each participant for checking in order to promote trustworthiness and openness of the interview process. Prior to data analysis each participant was asked to review transcripts and make any changes that they felt would be important prior to data analysis.

The third technique included the use of multiple interviews as a form of triangulation, since eighteen participants provided that data that contributed to the formulation of categories or themes (Burke, 1997; Cresswell, 1994; Robson, 1993). Triangulation, or structural corroboration as the process is called by Eisner (1998), is a means through which multiple types of data are related to each other to support or contradict the interpretation and
evaluation of the research being conducted. Collecting data at different times, at different places, and with different people also contributed to triangulation (Burke, 1997).

An additional effort to achieve triangulation or structural corroboration was attempted through convergence among sources of information. This consisted of including data from other sources in addition to that collected from interviews.

Based on recommendations by Chenail (1995) and Eisner (1998) as much of the data collected as was physically possible has been presented in this thesis, allowing readers to see the breadth and depth of the qualitative data. The inclusion of verbatim interview quotations provides additional information about the participants’ interpretations and personal meanings (Burke, 1997).

Typically it is not possible in qualitative research to suggest external validity or generalizability (Burke, 1997; Cresswell, 1994; Lincoln & Guba, 1985), due to that fact that people and settings examined in qualitative research are rarely randomly selected. Such is the case in this study. However, Lincoln & Guba (1985) and Eisner (1998) explain that thick description improves the transferability of a study. That is, it enables “someone interested in making a transfer to reach a conclusion whether transfer can be contemplated as a possibility” (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 316). The following kinds of information have been included in this study in order to help readers know when they can generalise: “the number and kinds of people in the study, how they were selected to be in the study, contextual information, the nature of the researcher’s relationship with the participants, information about the informants who provided information, the methods of data collection used, and the data analysis techniques used” (Burke, 1997, p. 291). Eisner (1998) names this process referential adequacy. He states that “an Educational Criticism is referentially adequate when
readers are able to see what they would have missed without the researcher’s observations” (pp. 113-114).

Ultimately, the generalizability or transferability of this study will be determined by whether or not the ideas presented have a life beyond this study (Chenail, 1994; Eisner, 1991, 1998). Will people talk about the results? Will the study ever be cited again? Will the study excite other researchers to do new studies? Will the ideas live on for the researcher? Will the work be viewed as inspirational? Will the study become a basis for use by distance educators, practitioners or administrators?

**Data Analysis**

Part of the creative process in analysis is to impose a structure on the accumulated data that is consistent or compatible with the general underlying philosophy or method of the research (Powney & Watts, 1987). A major component of this process is following systematic procedures in order to identify essential features and relationships (Wolcott, 1994). Choosing the technique for data analysis “depends minimally on the kind and amount of text, the experience of the researcher, and the goals of the project” (Ryan & Bernard, 2001, p. 9). In this study data analysis was based primarily on the text data in the form transcripts of the interviews where the informants described their experience, ideas, and thoughts related to popular narrative song and distance adult learning. As well, the analysis in this study focuses on the research questions previously identified in this study. Thick description or the interpretation of both transcription data gathered from interviews and data gathered from other literature will provide the data foundation for this study. Thick description is an attempt to illuminate, interpret, and explain the experience being described
by those who have experienced it (Cresswell, 1994; Eisner, 1998; Geertz, 1973, Marshall, 1996). In this case, interpretation will take the reader into the hearts and minds of those describing the characteristics of popular song and learning. The following approach was adopted and implemented in order to identify “essential features and relationships” (Wolcott, 1994, p. 24), and impose a structure on the accumulated data (Cresswell, 1994; Glaser, 1978; Powney & Watts, 1987; Robson, 1993; Strauss, 1987) to assure the analysis would make sense to the reader.

1. Interviews were personally conducted, and audio-taped on two recorders to avoid problems with equipment failure (Easton, McComb, Fry & Greenberg, 2000). Brief contextual notes were made during and after the interview.

2. Shortly after each interview the taped conversations were transcribed into a word-processing program. This method required concentrated and repeated listening in order to clearly and accurately understand what was being said in each conversation. Repeated listening allowed me to get a better sense of the context of what was being said by each informant.

3. Interview transcriptions were emailed to informants for member checking in an effort to achieve accuracy and increase the dependability of the findings. Corrections were made and any omissions were added.

4. The transcripts were then printed and filed by informant’s name.

5. A proper analysis of each transcript began in late November 2002, after each participant had communicated his or her revision or approval of the transcript.

6. Each transcript was then read and re-read multiple times while highlighting words with a coloured marker an effort to search for codes. Simultaneously memos were
made in the margin of each transcript in an effort to note recurring codes and potential categories or themes. Ryan & Bernard (2001) claim that in the early stages of theme exploration, nothing beats a thorough reading and pawing through of the data. They claim that this is the easiest method for the novice researcher to master and is particularly good for identifying major themes.

7. After reading and highlighting the text in an attempt to identify quotes that seem important, they were cut out with notes in the margin and were then sorted into piles of similar quotes (Richards & Richard, 1994; Ryan & Bernard, 2001; Turner). Each pile was then named. These piles then began to form themes. Cutting and sorting is a more formal way of pawing as it is particularly useful for identifying sub-themes (Ryan & Bernard, 2001).

8. After the first copy of transcripts was cut up a second copy was printed and searched for themes that were more subtle or that didn’t get expressed in the language of the text (Ryan & Bernard, 2001. This was a more time intensive analysis that required me to go through the text line-by-line asking myself what each statement was about and how it differed from the previous or following statements.

9. Next, I placed all of the transcripts into one word processing document and ran the document through a text-search program (Turner, 2001). The ATLAS/ti (2000) workbench computer software designed for qualitative analysis of large bodies of textual, graphical and audio data was used. This program allows a researcher to segment data files, code text, and write memos. The program also allows the researcher to retrieve all text selections and notes relevant to the
researcher (Patteson, Smithrim, & Upitis, 2002b). “The principal advantage of using a program is that it simplifies and speeds the mechanical aspects of data analysis without sacrificing flexibility” (Pandit, 1996, p. 9). ATLAS/ti (2000) also allows the researcher to visually connect selected passages, memos, and codes that visually display the relationships of concepts and theories. This program was used to re-search the combined transcripts for codes related to the themes already identified by the manual search which had previously been conducted. This was done in an effort to uncover any codes and relationships which were missed during the first two attempts to analyse the data. Another benefit of using the Atlas program is that it allowed the data analysis to be more thorough and efficient (Pandit, 1996).

10. Next, I returned to the literature related to adult learning that I had consulted as part of writing the proposal for this study (Ryan & Bernard, 2001). This was done in order to see if there were characteristics and codes related to adult learning theory that could be fed into ATLAS/ti that would in turn identify themes which had not yet been uncovered (Patteson, Upitis, & Smithrim, 2002a). This was a top-down process that is not in keeping with strict Grounded Theory protocol. It was applied in order to ascertain if there were any additional characteristics relating to song and adult learning that I may have missed. Frankly, it did not uncover anything new.

11. The point at which no new themes are discovered is “theoretical saturation” (Glaser, 1984; Strauss & Corbin, 1990). When and how theoretical saturation occurs depends on the number of texts and their complexity (Ryan & Bernard,
2001). Theoretical saturation occurred when no new themes were discovered. It was time to return to the literature. The themes uncovered were then compared with the literature, other documents, and artifacts related to this study. I searched for connections between the two in order to provide an understanding of popular narrative song and adult learning theory.

In summary, the qualitative research methodology for this thesis consisted of using a framework provided through Educational Criticism, in combination with Grounded Theory methodology, to guide the research process and analysis, in an effort to identify major themes, qualities and characteristics derived from participants’ experiences, stories, thoughts, and ideas. This chapter has defined the population sample, described ethical issues, outlined the interview process, as well as providing an explanation of how the author has attempted to establish validity and trustworthiness for this study. Finally, the steps involved in data analysis have been explained.

In the next chapter, entitled description and interpretation, the results of the data analysis process, along with supporting examples and interpretation, will be provided.
“Words mean more than what is set down on paper. It takes the human voice to infuse them with deeper meaning.” (Maya Angelou)

As explained in the previous chapter, Educational Criticism methodology can be thought of as consisting of four components: description, interpretation, evaluation, and thematics. These four components do not prescribe a sequence among the parts of an Educational Criticism, nor are the four dimensions wholly independent of the others (Eisner, 1998). Keeping that in mind, this chapter will provide the combined description and interpretation of the data assembled for this study.

**Background of Informants**

Context related to the situation, background, or environment is central to the understanding of arts related research (Bresler, 2001; Crafts, Cavicchi, & Keil, 1993). In addition, creative work is grounded in personal experience. The summary presented here gives the reader a chance to gain a deeper understanding relative to the participants of this study. It also adds to the thick description employed to provide trustworthiness of the study findings (Chenail, 1995). The participant profiles and biographies that evolved from the study interviews revealed some significant commonalities.

When asked how they became involved with music, especially song, informants’ responses had a few variations but had many constants. The majority of the participants had some early experience either having studied music, had been engaged in some form of musical training or came from an environment surrounded by music and song.
• I come from a musical family. So we were brought up playing and singing together. But it was mostly classical music.

• My parents were professional folk singers. There was this constant steam of music in my family. That’s where I listened to the Weavers and all the political stuff and all the labour movement stuff.

• My earliest recollections of music, really, were lying in bed and hearing the Zulu drums and singing, and realising there was something mysterious and otherworldly happening that was so enchanting and was beyond the norm of my family life. I worked in a summer camp and we used to sing. I used to love sitting by the water singing camp songs.

• My first connection with music, apart from piano as a child, was first hearing songs on the radio and being struck by how intensely they made me feel when I was eleven. A lot of them exposed feelings that were very hard for me.

• It caught my attention as a child. My mother’s kitchen radio had Mexican music playing. Everything from regional Conjunto music to the beautiful tropical, romantic songs of Mexico they would play and American pop radio. You couldn’t help be around it. A.M. radio was so popular in the Sixties.

• I was a musician, say, from childhood. We would bring our drums from school. I was into music that way. I played a lot of other people’s music, copyright music, music by other big names. Music from South Africa, music from the Congo, music from all over Africa and music from America, music from England. I was into all of that music.
Both my parents were musical. I got a lot of influence from going to church and listening to the choir. I learned a lot of Beatles songs when I was younger and started writing songs in junior high school.

I come from a musical family. My mother is a chorale singer. My father is a music teacher. It was a natural thing. I realised at one point that I wanted to sing. So I started learning songs off the radio and off of records. As I got farther into that I realised that writing songs was what I really wanted to do.

I have been involved in music most of my life starting about when I was in grade four and even before then.

I have been playing almost all my life. I guess it started when I was about eight years old.

I started to play guitar with I was eight years old. I’ve got three older sisters, so there was a lot of music around the house when I was a kid. I started off playing in rock bands and blues bands and that kind of thing.

We took piano most of our lives. We started very young. When we were 14 or 15 we found a guitar and started fooling around with guitar.

My Dad is very musical. He plays violin. Austrian family, classical musicians, whatnot. I was forced to take classical piano lessons. I didn’t enjoy it much because it was forced. I am really grateful now of course.

I have always been involved with music as far back as I can remember. I can remember my mother and grandfather. When a piano came into the house, I taught myself how to play. When the Great Folk Scare hit in the early Sixties or
even in the late Fifties I listened to The Kingston Trio, The Limeliters, and Peter Paul and Mary.

Some individuals started to be involved in music and song later in life.

- In my early twenties I started out as a musician playing, mainly violin. I had taught myself guitar and flute. I was involved in playing in bands before I was a songwriter myself. It came out of a combination of being frustrated with singing other people’s words and not being completely comfortable with being the voice for someone else’s voice, an instinct that I had that this something I could do. It was 1977 when I wrote my first song. There was no question that this was what I was meant to do. I have never looked back.

- I didn’t come from a family that was fully immersed in music but my grandmother sang and my family always listened to a lot of music. I didn’t get into writing songs until after university. So I came to song-writing late. But I’ve always loved songs themselves.

Informants had this to say about the personal impact of music on themselves.

- Music has pulled me by the nose.

- Yet there is a sense of choicelessness about it.

- I got hooked into the sort of, mostly folkie, world music scene

- I started to spend hundreds of hours just entranced by music.

- Elvis did me in and then the Beatles did me in. That was it, I was off the launch pad.

- It was like a floodgate opening. I felt that all that was locked inside of me started to flood out.
• My own desire to express my own heart got clearer and I started writing the words as well.
• I am a wordsmith. I fell face-first into it.
• I was caught up in songs. It seemed like the natural thing to do.
• I would leave (the club) with this incredible feeling but I didn’t know what it was.

When asked why they became involved with performing and/or song-writing, again, there were many similarities in participants’ responses.

• As I said in the beginning there is a certain choicelessness about it, and I think that most writers and musicians will say that. That is a very compelling feeling. I look at it as being a complete gift. I am good at it and because it is so rewarding, in every sense of the word. There is something magical about, that I am still in awe.
• I was called to it. I didn’t choose music. Music chose me, and I just obeyed.
• I do it because I have to do it. It makes me feel connected to myself. It makes me feel grounded. I’m touched by music. I could not imagine not doing this.
• There must be an urge there so you express yourself. It is expression I really think.
• It’s been a huge emotional release for me. It’s just a real outlet.
• It’s the way I feel. I actually changed my bio to reflect this.
• Music made me feel something I couldn’t feel from anything else. I learned that I could actually do it myself and that was fun. It was a good discovery.
• It started as a passion and now it’s sort of the only thing to do really. Perhaps it’s a shallow personality disorder that needs constant affirmation (laughter). I just like the energy…It gives you lots of energy.

• I get up in the middle of the night and there it is. It is wonderful to have that intimate relationship with the unseen. It really is.

• I have started out as this kind of kid, this boy, and slowly but surely, everything that wasn’t about music fell away from me. So I was just standing there with just the music. A couple of times I think I even tried to try something else but it didn’t work at all. So everything fell away that wasn’t music to me. Therefore, I am (laughter).

• The idea that you could do that for a job. As hard as it is and as stressful, and it is emotionally draining. We are creating something that is universal.

• It never ceases to amaze me about how songs can affect people. For as long as I can remember I haven’t really had a choice doing what I do. I don’t think I could stop if I tried to.

• For me, it chose me and I chose it. I do it because I love it and I am good at it. There is nothing like hearing (informant name) sing a song we have worked on together. Seeing a song put together. It’s like a lump of coal to a burnished diamond by the time it’s recorded. It’s like being part of the earth.

• It’s a privilege.

• It feels real to me. It is what my passion is in life. I feel that what I do as a musician. I am having a positive affect on the world. So to me it is a very real and
personal contact with our world. More so than anything else that I am capable of doing, so that’s why I do it.

• Being a performer has taught me so much about being human and the relationships with humans. It is so powerful and it’s such a great tool for life that I would just never question that I am the luckiest person in the world to get to do what I do.

• I am an entertainer. That is what I do. I think that it is important to entertain people because they need entertainment in this world.

• Mostly it is about being together and having some kind of emotional experience. I think humans hunger for that.

• There is the more universal aspect of how the songs go out in the world and reach people, in this magical way. And they do have, to varying degrees, a transforming power. So along with that, comes a real responsibility, to do that, because it can affect change, however small a way. It can affect change.

Description & Interpretation

The methodology outlined in the previous chapter has laid the base for understanding what will be detailed in this chapter. Expressive and vernacular description will be provided to help readers visualise what the phenomenon of popular narrative song is like. Eisner (1998) maintains that if the purpose is to understand the significance of events, situations, or other phenomenon, sometimes description is what is wanted, but it is almost never adequate without interpretation. It is in the interpretative frame that educational critics must explain the meanings and account for what has been described (Eisner, 1998). For the purposes of
In this study, interpretation will involve drawing out and placing the characteristics or qualities of popular narrative song into meaningful categories and themes.

Eighteen instrumentalists, singers, and songwriters formed the basis of this study. These individuals represent a wide range of musical styles and genres. In addition, they have also been engaged in a wide range of other artistic and creative endeavours. The interviews conducted for this study generated 160 pages of verbatim transcript text. Over a four month period codes and the resulting memos discovered through manual analysis and Atlas/ti (Atlas/ti, 2000) computer analysis were painstakingly arranged and rearranged into categories and later merged into eight themes. One difficulty encountered was due to the way coded comments were expressed by the informants. Several of these comments fit into more than one category. Another problem encountered was that the boundaries defining categories and themes were often transparent. The categories and resulting themes are therefore fluid and frequently flow into one another. This is clearly evident where comments made by informants appear in more than one place in this study.

The themes that were revealed included the observations that song:

1. Is a means of communication
2. Reflects human experience
3. Fosters community
4. Embodies emotion
5. Stimulates cognition, enlightenment and learning
6. Facilitates transformation
7. Exhibits a transcendent or spiritual nature
8. Overcomes distance
With the exception of minor corrections and alterations, initiated for clarity in the member-checking step of data-analysis, descriptive excerpts taken from this data have been presented in the original form. In order to contribute to the anonymity of the informants no identifying signifiers have been used in this study. With respect to openness, as much data as physically possible has been presented to allow the reader to observe the conversations in their natural state and allow readers to continue the inquiry themselves (Chenail, 1995). Every effort has been made to make the data the main focus in this qualitative study and allow it to, “in all its richness, breadth and depth” (Chenail, 1995), tell the story. Presented here are the comments and observations merged into themes that capture the phenomenon of popular narrative song. Interpretive comments will follow the description for each one.

Theme 1: Song as a Means of Communication

The theme or quality relative to popular narrative song as a means of communication consists of three categories: music & lyrics, not preaching, and communication. A majority of the informants maintained that the communicative power of song resides in the combination of the lyrics as well the attributes of music. As well, several songwriters shared the view that preaching was not a suitable method of communicating their views, ideas, or thoughts. Informants were unanimous in their perspectives regarding the use popular song as a means of communication.

Category: Music and Lyrics

According to the informants interviewed for this study it is the combination of lyrics and music that provide songs with their communicative power. Lyrics are commonly
interpreted as the words of a song expressing the writer’s story. Lyrics are fit to be expressed in song, are meant to be sung, are song-like, and provide one of the channels of communication in songs (Barber, 1998; Rodale, 1986). The participants involved in this study spoke at length about the role of both lyrics and music:

- It’s all about lyrics for me.
- The words or the lyrics mean something to me. They tell a story or they are a protest song, or it is a meaningful ballad, or somebody’s personal experience. They are significant because I can relate to them or appreciate them or they make me cry, or laugh.
- They guide me, they teach me, they reassure me, and they comfort me, they inspire me, and they lead me.
- I don’t use big words you know, and I try to make it as clear as possible and my hope is to always reach twice as many people.
- I tend to pay a lot more attention if the person is good musically and lyrically.
- Once I started listening. Once I started writing songs I guess I realised how much lyrically songs mean to me.
- I was never big on lyrics, so I had to learn the lyrics, and when you learn the lyrics you are actually reading it properly for the first time.
- I am first drawn to the music. Then the lyrics start to hit me after that.
- Not just the words but there is a general sound to the song, the general feel of the song.
- If the music doesn’t catch me I won’t listen to it anyway.
• A good song will hit someone at a real animal level where they are affected by the rhythm of the song, and the melody of the song first. And then, they are subject to the lyrics after words and they may not even realise that they are hearing something that they haven’t heard before.

• Songs have a way of hooking you in if you like the melody, or if you like the beat. It gets you.

• There is something about the images, the song, the music, the way it captures and the whole idea of it.

• It is not just what people are saying, it is how they are saying it.

• It’s a full package.

• You have to have the full package. And so for people to use music for an educational purpose, you can’t have just one or the other, you have to have the full. Which is exciting.

• I mean listening to lyrics, and listening to the whole body of a song. Songs took on much more importance of being educational or directive, as sort of, in a consoling way, or sort of helped me through life.

• You put music and words together and it is sort of a lethal combination that locks in our memories.

• There is something about song that is very different than [sic] either poetry or music on its own. It combines two things. The poetics of it and the music of it activate the world of mystery. The words and the crafting of the words activate consciousness or thought.
• Songs of course have this wonderful combination of the lyrical content and the intellectual communication involved in that and this ethereal, emotional, mood of the music that creates an emotional response in someone that is beyond intellectual. That feeling. To marry those two so that the music becomes this vehicle for the words and therefore the meaning of what’s being communicated to really sink into a listener’s psyche and being.

This quote from a published interview with Paul Simon bears out these comments.

• Paul Simon claims that “It still doesn’t make any difference, if someone’s singing in Zulu or Portuguese or in the language of rap. The ear is willing to accept it when the rhythm is right” (Russell & Tyson, 1995, p. 67).

Music of all kinds speaks to us as humans (Kazemek & Riggs, 1997). Successful narrative songs incorporate symbol content (such as cultural and social metaphors and associations) into the song, along with the expressiveness dimensions of melody, rhythm, rhyme, etc. (Caroll, 2001, December; Reimer, 1970, cited in Masterson, 1994). The combination of lyrics and music is poetry in its oldest and most widespread form. Songs have been used to demonstrate all the elements of literature, sound, imagery, figurative language, form, and narrative. When writing of the effects of music in the context of the liturgy, Saint Augustine (McClary, 1999) remarked, “I realise that when they are sung, these sacred words stir my mind to greater religious fervour and kindle in me more ardent flame of piety than they would if they were not sung” (p. 441). When discussing the 18th century Jacobite song about Bonnie Prince Charlie, *Mo Ghile Mear* or *Our Hero*, singer-songwriter Sting (Glatt, 2000) contends that “Lyrics can communicate without necessarily being understood. The feeling and mood that the writer puts in are already there whether you understand it or not.
It’s not just about words, it is about words and music. It’s a different medium. It’s a conversation” (pp. 286-287). The power of music and song is prompt and engaging, it gets us away from the tendency to rely too much on words, and brings individuals into contact with the emotional life of people (Kelly, 1997).

**Category: Not Preaching**

The topic of preaching was mentioned numerous times in interviews with participants. Preaching is defined as proclaiming or expounding. It may include giving moral advice in an obtrusive way to advocate, inculcate, lecture, indoctrinate, or admonish (Barber, 1998; Rodale, 1986). Informants were clear that they saw little value in preaching. For the participants in this study the unfolding of a narrative in song plays a much more important function than preaching:

- (name) and I don’t get up on stage and preach about anything.
- It can be done in a way that is not preachy. So it can cause people to listen for that reason as well.
- I don’t feel comfortable about standing up and proclaiming my truths to everybody. It borders on preaching.
- Preaching is not the way to do it. So therefore, storytelling, just telling the news.

Published interviews corroborate the previous comments.

- David Crosby (2000) asserts that “you can’t preach. It just won’t work. But you can focus people’s attention on issues and ideas” (p. ix).
• Tom Russell takes a different tack. He views the power of a song “resides in the simple view of what that character has been through” (Russell & Tyson, 1995, p. 149).

**Category: Communication**

Informants were universal in their testimony describing popular song as an important means of communication. Definitions of communication include the following: to tell, inform, bring to one’s attention, make known, transmit, or pass on (information). As well, communication can impart (feelings etc.) non-verbally, evoke understanding, share a feeling, or share understanding (Barber, 1998; Rodale, 1986; Shunker, 1998). Informants’ views are reflected in the following statements:

- The communication with people through songs. What I have always heard a good song does, goes from the personal to the public, the personal to the group.

- People request it and we do it and whole audiences sing to each other. And somehow release the discomfort that goes around, being around someone so different from you. Yeah, that to me is the hugest demonstration of how knowledge can be communicated.

- So it is very much about community and communication. There you go. There it is, a two-word answer.

- The most powerful songs come from that. Like that place of truth and honesty and experience. The writer or creator has had that experience and can therefore communicate it. Communicate their reaction to it in a way that is very effective.
• I have read stuff about ancient cultures, even going back to prehistoric humans, that music probably was there then. It was about communicating. There was a ritualised aspect of it. I think it is about communication again.

• Popular songs were information songs. The ballads were stories before things were written down.

• It allows me to communicate with a lot people at one time.

• That’s what songs are about, they’re about communicating. Something like Neil Young’s song *Ohio* (Appendix 2).

• It is almost like a musical newspaper I guess.

• In terms of the sorts of things that can be communicated, just about anything can be communicated. Whether it is the whole ecological movement. Whether it is healing and the need for self-healing and the need for self-awareness. Whether it is how to express anger. You can teach about another culture. Or you can take a song from the era of the Second World War (*Coming in on a Wing and a Prayer*, Appendix 3) and give people a sense.

• You can learn from songs, all sorts of things about language, about slang, information, the great subjects of life.

Published interviews verify the previous comments:

• “Songs are really about sending messages” (Havens, 1999, p. 142).

• Ani difranco maintains that “The basis for just about every song is a connection of some kind. They’re all about bridges between one person and another” (Goetzman, 2001, p. 94).
• Angelique Kidjo views her work as a performer “is to do something to bring people together to communicate for a better understanding of each other” (Robbins, 2002, March 28).

• “I tend to go for the larger issues as reflected in the small histories, for example how the individual is affected. People are less intimidated if the scope is not too wide, and can identify more closely with things that are related to their own lives” states Sylvia Tyson (Russell, & Tyson, 1995, p. 149).

• Guy Clark states “I’ve often said that you should write about what you know, but people get the wrong idea. That includes what people tell you as well as what you’ve done. If other people’s experiences touch you, that’s part of what you know. You want to write a song about something that people can associate with, where they can say that happened to me or that could happen to me. You have to leave holes in just the right places so you allow them to use their imagination”(Himes, 2002, p. 80).

• “To flesh out the intimacies of September 11, Springsteen had to do some reporting. The success of his reporting can be measured by his song The Rising (Appendix 4). Lyrically the song is a catalogue of absence: a coffee cup on the counter, a newspaper on a doorstep” (Tyrangeile, 2002, p. 45).

• Tom Russell submits that “The urge to tell a story in song, to sing, ‘the news’ is as old as mankind. I think of troubadours travelling from castle to castle with their ballads” (Russell & Tyson, 1995, p. 45).

• David Crosby (2000) adds, “There’s an older part of our job that comes from the tradition of the troubadours. We’re sort of the town criers” (p.ix)
• “Many songs, in fact have the dramatic impact of good theatrical play” states Richie Havens (1999, p. 85).

• Joni Mitchell asserts that “You can write about anything that literature can write about” (Russell & Tyson, 1995, p. 53).

• “That’s why you put it out because it’s no good like recording stuff and putting it in a drawer. What’s the point in that? You’ve got to get it out there you know. Yeah, yeah, communication at the end of the day, it’s all about communication isn’t it?” (Morrison, 2003).

Narrative is one of the most widespread and powerful forms of human communication (Bruner, 1992, cited in Margrini, 1996). The task of the creator of narrative is not simply to entertain but to communicate a view of life that will clarify reality for the audience (Connell, cited in Mitchell, 1991; Gudmundsdottir, 1995; Learning Insights, June 13, 2002; Mitchell, 1991). Through the use of language and literary invention, the creator of the narrative holds the audience (Bruner, 1996), making it unnecessary for the audience to invent characters and incidents. However, the audience is permitted to supply the “unspecified connections, extrapolations, and resonance they require in order to make sense” (Leitch, 1986, p. 39) of the narrative. The beauty of narrative is that “anyone reading it can take it in and use if for themselves” (Coles, 1989, p. 47, cited in Mitchell, 1991). However, it requires that the audience be skilfully engaged to make the necessary connections within the story, respond appropriately, and to know what to do with an idea (Mitchell, 1991; Rossiter, 1999). Through stories or narratives, individuals to can “make inferences and predictions, to understand phenomena, to decide what actions to take and to control
its execution, and above all to experience events by proxy” (Johnson-Laird, 1983, p. 397).

Music is one of the unique traits of what it means to be a human being. (Blacking, 1973; Fowler, 1996; Hodges, 2000; Shunker, 1998; Tolbert, 2001). Brain research has shown that music is biologically rooted and fundamental to human development (Carrol, 2001, December; Jensen, 2001; Tolbert, 2001). The discipline of ethnomusicology has shown how just how diverse and central music is in the different cultures of the world (Blacking, 1995; Cross, 2001). It is a complex and universal social behaviour. Music is a universal language, which resides within all humans, regardless of who they are or where they are located (Fay, 2001). It is a demonstration of culture and of the human need to communicate our ideas, concepts, and feelings, as well as give access to human history (Bowan, 1998; Elias et al. 1995, cited in Kerka, 1997; Elliot, 1995; Fowler, 1996; Jadnak, 2000; Hart, 1990; Neuenfeldt, 1997; Shunker, 1998; Wolfensohn & Williams, 1993). Artistic representations are the language of civilisation through which we express our fears, our anxieties, our curiosities, our hungers, our discoveries, and our hopes (Elliot, 1995; Fowler, 1996; Morin, 2003). With its symbolic way of representing the world music is a universal language which allows us to understand and communicate with others as well as illuminate, record, and analyse human insights (Elliot, 1995; Fowler, 1996; Jensen, 2001; Tolbert, 2001; Wolfensohn & Williams, 1993). To a greater or lesser extent the meaning of music and song can be shared with other listeners and performers (Clark, 1991; Frith, 1988; Gardner, 1983, cited in Rowland, 1999; Jourdain, 1997; Kazemek & Rigg, 1997; Revill, 1998). Music makers and musical
works communicate in various ways including the expression of artistic-cultural traditions, values, and emotions; conveying representations and characterisations of people, places and things; manifesting cultural values; providing conditions for self-growth; exerting an influence on individuals and communities; and finally by conveying personal values (Elliot, 1995). We create new forms of expression when speech is inadequate and we want communication to attain a new level of intensity (Bjorkvold, 1992). Bowan (1998) states that “if words could convey what music does, we would not need music” (p. 210). Others concur that through music we are able to reach individuals in ways that far exceed our ability to communicate linguistically (Dickinson, 1997; Eisner, 1997).

Theme 2: Reflect Human Experience

Participants viewed popular song as an accurate reflection of human experience.

Their comments, thoughts, and musings are manifested in the interconnected categories of revelation, meaning, time, place, experience, truth, and voice.

Category: Revelation

Several informants saw song as providing a means of revealing something or making something known. Revelation can also be described as any of the following: exposure, showing, exhibition, displaying, unveiling, telling, or confession. Revelation can also consist of a striking disclosure or the disclosure of knowledge to humankind by a divine or supernatural agency (Barber, 1998; Rodale, 1986). The following comments are offered:
• I think I am still part of a generation that sees music as that. As revealing something secretive, some mystery. I think you can actually do that yourself, reveal that to yourself.

• You are looking at some kind of revelation, information, which is hard to get at.

• The writer has to reveal something in particular.

**Category: Constructing Meaning**

The issue relating to what a song might mean was raised in most interviews and surfaced many times in the analysis of the interview transcripts. Meaning is commonly defined as what is meant by a word, action, idea, etc. It also can be interpreted as sense, intention, purpose, aim, goal, connotation, significance, or importance (Barber, 1998; Rodale, 1986).

• It is not the actual song itself but the experience of the song and how the song is read by a particular audience. That whole exchange between the material itself and the listener.

• You don’t, can’t know what a person is going to get from any given song.

• Everybody takes something different.

• And that song, from that day, took on a life entirely of it’s own.

• The context in which a song is heard and the way the audience uses the song.

• It really depends on what is going on in that person’s life. The person receiving the song.

• And one of (informant name) songs she told me the other day about what it was all about and I just thought it was about something totally different.
• There is this song I wrote about friends of mine that people always think is about a significant other. It is so many miles from the intentions.

• A really great song can be vague enough that it can be whatever you want it to be about. Which is just sort of lovely too. *You Are My Sunshine* (Appendix 5) that was written about a specific person and a specific event, for sure. But now, it is about little kids, it is about whatever you want it to be. It has become this other thing. They take on their own lives. Which is wonderful.

• Often it can be any song you have written, but much later after you have written it, you can write about somebody else and it can later become true for yourself.

• A lot of music has actually misled a lot of people. Do you remember Charles Manson. He is in jail now isn’t he, because of that *Helter Skelter* (Appendix –6) from the Beatles.

• Even the stuff we are calling complete fluff, speaks volumes. Not in and of its own lyrics but it speaks volumes about what we are accepting today as entertainment, power structures and what music gets heard and what music doesn’t. Listen to a song by an independent artist who refuses to sign with major label. Political. You know and listen to “Rage Against the Machine”, political but signed to Sony. Which is an entirely, it’s all instructive. It’s all context.

Published interview comments bear out the observations of the informants.

• Holly Near (Post, 1997) describes how “I recently did *Wouldn’t It Be Loverly* (Appendix 7) from *My Fair Lady*, and without changing any words, it became a song about homelessness” (p. 68).
• The late Warren Zevon (Russell & Tyson, 1995) states that “The question of what songs mean and what they do is sort of terrifying when you think about it” Warren Zevon (p. 51).

• Crosby (2000) sums up by stating that “when you write a song and send it out into the world, on radio and television you have absolutely no idea who it will reach or what effect it will have (p. 217).

Narrative is a structure for meaning making (Bruner, 1990; Caffarella, et al., 2000, cited in Raiskums 2001; Cohler, 1982; Kerby, 1991; Polkinghorne, 1988; Rossiter, 1999; Tappan, 1991). Brookfield (1986), Habermas (1971), and Mezirow (1990) point out that meaning-making is a crucial element of adult learning. Narrative forms invite the listener in where they can take the story and use it for themselves (Coles, 1989; Leitch, 1986; Mitchell, 1991). As a result, narratives have the potential to have a multiplicity of meanings and interpretations (Edgar & Sedgewick, 1999).

Listeners use music and song to make meaning for themselves in complicated and contradictory ways (Crafts, Cavicchi, & Keil, 1993; Green, 1995; Shuker, 1994). The processes of listening to songs entail and produce several interconnected dimensions of meaning: affective, interpretative, structural, expressional, representational, social, ideological, and/or personal meanings (Elliot, 1994; McClary, 1993; Shuker, 1994). As well, song can be expressive of many kinds of meanings including moral, didactic, iconic, political, religious, or personal meanings including being in time, emotions, desire, pleasure, and much more (Elliot, 1995; Masterson, 1994; McClary, 1993; McDonnell, 1999). As a result of this, listeners may respond in a variety of ways to a particular song allowing for diverse meanings and interpretations (Eisner, 1992; Moi, 1994, cited in Lems 2001; Shuker,
In addition, songwriters frequently employ metaphorical references with the true meaning often known only by the creator themselves (Green, 1995).

The analysis of popular songs reveals that many levels of meaning based on music, lyrics, images, and movement are unique to each individual depending on several variables including their social and cultural backgrounds (Cross, 2001; Eliot, 1995; Shepherd & Wicke, 1997; Shuker, 1994). Songs can be socially meaningful since they can provide means by which “people recognise identities and places, and the boundaries that separate them” (Gregory, 1997, p. 131). As a result of these complex and potentially contradictory variables, what music or a song is about can “vary from context to context, within a context, and from individual to individual” (Cross, 2001, p. 99). Meaning, then, becomes dependent on what associations listeners attach to a particular song (McDonell, 1999). This results in a particular song being used in diverse ways and for a variety of purposes by different listeners (Shuker, 1994).

Social scientists, musicologists, and journalists have all contributed to the understanding of portions of the truth about music. However, they have not yet provided a suitable way of comprehending how interactions among the artists, audiences, and apparatuses in combination create the world of song production, including state cultural policy, distribution, the texts, their creators, and the listeners (Crafts, Cavicchi, & Keil, 1993, Green, 1995, Masterson, 1994; Shuker, 1994; Swanwick, 1998).

Theory related to the study of brain function suggests that the human brain is designed to allow for learning throughout life, extracting sets of meaningful patterns from the confusion of daily internal and external experience. These patterns are then organised into meaning perspectives which guide future learning (MacKeracher, 1996; Mezirow 1991). This
is significant since each form of representation, including music and song, imposes its own cognitive requirements and requires its own skills (Eisner, 1982). Dewey (1934) saw the connection where artistic and aesthetic qualities such as meaning are inherent in everyday experiences and are always embedded within social context. These cultural interpretations and understandings are embedded in songs and performances by those engaged in creating songs. As well, “the kinds of meaning students can secure is influenced by the forms of representation through which meaning is constructed” (Eisner, 1998, p. 179).

Category: Ability to Evoke Time

Several informants discussed how popular song could capture time, place a person in a time period, or take an individual back through memories to a situation they had experienced in the past. Based on their comments this category has been identified as the ability of song to evoke time. Time is defined as the indefinite and continuous duration of existence seen as a series of events progressing from the past through the present and into the future. The passage of time is regarded as affecting people or things such as a more or less definite portion of time in history. Time may also specifically refer to a point, moment, instant, hour, day, or period (Barber, 1998; Rodale, 1986).

- I try to capture a moment in time, for all time.
- Songs really do talk. They represent what is going on in the world at that moment.
- You could learn something from somebody who wrote a song about that era or songs that were written in that era.
- Even if you are talking about the most popular things all the time they do reflect the times. They are instructive because they reflect the mood of the time.
I think that songs also are less threatening when they are presenting new ideas to people or historical facts to people than textbooks or that kind of thing. You know, a lot of the songs then were definitive for me and they came out of an angry place. But a song like Masters of War (Appendix 8), “you who build the big guns.” It was a naïve song, but at the time.

You can teach history through songs and what people were getting away from or what they were trying to remember.

A lot of civil rights things have been brought to light through songs (Strange Fruit, Appendix – 8).

It just educated me a little bit about what was going on in government back then and just listen to songs about the slave movement.

Songs are also a time machine for me. It will take me right to the place where that song owns my memories. It is a phenomenal thing.

When I think of songwriters, I think that there are songwriters that are really good at, sort of, historical song-writing. Stan Rogers comes to mind, Bob Bossin again comes to mind, Gordon Lightfoot. I mean how many of us would really have heard about the Wreck of the Edmund Fitzgerald (Appendix—10)? Another great song is The Great Canadian Railroad Trilogy (Appendix – 11). That kind of thing.

There is a lot of stuff about Canadian history that we are not taught at all and that is what I have learned from being exposed to people’s songs. You also learn about the current moods and political attitudes as well.

They enable me to get outside of time and space.
I grew up listening to it so it brings back memories.

Published interviews support these observations:

“Song-writing allows you to cheat tremendously. You can present an entire life in a few minutes and then hopefully, at the end you reveal something about yourself, and your audience and the person in the song” (Springsteen, 1998, May-June, p. 43).

Elvis Costello adds “Songs are important to us, most of us, anyway. They act as signposts, date stamps to our life” (Hodgkinson, 2002, April, 9 p. R3A).

By inserting a few small narrative details, Springsteen tries to create songs that will carry his listeners away. “The difference”, he says, “was that on this record, [The Rising, Appendix – 4], you’re writing about something that everyone saw and had some experience with, and obviously some people experienced it much more intimately” [referring to September 11, 2001] (Tyrangeile, 2002, p. 44).

Narrative is endowed with an episodic dimension, the dimension of time, which is expressed in the succession of events; and a non-chronological dimension, which constructs “meaningful totalities out of scattered events” (Rocoeur, 1981, p. 278, cited in Magrinni, 1996). Narrative has the ability to connect separate isolated events into whole sequences, such as events that can be understood within a context, or meaning frame (Kerby, 1991, cited in Rossiter, 1999; Learning Insights, 2002; Pradl, 1984). As a result, narratives also allow us a way of connecting past, present and future, both as individuals and as societies or cultures (Brooks & Clark, 2001; Bruner, 1996; Cohler, 1982; Crites, 1986; Ricoeur, 1981, cited in Magrinni, 1996; Pradl, 1984; Rossiter, 1999).
Song can also inform our sense of time (Morris, 1999), since recording time presupposes some sort representation of experience (Chase, 2002; Dickenson, 1997). With respect to the perspective of personal history, scholars have explored how listeners participate in popular music through the emotional experiences in which listeners may reminisce or romanticise about their own lives (Bowen, 1997).

From a social or cultural perspective Cooper (1998) argues that basically popular songs are pieces of oral history. For example the song *Hurricane* (Appendix – 12) by Bob Dylan is a narrative song which very accurately retells the facts of boxer Rubin Carter’s story. Others add that the realisation that songs have historical meaning is a learning experience in itself (Cooper, 1991; Goodale, 2000; Kelly, 1997). Narrative songs provide another way of viewing history, where learners can discover an historical period through the singing of its people. (Colombo, 2002; Wright & Wellner, 2000). These songs have the potential to provide a gold mine of historical learning experiences (Cooper, 1991; Lems, 2001).

The use of song as a method of distributing information and messages has a long and substantive history. Prior to the invention of the printing press, radio, and television “the ‘word’ was carried by travelling actors and minstrels, whose messages were considered every bit as pernicious as any TV program or pop song today” (Baggaley, 1999). Musicologist Alan Lomax described song as an art which paints a portrait of the people, “which lives upon the lips of the multitude and is transmitted by the grapevine, surviving sometimes for centuries of the common man” (Lomax, 1947, cited in Cantwell, 1996). Songs from major and minor wars, slavery, immigration, and westward expansion, the Industrial Revolution, the labour movement, the Great Depression can all reflect and expose a period of time
(Brown, 2001; Cooper, 1991; Glatt, 2000). Songs from medieval ballads and Shakespearean songs to Blake, and from Civil War era ballads to blues and contemporary, have captured the history of events, ideas, and people who have shaped society. To summarise, songs are a timeless expression of human experience (Anstead, 1993; Bowan, 1998; Chase, 2002; Colombo, 2002; Crafts, Cavicchi, & Keil, 1993; Elliot, 1995; Fowler, 1996; Jadnak, 2000; Hart, 1990; Higgins, 1997; Hutcheon, 2002; Masterson, 1994; Neuenfeldt, 1997; SFSC, 1999; Wolfenshon & Williams, 1993; Wright & Wellner, 2000).

Category: Inform Sense of Place

Several informants mentioned how popular song can provide insight into places, as well as how people know and value places. Place is interpreted as a particular portion of space, such as a portion of space occupied by a person or thing, including a location, scene, setting, region, area, territory, or realm. It also can also refer to a situation or circumstance (Barber, 1998; Rodale, 1986).

- It will help me go somewhere else.
- I have actually had people say, about my music, that it is very much about Prairie music. It suggests something, not lyrically, but just the feel of it.
- I have no idea where this guy is from Africa, but I have this sense of space and spirit, and I don’t understand a word he is saying.
- World music is very much like that for us, because we don’t have access to, like it’s everything we know about. It basically creates whole experience in a song because it is so foreign. If I really want to have an experience where I sort of
leave my life for a while, listening to music from India or music from Africa. You know, somewhere I can’t really go.

- Song has always been a defining component to any society. You can listen to a Japanese folk song, or a Russian folk song, or a folk song from the Andes.
- If you wanted to learn about the geography of Amazonia you could maybe incorporate some songs of a tribe there.
- I think that in other cultures that I have visited, song is much more intertwined with the day-to-day realities of life and the drama of human emotions on a much broader scale. The kinds of things they are thinking or talking about. They reflect the society in which they germinated and define it to an enormous extent I think.

Songs can help bring people and places alive (Kelly, 1997; Paterson, 1991). They can inform our sense of place, physical setting, or geographic location (Bowan, 1997; Colombo, 2002; Elliot, 1995; Higgins, 1997; Hutcheon, 2002; Lems, 2001; Masterson, 1994; McLeay, 1999; Morris, 1999; Neuenfeldt, 1997; Stokes, 1994). Wherever it locates the listener, songs can speak to the head and the heart, and tell the listener something about what it means to live in a particular place (Berland, 1998). Not only does music and song reflect the character of a place, as well as the perspectives it also reflects the values of the musician (Berland, 1998; Bowan, 1997; Paterson, 1991).

Category: Manifest Experience

The theme of experience was coded more frequently than any other theme discovered through data analysis. All the informants saw song as manifesting personal experience, social experience, or both. Experience is defined as actual observation of or practical acquaintance
with facts or events, including the knowledge or skill resulting from this. Examples of experience include an event affecting one; the fact or process of being so affected; or the events that have taken place within the knowledge of an individual, a community, etc. Experience may also be characterised as a feeling or affect (an emotion). In addition, experience can be explained as an affair, ordeal, occurrence, happening, adventure, observation, perception, or impression. As well, experience can determine knowledge, learning, enlightenment, and discovery (Barber, 1998; Rodale, 1986).

- Music relates to the whole spectrum of life.
- Song and poetry for me have a way of encapsulating the human experience that is very valuable to me.
- I write songs about personal experience. That is probably the thing I can speak most truly about.
- All you can do is filter it through your own voice and express it and in doing that, what you do is you hopefully connect with people. They recognise their own reality in what you are singing, and it becomes a good song.
- Many songs that are important to me. It is not the particular song so much as the commonality of experience.
- That’s when you realise that everyone is going through the same thing. The whole world is nervous.

Connelly and Clandinin (1990) state that “people lead storied lives and tell stories about those lives” (p. 2). Everything we do can be seen, cast, and recounted as a “narrative with a beginning, middle and end, characters, setting, drama, suspense, enigma, human interest, and a moral” (Toolan, 1988, p. xiii). As a story, narrative includes elements of plot,
setting, and theme (Rossiter, 1999). Narratives go somewhere, with some sort of development, and a conclusion. Narrative exists in myth, legend, fable, tale, tragedy, comedy, epic, history, pantomime, painting, cinema, news items, and conversation, and is advanced through “articulated speech, oral or written, by image, fixed or moving, by gesture, and by the organised mixture of all these substances” (Barthes, 1988, p. 5). For centuries, humans have been learning from experience and recounting that experience through story (Cassidy, 2001; Connelly & Clandinin, 1990). Barthes (1988) contends “there is not, there has never been, any people anywhere without narrative; all classes, all human groups have their narratives, and very often these are enjoyed by men of different, even opposing culture: narrative never prefers good to bad literature: international, transhistorical, transcultural, narrative is there, like life” (p. 95). The telling of stories or narratives is a universal and pervasive characteristic of our environment in that it provides the initial and continuing means for shaping and sharing our experience (Brooks & Clark, 2001; Carroll, 2001; Pradl, 1984). “We frame the accounts of our cultural origins and our most cherished beliefs in story form” (Bruner, 1996). Every place, culture, society, and period has narratives, stories, and story forms through which human action and intent are explained and understood (Barthes, 1988; Booth, 1988; Bruner, 1986, 1990, 1996; Cohler, 1982; Irvine, 2002; Mitchell, 1991; Tappan, 1989, 1991).

On a personal level we represent our lives to ourselves, and to others, through the structure of narrative (Bruner, 1996; Kierkegaard, 1978; Mitchell, 1991; Rossiter, 1999). Humans possess the capacity to process and structure information in the form of stories, and we rely on this capacity to organise our everyday experience (Bruer, 1993; Johnson-Laird, 1983; Ochberg, 1994; Schank, 1995). It is through narrative that we construct and maintain
our knowledge of the world (Pradl, 1984), through the application of story as a metaphor for
life (Egan, 1992; Norman, 2000; Rossiter, 1999). “We dream in narrative, daydream in
narrative, remember, anticipate, hope, despair, believe, doubt, plan, revise, criticise, gossip,
learn, hate, and live by narrative” (Hardy, 1968, p. 5 cited in Norman, 2000). By means of
narrative we see the life-view embodied, enter into it, understand how it looks, and feels

It is through the imposition of structure that narrative connects as well as records the
events of experiences that contribute to meaning making (Bruner, 1986, 1990; Cassidy, 2001;
Clark & Dirkx, 2000, cited in Brooks & Clark, 2001; Cohler, 1982; Freeman, 1984; Kerby,
composed of structured relationships between such things as the events narrated, the
historical sequence in which they happened, the temporal sequence presented within the
narrative, the narrator’s perspective and tone, the relationship between the narrator and their
audience and the activity of narration itself” (Edgar & Sedgewick, 1999, p. 253). It is this
sequence that carries the meaning (Bruner, 1996; Cohler, 1982; Ricoeur, 1981, p. 278, cited
in Margrini, 1996; Toolan, 1988). The story, then, gives meaning and a context for learning
what could otherwise be a series of meaningless facts (Carroll, 2001). By examining the
structure and the content of the related events in the narrative, individuals are permitted to
see and understand a particular process. Individuals can interpret the inner workings of the
narrative. They can examine a narrative from several perspectives, such as how the story is
told, what the central plot elements are, how are they joined together, and what devices are
used to create coherence in the narrative (Lieblich & Josselson, 1997; Mishler, 1986;
Similar to narrative, the arts embrace subjects that represent the human experience so that they can be shared with others (Eisner, 1992, 1997; Fay, 2001; Morin, 2003; Schwarzmann, 1993). Through creative forms we are given the opportunity to experience the ordinary and to learn to understand in new and different ways (Brearley, 2000). “Art generally, and especially a time art such as music, gives us our only glimpse of how life is experienced through the minds of other intelligent and sentient beings” (Elliot, 1995, p. 209).

Song can provide its own distinctive insight into life’s central nature (Barthes, 1977, cited in Tolbert, 2001; Blacking, 1973, cited in Tolbert, 2001; Bowan, 1998; Colombo, 2002; Crafts, Cavicchi, & Keil, 1993; Higgins, 1997; McIntire, 1990, cited in Kerka, 1997; Morin, 2003; Swanwick, 1998; Tolbert, 2001). In many societies music is not an independent art form to be enjoyed for its own sake, but is an integral part of the culture. Song can open windows into the complexity of human relations and have the capacity to express a very broad range of human experience. Song can articulate significant aspects of human nature, human relations, cultural values, and emotional experience (Anstead, 1993; Berland, 1998; Colombo, 1994; Cooper, 1998; Elliot, 1995; Garnett, 1998; Goodale, 2000; Higgins, 1997; Lems, 2001; Masterson, 1994; Merriam, 1964; Morin, 2003; Paterson, 1991; Post, 1997; Swanwick, 1997). Songs are created for a variety of purposes and functions across cultures. Music may accompany every human activity from the cradle to the grave, including lullabies, games, dancing, work, healing, battle, rights, and ceremonies, including weddings and funerals (Elliot, 1995; Gregory, 1997; Hart, 1990; Higgins, 1997; Tolbert, 2001; Walker, 1990).

The use of song to represent experience goes back to ancient times. Cave paintings demonstrating the use of music go back 70,000 years (Jensen, 2002), and anthropologists
have found that all people, in all times, and all places have engaged in music and song (Blacking, 1995, cited in Cross, 2001; Carroll, 2001, December; Chew, 1995; Coe, 1990; Dissyanake, 1988, cited in Jensen, 2001; Hodges & Haack, 1996, cited in Hodges, 2000; Jensen, 2001; Scholes, 1955; Walker, 1990).

The basic elements of popular music and song have existed for centuries. An oral tradition including work songs, lullabies, victory songs, songs for weddings and funerals, mocking songs, satirical songs and epic stories existed in ancient Greece and Rome (Chew, 1995). In the Middle ages heroic and epic songs appeared among the Germanic and Celtic peoples (Chew, 1995). A great flowering period of song started with the troubadours (Apel, 1962). “In parts of the world that have not had access to high-technology infrastructures, simple media and ingenious techniques for their educational use are commonplace, and the travelling player—educator has not died in these countries” (Baggaley, 1999). This tradition is still strong over a wide area of Southwest Asia, the travelling bard, the ashiq, sings epic stories and tales. Troubadours still exist in West Africa in the form of griots, who are professional musicians that play a vital role in traditional African life, providing a living history of their societies, traditions, genealogies, and also stories of the present (Eyre, 2000; Gregory, 1997; Hale, 1994; Llewellyn, 1998). They know about everything that is going on and communicate it to the community. Similarly, in North America, “blues songs and slave songs were spontaneous expressions much in the tradition of newspapers; all kinds of activities, feelings, and happenings were sung about in the same way that the popular press reports on varied events” (Walker, 1990, p. 184). Through the representations available from popular songs it is possible to track the quality of life experiences of those living in poor white or Afro-American communities (Stansfield, 1994, cited in Rowland, 1999). The strong
oral tradition and use of oral teaching in the community continues to endorse music as an important resource for teaching and learning in the African American community and church (Crafts, Cavicchi, & Keil, 1993; Hutcheon, 2002; Rowland, 1999).

In western culture, since the Industrial revolution, songs gained sufficient popularity to be passed from one person to another or published in printed form. During that period songs became “a common link and support of morale for the industrial population” (Lamb & Hamm, 1995, p. 88). Song became an important component of communication within the labour movement in North America (Dunson, 1965; Fowke & Glaser, 1973; Rodnitzky, 1976; Szatmary, 1996). In the United States, during the late 19th century and early 20th century, travelling Chautauguas combined oratory, theatre, and especially musical vehicles to educate millions of American (Gould, 1970; Mead, 1980; Morrison, 1974; Rowland, 1999; Schurr, 1992; Stubblefield, 1981; Tapia, 1997). Chautauguas became a pioneer in correspondence education, a precursor to distance education, and the utilisation of music and theatre as teaching tools. After the beginning of the 20th century the spread of radio and recordings had a profound effect the way popular songs were disseminated and perpetuated world-wide (Chew, 1995; Lamb & Hamm, 1995).

As has been previously mentioned, it is self evident that songwriters and artists of all kinds reflect at least some aspects of their inherited culture, of their knowledge, experiences, and interactions with their political and cultural surroundings (Higgins, 1997; Garnett, 1998; McCarthy, 2002; Reimer, 1970, cited in Masterson, 1994; Walker, 1990). Music is a cultural occurrence, socially constructed, and socially embedded (Bowan, 1998; Elliot, 1995; Garnett, 1998; McCarthy, 2002; McDonell, 1999). As such, “the many and varied ways in which people create, perform, perceive, and react to musical sounds are vitally dependent on the
particular situations in which they do so” (Hargreaves & North, 1997, p. I). Studies of music and song from the perspectives of ethnomusicology, anthropology, sociology, feminism, semiotics, and analytic philosophy provide a clearer understanding of the ways in which ideology can mediate music making and listening (Elliot, 1995). The ideological messages that song can encode can be approached as a cultural construct both reflecting human experience and creating attitudes toward work, class, politics, gender, sexuality, and other basic categories that organise our lives (Elliot, 1995; Garnett, 1998; Lovering, 1998; Masterson, 1994; McCarthy, 2002; Robinson, 1997; Theberge, 1995).

**Category: Represent Truth**

Several informants referred to the characteristics of truth, honesty, and authenticity. These characteristics were seen as being essential to reflecting experience through popular songs. Participants explained that good songs were consistent with reality, actuality, factuality, authenticity, certainty, honesty, integrity, accuracy, or possessed a lifelike quality. Truth is generally defined as the quality or state of being true or conforming to fact or reality. Other definitions of the truth refer to genuineness, authenticity, including representing the matter, or circumstance as it really is (Barber, 1998; Rodale, 1986).

- The most powerful songs come from that, like that place of truth and honesty and experience.
- I have written some things about the ability to be pure, true. Otherwise the song doesn’t mean a thing.
• When it comes to more personal and emotional things it’s simply, I think it’s for the creator to have experienced it, because the most powerful songs come from that. Like that place of truth and honesty and experience.

• I know that an area I coveted, the truth. The ability to be in some way accurate.

• I think you get a pretty true story.

• I think there is greater pressure on the narrative songs to be more true to what happens than say, film.

• You know, depending on the singer, and how deeply they are involved with the truth. You can learn a lot.

• They bypass your reasoning blockade and they allow the truth to get through.

• We still listen to a whole lot of songs that were written by dead people. And it is one of the few real contacts we have of the past that remains honest and remains real in terms, of perhaps, in what that person who wrote the song was trying to get across about their situation. So much of history and the past is presented and perhaps tainted by the people that are writing the book or writing history for whatever reason they are writing it for, that we possibly don’t know that it is honest. Songs transcend that.

Published interviews confirmed the previous comments:

• Irving Berlin (Russell & Tyson, 195) maintained “that the popular songs of a country give a true picture of its history” (p. 137).

• “All of my songs are personal, some are historical or chronological narratives, others are more impressionistic. But that doesn’t make one song truer than
another. They’re all true, it’s all stuff that has happened to me, either literally or metaphorically” (Clark, 1992).

- “I have a feeling for human nature in difficult situations. Don’t know why, but I always have. Truth is what ties it all together. I try to keep it down to earth, play it as it lays and say it as it is” stated Johnny Cash (McCormick, 2002, p. B9).

- “I would hear the under-history of a people, the history that revealed a universal truth about a land, or a time, or a group of people who resembled our neighbours, ourselves, our friends (Havens, 1999, p. 69).

- Bruce Springsteen (Tyraneile, 2002) describes how “When you’re putting yourself into shoes you haven’t worn you have to be very, just very thoughtful. You call on your craft, and you go searching for it, and hopefully what makes people listen is that over the years you’ve been serious and honest” (p. 46).

- Springsteen (Percy, 2001) adds that “The pace of the modern world, industrialisation, post-industrialisation, have all made human connection very difficult to maintain and sustain. To bring that modern situation alive, how we live, our hang-ups and choices, that’s what music, film and art are all about. That’s the service you’re providing, that’s the function you’re providing as an artist” (p. 54).

The arts also embrace intuition, and ruthless exploration of the truth (Schwarzmann, 1993). Adorno attempted to show how music could be an autonomous or an ideological expression of some truths about society (Green, 1999). In Art as Experience John Dewey wrote that “artists have always been the real purveyors of news” (Dickinson, 1997). Blacking (1973, cited in Tolbert, 2001) explains that music is a vehicle for cultural truth because we
hear it as the meaningful presence of another person. MacKeracher (1996) contends that with narrative, truth is based on credibility, symbolic richness, and coherence. Others see song as a way of expressing missing truths or telling stories that help people see themselves and each other more clearly (Brown, 2001; Goodale, 2000; Havens, 1999, Tyrangeile, 2002). Arlo Guthrie maintains that “songs tell more of the truth of the struggles of the average guy. In songs you can’t really change it. It has rhyme, it has meter, it has tune. It is the way it is, you either sing it or you don’t. It’s hard to change it. I’ve learned more of the history of the real world through the songs that survived this cleansing process” (Brown, 2001).

**Category: A Voice for the Voiceless**

Voice is conventionally defined as expression; that is, to say, comment, view, disclose, reveal, to speak, make known, or give utterance to. Voice may also refer to the expressed will of the people, a group, etc., or to the right to express an opinion, as well as constituting an agency by which an opinion is expressed (Barber, 1998; Rodale, 1986). In addition voice may be the articulation of one’s inner voice, of one’s own experiences, albeit different from those of the majority. (Blenky, Clinchy, Goldberger & Tarule, 1986; Burrows, 1998; Alfred, 2000, cited in Raiskums, 2000, p. 93).

- If well, that person, if he is responsible of himself, the person who cares what is happening outside. Outside them, then music is very, very important.

- In another time and in different cultures how that has been a part of a social movement in spite of, in some cases, trying to be squelched by the system. It still gets out there. Which is one of the wonderful things about music. It really can’t be stopped because it is oral tradition. So I think that it is kind of evasive.
• Music and song can provide a voice for the voiceless. Those who can’t speak for themselves. Through music you can represent them. That is true. That is very true. Through song, if the message gets into him and he understands the message. If well, that person, if he is responsible of himself, the person who cares what is happening outside. Outside them, then music is very, very important.

• A lot of these guys are expatriates because they were given the heave-ho, because they were singing protest songs. They may be based in Paris or something like that.

• Informing people is too dangerous.

• If you really study songs, you start to know what’s going on.

• I can image that if I was in another country where you are being oppressed and you sing something about freedom, how powerful that can be.

• There is that whole song-writing tradition that Pete Seeger, and Woody Guthrie (Deportee: Plane Wreck at Los Gatos, Appendix – 13), and Harry Belafonte even, and all those who were singing for their lives. Not for their livelihood. I mean that’s one of the things that has hit me about music in other cultures. Is that people sing for their lives. They sing of their lives, from their lives and sometimes to keep themselves alive.

• You learn about the political thing that is going on, you learn about people’s mores, you learn about the colours in their culture, you learn about the differences between their culture and your culture. You definitely learn about history from sort of a heart perspective sometimes. You learn things about history that aren’t written in history books, because music transcends that. It’s not…they always say
that music is always written by the people whereas history is written by the
winners.

- *If I Had a Hammer* (Appendix 14) is a pretty good example of somebody with a
code of ethics, writing them down, putting them into a musical form and singing
them. All of Peter Seeger, Guthrie, all those guys seem to be about, this is the way
we think the world should be run and put into words in such a way as to empower
people. Communities were formed around these songs and it became like a battle
cry for organisations.

- Songs give people something to rally around. It can become a voice for a whole
bunch of people.

- Songs that catch on in a way, that become, popular icons that a whole arena will
end up singing. That tells a lot about the middle, the mid-section of people’s, what
they’re needing. What they need to say. They hook on to songs to try and do
many things, find their way, express their dissatisfaction. Songs speak for the
masses in many ways.

- So that you go to South Africa, there are major streams of songs. In fact, the
national anthem which was once forbidden to be sung. Is now the national anthem
of South Africa because it demanded freedom through it. And it was outlawed,
because it was against the law but they sang it clandestinely everywhere. So the
day that freedom comes, the whole country sings it out loud. It galvanises energy

- Certainly some of the protest songs, like I was saying, could be a good way of at
least reinforcing what you have already learned. It just gives you an idea what
other areas of the world are about. Especially if you listen to international music. A lot of North African and South African music has got some pretty strong political messages in it…that are coming from the general populace. You hear stuff from them that you are never going to hear or read in the paper.

• Actually, I think that most of my music. My music being from Zimbabwe because the government didn’t want people to listen to this kind of music. Well it is not that way, against the government so much. But it is that system that they are using is not right for the people. They should change the system.

• We are faced with big problems now and I don’t hear anybody singing about it. Because you can’t get it on the radio because people they don’t want people to know. They don’t want that power to rise.

• The speakers that are turned towards humanity are only playing one thing. And that ain’t what it’s like.

• Bruce Springsteen for me was like a huge influence. And in a weird way I did learn from him. He would, his lyrics always had some impact, whether they were about love or something political that happened or whatever. He is a really good example. I mean a lot of people do this, I mean U2 does this too.

• One of the things that I want to do, if I do nothing else, in my work, is to give people, in various ways, a body of songs that they can then. That can be relevant to them and the life that they live, in the everyday life, in the office or going for a walk on the waterfront or whatever.

• In my own music, the things that have had the biggest impact, not necessarily on the masses, but on individual lives who have reported to me. Have been the ones
about more difficult subjects that popular music doesn’t deal with. You know, like violence, or rape, or childhood abuse. Not all these things have happened to me, but things I see so prevalent in society, and can somehow process myself even though I might not have directly experienced it. And process it into a song, that allows a person to, who has had that experience, to have their own cathartic response, in just having it expressed in a musical form and having it expressed along with the music that allows them to feel.

Published interviews corroborate the comments made by participants:

- “The Bells of Rhymney (Appendix 16) spoke to a history that went much deeper than anything else we had been taught in school. The song was about coal miners and mine owners in Wales and it told how the church bells would ring through the town when a mine had caved in. The song revealed feelings of people who endured the hazards of living such a hard, uncertain life in unsafe conditions” (Havens, 1999, p. 69).

- Holly Near (Post, 1997) described how “I recently did Wouldn’t It Be Loverly (Appendix 6) from My Fair Lady, and without changing any words, it became a song about homelessness” (p. 68).

- “My dad’s songs were really written to make certain people feel as though they had some kind of value” explains Arlo Guthrie (Brown, 2001).

- Guthrie adds that “They sang and wrote and collected the songs in the books that were songs for educating people; songs for organising people, songs for indoctrinating people. They had to change the world because the world was crushing them” (Brown, 2001).
• “We were singing and writing about real emotions, feelings, and events, about African-Americans still being denied equal citizenship, and about the way the native Indian nations were being treated” (Havens, 1999, p. 71).

• Crosby (2000, p. 228) describes how “Sting appropriated the imagery of something that was happening in Chile and wrote a song that communicated that reality. He took that image and made it into a song and communicated it to millions of people who would not otherwise have given it that much attention had they read about it” (They Dance Alone, Appendix – 17).

While songs permit us to preserve and pass along our accumulated wisdom, they also give voice to the invention of new visions (Dickinson, 1997). Songs can be a newspaper for the illiterate, and a call together for the dispossessed (Crafts, Cavicchi, & Keil, 1993; Hutcheon, 2002, Post, 1997). Alan Lomax declared that popular song gave voice to the voiceless when he observed, “It is the voiceless people of the planet who really have in their memories the 90,000 years of human life and wisdom. I’ve devoted my life to an obsessive collecting together of the evidence” (Kemp, 2002). One of the strengths of popular song is giving voice to people who are denied expression in other arts and media (Baird, 1999, 2000; Crafts, Cavicchi, & Keil, 1993; Crosby, 2000; Fleming, 1997; Gilmore, 1998; Goodale, 2000; Post, 1997).

Theme 3: Fosters Community

Informants also explained how popular song had the ability to build camaraderie, promote sharing, and foster community. Community is defined as all the people living in a specific locality, or a body of people having something in common, such as fellowship of
interests or other similarity. Such similarities may consist among a society, public, folk, populace, citizenry, family, population, or fellowship. (Barber, 1998, Rodale, 1986).

- The communication with people through songs. What I have always heard a good song does. Goes from the personal to the public, the personal to the group.
- I think that’s what a song can do, is bring people together, no matter what it is saying.
- There is a whole realm of music that soothes and communicates on a personal level in terms of relationships and family and community and there is this broader picture of politics and social change. The camaraderie and the community.
- A tool for learning how to interact with people. Learning how to work in a group process.
- Their learning processes and sharing processes with other people is just as significant.
- And I think that what is so wonderful about a song is that. As human beings our emotions are so similar to each other that. I think we really do like to share with other people that they feel the same way we do. Or have the, have an emotional response to something.
- People request it and we do it and whole audiences sing to each other. And somehow release the discomfort that goes around, being around someone so different from you. Yeah, that to me is the hugest demonstration of how knowledge can be communicated.
- The message behind Sarah McLachlan is not women this and women that. The message behind Lilith festival was her music. She was not up there singing songs
about empowering women. She was singing songs about herself. And that was the power. Because ten thousand people were going, ’I feel that way too’, *Surfacing* or whatever.

- To get together to share music it is a real, intimate, contact.
- Every time I go to Ireland I’m reminded that you can actually have a culture with a common heritage along with a modern stratification of song.
- In most cultures there is no concept of the non-singer or non-performer. Everyone is a singer, de facto. So you get a merging of the values, and a reinforcing of the values of the old people with the wisdom having being translated directly to the young children in the village, or compound wherever you are.
- There are many societies in the world that use song as a daily instrument for work, for play, for history. It even goes back to creating songs that imitate the environment so that you can eat.
- When we go to Bali and see how the music of that culture stems, no only from every age group, but every occupation. To whole villages, whose whole concern is for putting on the dance for the tourists two nights a week. The traditional dance, women and children are practising in the fields. Every person in the village is involved.
- All you can do is filter it through your own voice and express it and in doing that, what you do is you hopefully connect with people. They recognise their own reality in what you are singing, and it becomes a good song. I think of one of the very first popular songs, Stephen Foster’s *Hard Times, Come Again No More* (Appendix 18). In that song what you can learn, is that someone else has gone
through hardship. And so, somehow, that can put you at ease. Or it could be joy in hearing somebody’s hard tale not because it is a hard story but because they are sharing. It is not art for art’s sake. It is about performing to people making them realise they are all those things, they are not alone, and this has happened to other people before.

- You know, one of the things that when the (group name) was freeze-dried for twenty-five years and then re-emerged. One of the things we couldn’t believe was how that music created community. And how that community, unbeknownst to itself, was still there.

- I like interacting with people and this is the most comfortable way for me to do that. Somehow with writing songs it allows me to communicate with a lot of people at one time. So it is very much about community and communication. There you go, there it is, a two-word answer.

- My interest in music is in the heart level, in the learning as a function of valuating experiences that are common. A tool for learning how to interact with people. Learning how to work in a group process.

- All of Peter Seeger, Guthrie, all those guys seem to be about, this is the way we think the world should be run and put into words in such a way as to empower people. Communities were formed around these songs and it became like a battle cry for organisations.

- Like at the Winnipeg Folk Festival every year, they sing the Mary Ellen Carter (Appendix 19) at the end of the festival. This is going to happen, we will rise again, it’s going to happen. It becomes a sort of slogan or battle cry.
They tend to cross social barriers as well.

I have seen the effects it has on different communities when people from outside of their community come to their area and perform their songs. I have seen walls fall down in terms of people’s prejudices and that kind of thing. I have seen people become open to new ideas and sort of, delve into those ideas because of the songs they have heard.

Published interviews support these observations:

- Arlo Guthrie states that “In all of the cultures that we come from, songs were the things everybody did, as well as dances. Most people couldn’t read or write so these songs had to be learned” (Brown, 2001).

- Peter Case adds that “It’s all good sharing experience, strength and hope through music” (Russell & Tyson, 1995, p. 51-52).

From the vantage point of narrative one can construct an identity and find a place in one’s culture (Bruner, 1996). Narrative is a process aimed at creating, sharing, or conveying an understanding of an idea, a desire, a command, an action, a feeling, etc. (Mitchell, 1991). Upon hearing others’ stories individuals can become involved in the story and augment their knowledge with the experience of others, (Gillette, 1990, cited in Cassidy, 2001).

Sharing a portion of one’s life story serves as a means of inclusion, inviting listeners along on another journey (Witherell, Tran & Othus, 1995, cited in Cassidy, 2001). Music is a collective human activity, (Lovering, 1998; Morris, 1999; Theberge, 1995). Music and song set up a kind of magnetic field that brings people together across linguistic, cultural, and geographic borders and put into play unexpected and expanding possibilities (Elliot, 1995; Stokes, 1994; Wald & Junkerman, 1999). It is a demonstration of culture and of the human
need to communicate our ideas, concepts, and feelings as well as give access to human
history (Bowen, 1998; Elliot, 1995; Fowler, 1996; Jadnak, 2000; Hart, 1990; Murrillo, 1995;
Neuenfeldt, 1997; Street, 1993; Wolfenshon & Williams, 1993).

Musical activities can stimulate gathering, exchanging, sharing, and friendship, as
well as strengthen values of mutual respect and solidarity (Atiali, 1985; Crafts, Cavicchi &
Keil, 1993; Frith, 1996; Morris, 1999; Murrillo, 1995). However, while music is a universal
language that can bring people together, it can also be the opposite. It has the potential to be a
“private personal language that holds a group together and separates it from outsiders” (Wald
& Junkerman, 1999, p. 19). For example, it “is the glue that keeps communities from
disintegrating and, with its ability to adapt and absorb new influences, can be many different
things: a nostalgic family heirloom, a proud statement of identity, or simply what brings
people together” (Wald & Junkerman, 1999, p. 19). The preservation of traditional forms of
communication and social change are not mutually exclusive.

Traditional communication methods, such as music, can be important channels for
facilitating learning, behavioural change, peoples’ participation, and dialogue for
development (Carter, 1994). Music’s power to evoke its emotive force as both an individual
experience and a representation of community fellowship makes it a pre-eminent symbol for
communities such as nations, ethnic groups, and subcultures (Atiali, 1985; Denisoff, 1972;
Dunaway, 1987; Dunson, 1980; Engel, 1968; Frith, 1996; Kranjca & Greenspoon, 1997;
Lull, 1992; Morris, 1999; Orman, 1984). Music in most parts of the world is woven into the
social fabric of everyday life, and is valued primarily for its extra-musical meanings. In many
societies music is not an independent art form to be enjoyed for its own sake, but is an
integral part of the culture. As previously mentioned, music and song may accompany a
variety of social and cultural activities (Elliot, 1995; Gregory, 1997; Hart, 1990; Higgins, 1997; Tolbert, 2001; Walker, 1990). “It enhances the significance of all the important way stations of life, from birth through initiations to death. You can hear it in the marketplace, in the fields, and at night when the moon shines and when it doesn’t shine” (Hart, 1990, p. 196). Even the most technologically advanced societies will not conduct certain cultural rites without some suitable music or song (Walker, 1990).

**Theme 4: Embody Emotion**

**Category: Expression**

Participants in this study uniformly viewed music and song as a form of self-expression that connected with other human beings. Songs were viewed as a means of sharing deeply felt thoughts, ideas, and experiences with others. In this study, expression is characterised as putting thought or opinion into words in order to make it apparent to others. Expression is also referred to as meaningful, significant, or thoughtful verbalisation, utterance, or communication such as informing, telling, or providing an explanation or description. In reference to music and song, expression focuses on the act of expressing feeling, emotion, passion, spirit, depth, intensity, power, or force (Barber 1998; Rodale, 1986).

- It is such a compelling means of expression.
- It unlocks something. They are able to articulate something.
- If you are trying to get inspired just because you have got a feeling, you got to say what that feeling is.
• Songs express something that you are finding hard to express. It becomes a vehicle that really shines or resonates when you try to express yourself.

• It’s when someone has put into words something that you have only thought about and never put into words. Like you feel, not so alone.

• And I think that what is so wonderful about a song is that. As human beings our emotions are so similar to each other that. I think we really do like to share with other people that they feel the same way we do. Or have the, have an emotional response to something.

• Oh my god your song sums up exactly how I was feeling, I can totally relate to what you are feeling. Or that totally brings up a feeling inside of me. There is something totally satisfying about being able to do that.

• The message behind Sarah McLachlan is not women this and women that. The message behind Lilith Festival was her music. She was not up there singing songs about empowering women. She was singing songs about herself. And that was the power. Because ten thousand people were going, ’I feel that way too’, Surfacing or whatever.

• The communication with people through songs. What I have always heard a good song does, goes from the personal to the public. The personal to the group.

• It’s an emotional expression. It’s a vehicle to vent emotions, to describe them, to give them a voice, to deal with them.

• It is definitely about self-expression.

• I write silly little protest songs about health care and people just eat it up, ‘cause they need it and I use laughter. Because they feel the same way. The point is to
make them think about what is happening. I always try and write satire that has got a message within it and it is usually a social justice kind of message.

- People just need to be shown or have their choices articulated, so that they can have a choice. Songs can help to open their eyes.
- We are pretty specific about the messages we want to give them and we really shake down our songs and our albums, to be sure that the messages are compassionate, and kindness, intelligent, non-condescending content, stimulating, provocative. And we hold every song that is put on an album up to that standard and jostle it around until it hits that mark.

Humans invented the arts to serve expressive functions through which insight, imagination, and feeling can emerge (Eisner, 1992). Song is a natural and instinctive means of self-expression (Scholes, 1955). Its power lies in its ability to symbolically express personal and cultural feelings, and identity (Edgar & Sedgewick, 1999; Langer, 1952, cited in Masterson, 1994; Scholes, 1955; Street, 1993).

**Category: Emotion**

Emotion is closely connected to expression. All participants in this study referred to the impact of emotion and feelings in their songs and the songs of others. For the purpose of this study, emotion is defined as a strong mental or instinctive feeling, sentiment, sensation, affect, response, or reaction such as love, sorrow, passion, or fear (Barber, 1998; Rodale, 1986).

- When a song has made an impact it’s when it hits me emotionally.
- I think the passion and the feeling are more important than the facts now.
• Song is like, for me, emotional storytelling.

• They make me feel emotions.

• It’s really pushing our buttons. It is really altering the way we feel inside.

• I remember him saying that as shallow and stupid as the songs were, they just sent chills through his body. He remembers loving them so much. They were so exciting and so thrilling.

• We talked about how words and music go into your brain about the emotional thing is perhaps even the most important thing. It’s that you can touch people emotionally, and that just blows me away. It constantly happens to me, where a piece that I have written or a piece that I have just performed, that I didn’t write, will touch people enough that people will come up to me. They will be in tears, or they’ll divulge things about their personal life to me, that they trust me enough with, because I sang a song that touched them. It goes straight, it goes past the way I look, they way they look, our incomes, or nationalities, it goes all past that. It goes right to their hearts.

• Song is my connection, sometimes to heart and soul. Other people’s songs connect me with my own heart and soul and my own songs are ways of expressing things which haven't been expressed in other ways and would not get expressed if they were not in song.

• Songs have the ability to reach into people’s hearts. The non-spoken language of music can have a great emotional affect on someone and draw them into something that they might not otherwise be drawn into simply because of the way it is presented.
• Songs of course have this wonderful combination of the lyrical content and the intellectual communication involved in that and this ethereal, emotional, mood of the music that creates an emotional response in someone that is beyond intellectual. That feeling. To marry those two so that the music becomes this vehicle for the words and therefore the meaning of what’s being communicated to really sink into a listener’s psyche and being.

• I find it interesting that people listen to the music that they need to listen to. For instance if they are suffering, if they are in pain, they will listen to the music that will make them cry, and make them feel that pain. They don’t listen to something that will distract them or cheer them up. It is so powerful that way. Everybody uses music that way.

• I think that a song is an extraordinary means of instruction about emotional state about any subject. You can take a song and you can teach anything you want to teach and often in a more effective way than when there is no music. I think that songs are an extraordinary medium for expressing lots.

• You got these guys from Nashville who can carve a song so purdy. And you walk away and you feel like you have just heard, you just ate cotton candy. And then some old dirt farmer will walk up and gets up there and sings a song that just drills you.

• Incredibly magical, about all of a sudden being able to write a song. Play it for somebody and see that they have the same response. You know?

• There is something about the conciseness of a song and its ability to render emotional, human, even mystical realities that cuts through a well written song,
will cut to the heart of a matter much more quickly. So, in my adolescence I was
listening to people like Joan Baez and Bob Dylan in the early Sixties. For instance
I would go “oh right, that’s how I feel about that issue.”

- There is a joy in writing songs, that is pretty much about as good as it gets for me.
- I think that for me song-writing is very much an internal thing. It’s really cool. It
  feels good.
- I have songs that I have a hard time playing because I get emotional and they
  break me up. I love it.
- I will write a song not thinking about what I’m writing about and then a few
  weeks later I will be listening to it and I will be really impacted by what I was
  feeling that day. What I must have been feeling when I wrote those lyrics or
  whatever.
- I think as artists who are writing we feel, that we have the ability, anyway, to
  write down how we feel put into it music and present it to people.
- People request it and we do it and whole audiences sing to each other. And
  somehow release the discomfort that goes around, being around someone so
  different from you. Yeah, that to me is the hugest demonstration of how
  knowledge can be communicated.
- Learning about how you can heal yourself. I get letters all the time from people
  who say ‘I was in a depression, I didn’t know where my life was going and then
  somebody gave me your album and it has given me the courage to keep going.’
  ‘And when you said, blah, blah, blah, I realised that’s the part I am missing and
that I am willing to look at.’ In the last twenty years, I have had that letter in some form or another, hundreds and hundreds of times.

- When they describe how it affects them. It again tells me that this is what you need to be doing. It’s just so many aspects of it that are so affirming, in every sense of the word.

- That CD has been used to work with nurses who are considering working in palliative care and how to communicate feelings.

- Osmotic change that can happen to people through the process of using music to heal. It allows them to feel what they need to feel as opposed to other things that might distract them in their pain. From a psychological sense there is that need to experience the pain in order to get through it.

- Like you feel, not so alone. You know?

- I mean listening to lyrics, and listening to the whole body of a song. Songs took on much more importance of being educational or directive. As sort of, in a consoling way, or sort of helped me through life.

- It never ceases to amaze me about how songs can affect people. I wrote this song called *Your Parents*. I did that song in a pub. Just in a pub you know. I didn’t think anyone was listening. He came up after and he said that he had heard it on the Early Edition on CBC radio and he was dry-walling at the time. And he stopped, he said he had to stop dry-walling because he started crying and he couldn’t stop. This was like a big burly guy, you know? He was telling me this and he was obviously, he said. ‘I wish I could create something like that, as beautiful as that in my life. One time. Because that was just beautiful’ or
something. He looked like the kind of guy who would kill me if I touched his beer.

Published interviews confirmed the previous comments”

- Guy Clark (1992) explains “It’s about emotions, not the details. That’s been true forever, since Greensleeves (Appendix – 20). I’m only responsible for what I feel, but if people connect with it, or it mirrors their experience (or if they want it to), or it makes a difference to ‘em—that’s why I do this, and if I’ve done it right, they’re gonna get it.”

- David Crosby (2000, p. ix) concurs. “Musicians rightfully are entertainers. Our main job is to make you feel good, make your feel something, make you feel.”

Narrative theory puts forth the premise that the facts in a narrative are also associated with context and emotion, which contribute to the meaning of the story (Cassidy, 2001; Carroll, 2001, December; Egan, 1993; McEwan & Egan 1995; Norman, 2000; Rossiter, 1999). Narratives frequently solicit affect that can move individuals to change opinions and understandings, or drive people to action (Brooks & Clark, 2001). For example, personal narratives of hardship and transformation can inspire empathy and admiration in listeners.

From a musical perspective a good performance or song will communicate emotions (Jensen, 2001; Langer, 1952, cited in Masterson, 1994; Liu, 1996 cited in Chase, 2002; Robinson, 1997; Shunker, 1998). “Music forces us to create, reflect, bare our souls, ponder, react, and formulate in ways we have never done before. It’s a powerful language of expression, whether a student is playing or listening to it. They allow us to perceive and respond appropriately to a world rich with emotions and complex social structures” (Jensen, 2001, p. 32). Songs provide opportunities to achieve insights and perceptions that go beyond
our previous level of understanding. They also allow individuals to develop insights and perceptions that would otherwise be inaccessible (Arnheim, 1969, 1974; Banks & Banks, 1998; Bjorkvold, 1992; Bowan, 1998; Breamly, 2000; Eisner, 1997; Eisner & Barone, 1997; Ellis, 1997; Morris, 1999; Richardson, 1997; Taylor, 1994).

The emotional response to music has been one of the most important topics of psychological research but it has also been one of the most difficult topics to study (Hodges, 2000). It is commonly acknowledged that music and song can prompt powerful emotional reactions. These compelling and often overwhelming feelings seem to come from nowhere, influencing our perceptions, affecting our emotions, colouring our moods, and altering our behaviour (Bowan, 1998; Jensen, 2001; Lull, 1992; Shunker, 1998; Walker, 1990; Weinberger, 1998b). It seems that, somehow, music causes changes in the brain that evokes actual emotions (Weinberger, 1998b). Experiments have shown that hearing music affects the biochemistry of the blood, which in turn may cause affective changes, eliciting physical changes to the human system as well as psychological changes (Jensen, 2001; MacKeracher, 1996). However, researchers also recognise that music can produce various emotional responses in different individuals as well as different responses in the same person at different times (Elliot, 1995; Shunker, 1998; Weinberger, 1998b). This important point could have a profound impact for those intending on using song in learning situations. This issue will be dealt with in Chapter VI where the implications of using song for distance adult learning are discussed in more detail.
Theme 5: Stimulate Cognition, Learning & Enlightenment

The theme of cognition, memory, thinking, enlightenment, and learning was the second most frequently coded of the eight themes uncovered. It is also the theme that was supported by the weightiest literature. Since cognition, learning, and enlightenment are so closely interconnected, informants’ comments have been presented collectively prior to the corresponding literature related to cognition, learning, and enlightenment.

Cognition refers to the mental faculties of perception, thought, discernment, enlightenment, intelligence, comprehension, understanding, reason, and memory, as distinct from emotion and volition; or sensation, notion, and intuition (Barber, 1998; Rodale, 1986). Bloom (1956) views cognition as including activities such as “remembering and recalling knowledge, thinking, problem solving, and creating” (p. 2). A more detailed discussion Bloom’s (1956) taxonomy and Cognitive Domain Model will be discussed in Chapter IV. Pomerantz and Benjamin, (2000, cited in Raiskums, 2001, p. 14) define cognition as “Having to do with mental processes such as sensation and perception, memory, intelligence, language, thought, and problem-solving.”

Enlightenment is defined as the act or an instance of enlightening, including the state of being enlightened, or the process of instructing or informing. It also refers to the ability to illuminate or shed light on (an object), or to clarify, describe, tell, demonstrate, or explain a subject or an object. In addition, enlightenment may also refer to the state of giving spiritual knowledge or insight to (a person) (Barber, 1998; Rodale, 1986).

Learning is interpreted as gaining knowledge or skill by study, experience, being taught, or being informed. It may also refer to becoming aware of by information or observation. Synonyms for learning include to comprehend, realise, grasp, cognise, perceive,
ascertain, discover, memorise, and commit to memory (Barber, 1998; Rodale, 1986). Barer-Stein & Draper (2001) extend this line of thinking by stating that the “role of metaphoric thinking is to invent, to create, and to challenge conformity by extending what is known into new meadows of knowing.”

**Category: Cognition**

- Grown-ups aren’t as receptive as kids. They have way more layers of defence and that is why songs cut through that. Because they don’t have their guard up.
- It goes straight to people’s brains.
- They have watched the brain, they watched the chemical loop, they get a jot after a certain [musical] hook or whatever.
- I think that it’s a very ephemeral thing, how we use music. Works its way into a person’s psyche. It can have an affect on how they approach life which is a big part of what, I think, learning is. People use music so much in their everyday life that, I think it works its way in there somehow.
- I think it is one of the best ways to learn. It cuts behind your defence system and it also operates on other levels of your conscious mind. Therefore it can impart to you without you even knowing it.
- They go right into your head. Really, a smash hit pop song is one that just hard wires into your brain.
- It has depth, intellectual depth and emotional depth.
- It is much easier to remember something that way. Than if it were just a statement. So if you put that to music and it reinforces it even more.
I have a lousy memory and yet I can remember song lyrics.

I have a friend who remembers jingles.

It is a way for us to remember things. It taps directly into that. It almost perhaps, goes past the logical part of the brain. It goes straight in. It is very powerful.

You can memorise anything that has a beat. I think that is a really helpful memory. If you take a song about something you are trying to remember, you can always remember it. Because you are using more than just your brain memory. You’re probably using your body memory, like the way your mouth remembers the words, or the rhythm. It’s just a tool. The mnemonic tempo of the song.

It is a reinforcement, it is a way to reinforce things. I mean you put music and words together and it is sort of a lethal combination that locks in our memories.

How many times have you seen somebody ask what the lyrics are to that song? They’ll say it then they’ll sing a bit. They’ll remember a bit if they sing it. They’ll do the download from one side of the brain to the other. Then they’ll say the lyrics. I think that is a deeper place. The music place is a deeper place than the verbal place. If we incorporate it at that level I think that we’ll likely make some progress.

If you have got any kind of musical interest at all, your memory just seems to suck it up like a sponge.

I can listen to music that I listened to twenty-five, thirty years ago and it will take me right to the place where the song owns in my memories. It’s amazing what they remind me of, phenomenal!
Category: Enlightenment

- You can use music as a tool to enhance and enlighten pretty well, anything you chose to use it for.
- Absolutely, that’s what songs are for.
- I think potentially, I think any event, person or thought can be instructive.
- They (songs) can be for content and for entertainment purposes, rhyming, madrigal, all sorts of things.
- A song can have some information in it. But is it any less instructive to have a Britney Spears song incite a whole bunch of political debate about women?
- When people do get together to share music it is a real, intimate, contact, that they have both spiritually and educationally as well.
- It is a matter of definition. If you are saying that a song is instructive.
- I’d like to think that music, because of its unique qualities weaves its way in there to make us think a bit bigger, about life and maybe somehow subtly inspire us.

Category: Learning

- To teach something through a song would be, if it was focused. That would be easy to do.
- Adults are learning if they want to, or choosing to if they have open minds.
- It depends on what they are learning.
- Yes it does depend on what they are learning.
- Are they learning about history, are they learning about something soulful?
- Are they getting over, like are they in therapy?
• I was just thinking as I was running up there that my personal perception is
coloured a bit because in the beginning, for me, music has been the entire vehicle
for my learning.
• Music can do the same thing. It can do the same thing for everyone.

From the perspective of narrative, it is through life stories which are made up of that
which is discovered and created that people come to remember, to know, to construct, and to
maintain their knowledge and understanding of the world (Pradl, 1984; Rossiter, 1999).
Human beings “think, perceive, imagine and make moral choices according to narrative
structures” (Sarbin, 1986, p. 8). Narrative knowledge is concerned with human intention and
meaning, with coherence, and with understanding (Polkinghorne, 1988, cited in Rossiter,
1999), including the cognitive, affective, spiritual, and somatic dimensions of personhood
(Brooks & Clark, 2001). It is believed that the brain organises itself in a storied format
(Bruer, 1993; Bruner, 1985; Connelly & Clandinin, 1990; Ochberg, 1994), which aids us in
interpreting the world, while also providing a unit of meaning that stores and permits
retrieval of experiences within that world (Bruner, 1985; Gundmundsottier, 1995). When we
make sense of the world and of our experiences in narratives we are more likely to recall
items better than in logically organised lists (Bruning, Schraw, & Ronning, 1995; Learning

When considering the arts and learning, there is a growing body of evidence showing
that arts education positively affects other aspects of living and learning beyond the intrinsic
values of the arts themselves (Upitis & Smithrim, 2002a). Eisner (1981, cited in Smithrim &
Upitis, 1996) has written extensively about arts as cognitive activities. He contends that the
senses are essential to concept formation. Several theorists and researchers provide

Elliot (1995) argues that music listening is also a “rich form of thinking and knowing” and a “rich source of self-growth, self-knowledge and enjoyment” (p. 123). A number of researchers have pointed out that there is a specific part of the brain that is set up to process music. They argue that this part of the brain would not exist if it were not important (Blacking, 1973, cited in Hodges, 2000; Carroll, 2001). Brain research has also shown that music is biologically rooted and fundamental to human development (Carrol, 2001, December; Jensen, 2001; Tolbert, 2001). Neurologists have found what appears to be parallels in how musical and linguistic syntax are processed, as well as discovering that musical and language process in the same area of the brain (Catterall, 2002; Maess & Koelsch, 2001, cited in Lems, 2001). Neuro-musical research also supports the idea that music is a unique mode of knowing. It provides a distinctive means of processing and understanding a particular kind of non-verbal information. For example, through music and song we are able to discover, share, express, and know about aspects of human experience that we cannot know through any other medium. The powerful musical insights into the human condition cannot be substituted by any other form of experience (Eisner, 1997; Hodges, 2000).

Meta-analysis studies based on large bodies of research from the fields of education (cognitive skills, academic achievement), social behavioural modification, medical treatment,
social-emotional development, work productivity, and listening preference styles, suggest that music listening can be adapted to many disciplines and learning environments (Carter, 1994; Catterall, 2002; Deasy, 2002; Hallam, 1999; Kariuki & Honeycutt, 1998; Perkins, 1989, 1994, cited in Burton, Horowitz & Abeles, 2000; Scripp, 2002; Standley, 1996).

Other studies have revealed that learning through art forms, such as music and song, is complex and multi-dimensional. Burton, Horowitz & Abeles (2000) have called this process “habits of mind.” They believe that this process is a flexible interweaving of “intuitive, practical, and logical modes of thought” (p. 43). Music and song, offer ways of thinking and ways of representation consistent with the wide range of intelligences identified by Howard Gardner at Harvard (Catterall, Chapleau, & Iwanaga, 2000). Gardner (1983, cited in Smithrim & Upitis, 1996) maintains that even though he describes each intelligence individually, specific intelligences do not exist as separate physical entities, but only as useful scientific constraints. Gardner (1983, cited in Smithrim & Upitis, 1996) adds that, since each of the intelligences is considered to be a cognitive capacity, the implication is that any one of them would result in cognitive growth. Armstrong (1994, cited in Smithrim & Upitis, 1996) explains how multiple intelligences theory applies to various cognitive functions such as memory, problem solving, and other forms of higher order thinking.

Elliot (1995) proposes that since musical works consist of culturally specific values and beliefs, “music listening also involves the cognition of cultural-ideological information” (p. 184). The imagination is inextricably tied to the social world and often made manifest in aesthetic experiences such as music (Carter, 1994; Kazemek & Rigg, 1997). These images created by music are fundamental to learning, understanding (Durant, 1984; Hillman, 1983; Morris, 1999), the creation of ideas (Elias, Jones, & Normie, 1995), and the transfer of
knowledge (Jensen, 2001). “The extensive presence of strong associations between music and other subject areas overwhelmingly is consistent with evidence for positive extra-musical affects of instruction” (Scripp, 2002, p. 133).

Current research now offers a theoretical basis and expanding evidence of how music and song strengthen our integrated sensory, attentional, cognitive, emotional, and motor capacities, as well as our social and personal competencies, which in turn propel our other learning (Catterall, 2002; Fiske, 2001; Jensen, 2000; Scripp, 2002). A recent meta-analysis of 98 studies demonstrated that in diverse fields of application there has been success in using music to affect changes in childrens’ and adults’ behaviour, as well as social-emotional development, as subject matter and as an enhancement to academic achievement (Standley, 1996, cited in Deasy, 2002). The choice of forms of representation used by teachers or instructors to help students understand can have a major influence on what they have an opportunity to learn (Eisner, 1997; Epstein, 1998). Learning tends to be more effective when ideas, information, and knowledge can be learned and stored in both verbal and non-verbal forms (MacKeracher, 1996, p. 93). “Compelling evidence supports the hypothesis that musical arts may provide a positive, significant, and lasting benefit to learners. There is no single piece of evidence, but the diversity and depth of material is overwhelming” (Jensen, 2001, pp. 13-14).

Murphy (1992, cited in Crawford, 1991) observes that there is evidence that songs work on both our long- and short-term memory. Goodale (2000) supports this observation, and contends that songs can serve as a source of mnemonic devices. Music works to aid our memory because the melody, beat, and the harmonies serve as carriers for the lyrical content. That’s why it’s easier to recall the words to a song than those simply spoken (Hodges, 2000;

Several studies suggest that music also plays a role in enhancing academic and social skills by activating processes that make learning last (Dowling, 1993, cited in Jensen, 1998; Smithrim & Upitis, 1996). Jensen (1998; 2001) reports that music primes the thinking process by activating and synchronising neural firing patterns that orchestrate and connect multiple brain sites, increasing both the brain’s efficiency and its effectiveness. There are also suggestions that music has the potential to engage and enhance higher brain activities (Calvin, 1996; Jensen, 2001; Shaw, 2000). Jensen (2001) contends that this has the potential to activate and synchronise brain activity which “correlates to greater learner engagement and efficiency” (p. 28).

Recent American studies report increased academic achievement for students involved in the arts (Catterall, 1998; Catterall, Chapleau, & Iwanga 1999a, 1999b; Deasy, 2002; Fowler, 1996; Hamblen 1993; Hetland, 2000; Luftig, 1995; Murfee, 1995; Music in World Cultures, 1996; Welch & Greene, 1995). Researchers also report that students involved in the arts may exhibit higher academic achievement than their peers who are not involved in the arts (Catterall, 1998; Catterall, Chapleau, & Iwanga 1999a, 1999b; Deasy, 2002; Fowler, 1996; Hamblen 1993; Hetland, 2000; Luftig, 1995; Murfee, 1995; Music in World Cultures, 1996; Welch & Greene, 1995). Much of this research is correlational in
nature, although it is not unusual for researchers and others to go beyond the evidence to make causal claims about the arts and academic achievement (Winner & Cooper, 2000, cited in Upitis & Smithrim, 2002a).

Unlike this study, which is exploratory in nature, Winner and Hetland (2000) stress the need for more rigorously designed, theory-driven, quasi-experimental research, with appropriate comparison groups (cited in Upitis & Smithrim, 2001). They argue that there is a clear need for more rigorous research that addresses the link between the arts and academic achievement, as this type of research has important implications for education and cognitive science (Winner & Hetland, 2000, cited in Upitis & Smithrim, 2001).

Theme 6: Facilitate Transformation

Category: Transformation

Several informants made reference to popular song contributing to or facilitating personal and/or social transformation. For the purpose of this study, transformation is defined as the act or an instance of transforming. To transform is to make a thorough or dramatic change, modification, or renewal in form, outward appearance, character, or to undergo such a change (Barber, 1998; Rodale, 1986).

- I guess that learning, [is] when you are seeking to broaden your internal experience about an issue.
- I would like to think that, generally speaking, the educational role that music plays with adults is to inspire. To make them take more chances with their lives and get outside the box a little bit.
• There are a lot of songs being written that are, or do have, the power to change people’s lives and to educate.

• I have two specific examples, a particular line in a song, that may not be particularly profound but at the time it is relevant to something that is going on in my life that can stick with me. That has happened twice, with two lines. It gave me hope that this may happen in my own life, it was prophetic in a way.

• All of a sudden unformed thoughts would become formed and you would be able to talk about them. You would be able to sing the song and revisit them.

• It became an opera that had no beginning or ending. It was just like this figurative opera, characters coming in and out. Though the chorus was extremely aggressive and negative as it was, it became a celebration.

• I think that songs are less threatening when they are presenting new ideas to people or historical facts to people than textbooks or that kind of thing.

• I think well the *Dawning of the Age of Aquarius* (Appendix 21). It is about enlightenment. It is about transformation of consciousness that needs to happen. I think a lot of people got it. And you know, went, whoa! That’s possible?

• In the hour that we are together, what we are going to do is we are going to empower each other, we are going to entertain each other, and we are going to give a gift to each other, some kind of gift.

• And in the course of an evening, very uncomfortable at first, and over the course of two hours of that music, they were up and dancing, every one of them. That just transformed them. It showed how the music moved them. Not just the memory. Normally it would have been a very unique experience but it was way
more and it was still meaningful. It was boggling. It is still and interesting experiment, twenty-five years freeze-dried.

- *The Internationale* (Appendix 22) you know the song. Absolutely. There is a song that has transformed culture. Or spoken for culture for years.

Published interviews validate the previous comments:

- Steve van Zandt describes songs as a form of consciousness raising. “It’s just to start the discussion about an issue that needs attention” (Crosby, 2000, p. 220).

- Guy Clark discussing his song *Homeless* (Appendix 23) explains that “It’s posing questions without offering an answer (Himes, 2002, p. 78).

- “What can a song do? Some songs help people to forget their troubles. Other songs help people to understand their troubles. Some few songs inspire people to do something about their troubles” explains Pete Seeger (Abod, 1998).

- Seeger (Russell & Tyson, 1995) adds that songs “slip across borders, proliferate in prisons, penetrate hard shells” (p. 79).

Narratives are a valuable transformative tool. They allow individuals to understand the world in a cohesive way and help communicate ideas to others (Gudmundsdottir, 1995). When individuals interpret stories, they enter into a relationship with the characters and/or the teller of the story, and engage with the narrative both at the level of action and at the level of intent (Bruner, 1986). Meaning constructed through narrative is then written and rewritten, revised and enlarged, constructed and reconstructed over time, to accommodate new information, new insights, unanticipated events, changed perspectives, and reformation of our own identity (Brooks & Clark, 2001; Bruner, 1990, 1996; Caffarella, et al., 2000, cited in Raiskums, 2001; Cassidy, 2001; Luckner, & Nadler, 1992; Norman, 2000; Rossiter, 1999).
Narrative accounts of human encounters with mentors, obstacles to be overcome, ordeals to be endured, and prizes to be won seem to fit well with descriptions of transformational learning (Miller, 2000). We are expanded by stories as we enter their construction of the world. Stories have an unsettling role; we can travel in them, and we can set new directions for seeing the world (Booth, 1988; Kirkegaard, 1978, cited in Mitchell, 1991). Narratives are something we learn from, that open possibilities for new perspectives or shifts in current perspectives (Brookfield, 1987, cited in Norman, 2000; Cranton, 1996, cited in Norman, 2000; Mitchell, 1991).

Listening to music is a rich source of self-growth and self-knowledge (Elliot, 1995). It has the potential to initiate critical reflection and transformative learning, by involving very personal and imaginative ways of knowing, grounded in a more intuitive and emotional sense of human experiences (Dirkx, 1997; Kerka, 1997; Schwarzman, 1993). Mezirow (1978, 1991) and Schwarzman (1993) have examined the role that imagination plays in helping individuals transform the ways they see themselves, others, and the world. When competing representations of fundamental concepts are grasped in their relationship to one another, they can be more clearly understood when the learning process is connected with constant reflection upon the meaning of what is being studied (Scripp, 2002). Since songs are a source of human insight and understanding about the world and ourselves, they allow us to connect with the past and help us imagine new possibilities for the future (Wolfensohn & Williams, 1993). Popular music and song have frequently served as an important source of entertainment, moral instruction, social expression, political statement, protest and parody (Balit, 1999; Denisoff, 1972; Dunaway, 1987; Engel, 1968; Goodale, 2000; Hoven & Anderson, 1996; Street, 1993); they can help build on the knowledge and experience of
people, and introduce other choices, viewpoints, and values (Carter, 1994). Elnadi and Rifatt, (1996) argue that such cultural activities can be regarded as a source of self-renewal and a lever of change, since culture can be seen as a bearer of moral, aesthetic, and spiritual values.

The process of learning and entering into unfamiliar examples of music and song promotes our self-examination and personal reconstruction of our ways of thinking and valuing, as well as our relationships, assumptions, and preferences about other cultures and other people (Abod, 1998; Chase, 2002; Elliot, 1994). Songs can provide stimulating experiences that can lead adults to verify or revise existing knowledge (Carr, 1992, cited in Kerka, 1997). Song can also provide paths for individual construction of knowledge that are intuitive, relational, and aural alternatives to analytic and scientific methods (Kerka, 1997).

Theme 7: Exhibits a Spiritual or Transcendental Nature

Informants spoke extensively about the unexplainable mystical, inspirational, spiritual, or transcendental nature of creating songs, as well as the spiritual or transcendental way songs impact listeners. For the purpose of this study, the term transcend refers to being beyond the range or grasp of human experience, reason, or belief; of not being subject to the limitations of the material universe (Barber, 1998). The term spiritual related to the human spirit or soul, or not of physical things. It is also relates to the unearthly, unworldly, ethereal, intangible, supernatural, mystical, transcendental, or metaphysical (Barber, 1998; Rodale, 1986). While there is scant reference to the spiritual, mystical nature of song in the music-related literature, there was sufficient coding in the interviews to warrant its inclusion in this study. Further reference to this characteristic will be made in the succeeding chapters.

- They say that music is the only art that has the word “muse” in it.
• We are drawn to songs in a way we are not drawn to anything else because it stirs an ancient memory.

• But also to lift people’s spirits, to connect people with divinity. However you want to define divinity. To give people hope. To educate people. To make people dance. To entertain solely.

• It has become a window for me to reach other layers because there is no doubt about it, when you muse changes, you know that you’ve got someone else on the line, a totally different energy on the line.

• The process itself is fascinating and mysterious, how songs are created.

• A lot of it is a mystery, a lot of writing or written stuff is mystery. I don’t know why they do it? I just can’t figure it out.

• They give a chance for something mysterious to piece through. When you add the music to it, the emotions are distracted as well. And they are pulled into it. I think that it is just more potent and fiery and give more opportunity for the mysterious to show.

• There is lots of debating about the ownership of songs. Some writers feel like they wrote the song. Whereas, other writers feel like all they did was channel it. It was up in the air somewhere and they just managed to get a hold of it and put it on paper.

• There is the internal process of creating the song which I think most creative people, whatever their discipline is, will say there is almost a state of mind they get into where you think that goes through you rather than being generated from
you. Which is an amazing thing. Most of my work I hear now and I am just in awe that I had anything to do with it.

- I’m still in awe that I could be a vehicle for this. I really don’t take a lot of credit for it. I only take credit for the discipline involved in putting myself in the right place where it can happen. But other than that, it just, I’m lucky.

- I would write a lyric and not have a clue why I wrote it ‘til years later. Perfectly tellin’ me, what it was missing in my equation. And I said it, and now I am hearing it. Three, four, five years down the road. Grown-ups aren’t as quick as kids man. Yeah (laughter). You’ll get it.

- I wrote it probably about fifteen years ago…maybe. Yeah, fifteen years ago. That song is about paradox. It is about being able to hold joy and sorrow, hope and hopelessness, at the same time. I wrote that song, quite aware of what I was doing but I was unconscious on some level. Then the song became a song that I was constantly being asked to do. Over the years the song started to work on me. And I began to understand paradox. Which of course, is the realm of duality that human beings life in. It became in many ways, for me, a mantra that leads my consciousness to be able to tolerate.

- Music is the closest relationship with mystery that I can have. Writing a song, when it’s right, you know that you have packed into a cosmic vein that is flooding you with the blood of the universe, if you like. There is nothing like it. There is nothing more beautiful to know that you are contacting the luminous in some form.
The previous comments relating to the mysterious or spiritual nature of song origins are not unique to the informants interviewed in this study; similar comments have been echoed by other artists.

- Sting (Russell & Tyson, 1995, p. 109) contends “Music is probably the oldest religious rite. Our ancestors used melody and rhythm to co-opt the spirit world to their purposes—to try and make sense of the universe.”

- “I just pull them down, and when I feel that they are there, I try to put them into something and make them and shape them into songs” explains Donovan (Russell & Tyson, 1995, p. 86).

- “I’m a radio receiver. I do not know where the songs are coming from, but they are all out there, and they just come in,” says John Stewart (Russell & Tyson, 1995, p. 86).

- “I’m the antenna. You just stick your finger in the air and you grab a bit of it” remarks Keith Richards (Russell & Tyson, 1995, p. 86).

- Jimmy Webb (Russell & Tyson, 1995, p. 86) explains how “Ideas really flow through the air. I’ve seen it too many times to call it a coincidence. Creative thought must be so incredibly strong and vital that it must be like a radio transmitter.”

- Willie Nelson (Russell & Tyson, 1995, p. 87) adds “Powerful thoughts and sounds are always passing through us in radio waves, and what we must do is learn to listen.”

- Guy Clark (Himes, 2002, p. 80) maintains “That’s the challenge of songwriting. You have to be open to unexpected, unruly eruptions from the subconscious, but
you also have to do the hard work of shaping those stray feelings into a story that will trigger the same feeling in someone else.”

Spirituality is one of the processes individuals use to construct knowledge and meaning, and is an important aspect of human experience. Spirituality is about one’s personal belief and experience of a higher power or higher purpose (Tisdell, 2001, p. 1). Narratives have the potential to exhibit a spiritual or transcendent nature in as much as narrative knowing is concerned with human intention and meaning, with coherence, and with understanding (Polkinghorne, 1988, cited in Rossiter, 1999). This includes the cognitive, affective, and spiritual dimensions of person-hood (Brooks & Clark, 2001). This transcendent nature works in concert with the affective, the rational or cognitive, and the unconscious (Tisdell, 2001). Lerner (2000, cited in Tisdell, 2001) discusses how spirituality has the capability to inform work in education without pushing a religious agenda. He presents an approach he calls “an emancipatory spirituality” (p. 174), that recognises the value the many manifestations of spirit within different cultures and traditions.

Transcendence goes beyond the perceived limits of physical, cognitive, social, and emotional experience, and moves towards deep transformation of personal beliefs and practices (Csikszentmihalyi, 1997, cited in Upitis & Smithrim, 2002a). Spirituality has also been related to personal and social transformation (Horton & Freire, 1990; Tisdell, 2001), as well as nurturing the soul (Palmer, 1998, cited in Tisdell, 2001). Walters and Manicom (1996, cited in Tisdell, 2001) note that spirituality or transcendence “is a theme that is increasingly significant in popular education practice as culturally distinct groups, women recovering ‘womanist’ traditions and ethnic collectives, draw on cultural and spiritual symbols in healing and transformation education” (p. 13).
Music and song have the ability to “break through the crust of conventionalised and routine consciousness” (Dewey, 1934, cited in Dickinson, 1997). In research designed to ascertain the distinct contributions of the arts to learning, Csikszentmihalyi (1997, p. 25, cited in Upitis & Smithrim, 2002a, & Upitis, Smithrim, Patteson, MacDonald & Finkle, 2003) describes the transcendent dimension as “the very real feeling we have after an aesthetic encounter that some kind of growth has taken place, that our being and the cosmos have been realigned in a more harmonious way.”

Theme 8: Overcome Distance

This theme evolved from a specific question that was addressed to each informant. Each informant was asked if they had any thoughts or insights with regard to the possibility or potential of transferring the qualities or characteristics that they had previously identified to a situation where individuals or groups were not face-to-face. None of the participants interviewed saw distance as being a problem. In fact, they uniformly agreed that popular song was better suited to overcoming distance than other forms of communication.

Dictionary meanings refer to the condition of being far off, far away, or remote. It may be a space or interval between two things, such as an interval of time. Synonyms related to distance include expanse, spread, inaccessible, separate, or apart (Barber, 1998; Rodale, 1986). As previously referred to in Chapter One, there seems to considerable debate regarding just what distance learning means (Calder, 2000). There seems to be no one definition of distance learning; rather, there are many approaches to defining the term (Commonwealth of Learning, 2000a). One commonality is that all of the various definitions include separation of teacher in time and place, or in both time and place. The learner is not
constrained to be physically present in the same location as the teacher (Commonwealth of Learning, 2000a; Shin, 2000, cited in Raiskums, 2001). In addition, McIssac and Gunawardena (1996) add that distance education is a process that covers the teaching-learning activities in the cognitive, psychomotor, and affective domains of an individual learner and a supporting organisation. Moore & Kearsley (1996) concur, stating that “distance education is planned learning that normally occurs in a different place from teaching and as a result requires special techniques of course design, special instructional techniques, and special methods of communication” (p. 2).

- It is not dependent on people being in any particular place or with anyone.
- I think it is better, one of the best mediums for communicating while not being face-to-face.
- But I’ve sat in front of my ghetto-blaster and balled my eyes out and had like really revelations. So I think that it doesn’t have to be face-to-face.
- No time or space there. I would say that is the power of it. I have been nailed by listening to the radio.
- Radio does it. Records do it.
- If you listen to my music and I am not there that means on a CD. You can listen to whatever message is in that music.
- You could have an audio recording.
- If you are into music and you are a good listener you could to it just by listening to the recordings. Most of the better, it seems, recordings today have all the lyrics supplied too.
So yeah, absolutely, that is one of the things we have the Internet, you can convey music as well, we have CD’s there is all kinds of media right out there now.

From the perspective of me being able to flip on the Internet and listen to music from all over the world or go and buy CD’s from people from all over the world. I don’t think that the contact between the songwriter and the person listening to the song is all that important any more. Sometimes that is the best way to present a group of songs I am sure, but it is not necessary at all.

So my feeling is that music, it stirs something, so that you don’t need to be there. We have all had the experience of somebody sending you, or you sending somebody, or hearing a song that reminds you of somebody, touched by it, and you have called them.

That album *Serenade at the Doorway*. It’s been really interesting how, for instance, a mother will send the album to her daughter and say ‘As I am dying of cancer I want to share with you my heart and this album expresses it for me.” You know?

The recorded medium is just as powerful as a performance. It is probably more powerful because more people can get it. Radio, you can play something on the radio and it can reach masses of people. No I don’t think that you have to be performing in front of people. If it wasn’t for recording your songs and getting your songs out there on CD’s and on to the radio no one would hear them.

It doesn’t matter if they are standing in front of you watching you do it, or write it, or watching you speak it out loud. It doesn’t matter. They can get the same
message a million miles away. We get emails from people in Japan and Australia. They get it.

- No, I don’t think the writer has to be around at all. If it is a good song you don’t have to explain anything about it. It just is, just all there. It says it itself.
- Once it is written, if it is a good one, it goes on without you. You are not even need in the process anymore.
- You mean if you like, send somebody a song and then they? Oh yeah, totally. I think that is completely possible. It is like sending a case study. It is just as comprehensive, it is just as full of information.
- So it is almost built into music, that it is a distance teaching learning, medium. It can go anywhere in the world. If the song is strong enough then it will go out on its own. It’s sort of like children. They leave you. If they are really good. Then they leave you and exist outside you.
- That is one of the magic’s of songwriting, in that, it not only transcends personal contact of the person who wrote the song but it transcends that person’s life as well. We still listen to a lot of songs that were written by dead people and it is one of the few real contacts that we have of the past, that remains honest and remains real in terms, of perhaps, in what the person who wrote the song was trying to get across about their situation.
- These old folks who have been singing them and they have been passed down from generation to generation. I feel so lucky to be able to buy this, these field recordings, listen to you know thirty different examples of an old Cajun or Creole
song that dates back to, whenever. We have access to find out what kinds of things people were singing about.

- I’ve learned so much from so many different people that have written songs and carry their songs around the world.

- That is the whole beauty of it! I mean it is one of the few, I mean I can’t include other forms of media because they have such a shallowness to them. But the fact that the music can be in all its glory and everything that the creator intended. The creator of the music, can be right there. In your car. In your living room. Wherever, in your ears when you are walking around. It travels everywhere without the creator having to be there. It is just a miraculous thing. It is one of the reasons it is so powerful.

Published interviews validate the previous comments:

- All of a sudden you have a technology that makes it possible for people to hear over long distances what is going on in one place not only at the same time, but at different times with recorded music—Arlo Guthrie (Brown, 2001).

An examination of the use of popular narrative song and distance learning will be examined in more detail in succeeding chapters related to adult learning theory.

Summary

In summary, the nature of popular narrative song emerges as a complex phenomenon with many interrelated qualities and characteristics. These themes and categories will provide the elements that will be compared and contrasted to distance adult learning in the next chapters. Applying Grounded Theory methodology to Educational Criticism description and
interpretation, the following themes related to popular narrative song were uncovered. They include song as a means of communication; reflects human experience; fosters community; embodies emotion; stimulates cognition, enlightenment and learning; facilitates transformation; exhibits a transcendent or spiritual nature; and overcomes distance.

The next step of this study will render judgement on the educational value of the themes that have been discovered relating to the phenomenon of popular narrative song and several theories of adult learning.
CHAPTER V
EVALUATION

“To raise new questions, new possibilities, to regard old problems from a new angle requires creative imagination and marks real advances.” (Albert Einstein)

The third component of Educational Criticism is Evaluation. It is at this step of the criticism process where the researcher renders judgements on the educational value of the phenomenon which has been described and interpreted (Barone & Eisner, 1997). This portion of this study will include an appraisal of the educational potential of popular narrative song placed in the context of distance adult learning. In addition, this component of the study marks a return to the literature (Dick, 2000) related to adult learning, in an attempt to determine in what respect and how the findings of this study relate to the context of distance adult learning.

It has been argued that the literature and principles related to adult education can provide distance educators with a better understanding of the characteristics of their learners and the processes of learning (Blum, 1999; Brookfield, 1986; Brundage & MacKeracher, 1980; Clark & Verduin, 1991; Collins, 1998; Dewar, 1996; Evans & Juler, 1992; Evans & Nation, 1989; Evans & Nation 1992; Hayes, 1990, cited in Collins, 1998; Merriam & Brockett, 1997; Moore & Thompson, 1990; Nania, 1999; Smith, 1982; Williams, 1993; Zemke & Zemke 1988). By keeping these characteristics in mind, distance educators can then design worthwhile activities for these learners and select appropriate resources to facilitate their learning (Blum, 1999; Clay & Grover, 1995; Dewar, 1996; Hayes, 1990, cited in Collins, 1998; MacKeracher, 1996; Moore & Thompson, 1990; Clark & Verduin, 1991, as cited in Blum, 1999).
As I analysed the interviews depicted in Chapter IV, I began to discover
commonalities between the themes that evolved from the analysis and several adult learning
theories. The initial step of the evaluation process of this study was to consult the
Explorations in Learning & Instruction: The Theory into Practice Database (TIP) (Kearsley,
2001), to determine if there were links between distance adult learning theories outlined in
that database and the themes discovered regarding popular narrative song. The TIP database
contains descriptions of 50 theories pertaining to human learning and instruction (Kearsley,
2001). This database served as a foundation for comparing and contrasting adult learning
theory and the themes that have been previously outlined in this study. Only those theories
that were found to be connected in some way to one or more of the themes identified in the
data analysis portion of this study have been included here. The basic principles for each
relevant adult learning theory will be outlined and explained, followed by an indication of the
related theme(s).

Background - Adult Learning

There is no single theory of learning or comprehensive principle of learning that has
been established for adults (Merriam & Caffarella, 1991, cited in Biswalo, 2001). Rather,
what adult educators have to work with is a diverse patchwork of educational purposes and
philosophies, from multiple disciplines, on which to base decisions regarding instructional
strategies to use in adult educational programs (Biswalo, 2001; Collins, 1998; Hayes, 1990,
cited in Collins, 1998). For this reason, adult education has been acknowledged as an
interdisciplinary field, since “adult education knowledge is a unique combination of elements
of knowledge from the varying backgrounds and concerns of the different thinkers, whose
work has contributed to the body of knowledge” (Jarvis, 1987, p. 301, cited in Collins, 1998).
Brookfield (1995) contends that we are very far from a universal understanding of adult learning. “What we do know is that emotions, feelings, knowledge, skills, and physical and mental states all combine in diverse and complex ways in each adult” (Barer-Stein & Draper, 2001, p. xv). Consequently, it is important for distance adult educators to realise that no one discipline has all the answers related to the diversity of adult learners (Collins, 1998), and that they “need to include research outside the educational sciences” when developing instructional strategies for learning (Barer-Stein & Kompf, 2001, p. 165).

Theories of Adult Learning

“A theory explains what has happened in the past, predicts what will happen in the future, and implies ways to control or respond to what is happening in the immediate present” (MacKeracher, 1996, p. 8). Learning theories can contribute to our understanding of the human process of learning, by helping educators summarise, explain, reflect upon, and support or challenge their own experiences (Barer-Stein & Kompf, 2001; Clover, Follen & Hall, 2000; Usher & Bryant, cited in Foley, 1995). Theories also provide educators with a cognitive representation of the real world that allows them to see patterns, provide maps, or pictures of reality (Clover, Follen & Hall, 2000; MacKeracher, 1996; Rich, 1993). Only those theories and principles of adult learning most relevant to the previously identified themes have been examined in this study.

While a concern regarding the use of learning theories which were originally developed for children, then applied to adults, could be raised, Tennant & Pogson (1995) contend that “because age category is a continuum, the boundaries of appropriate behaviour have a measure of uncertainty or ambiguity” (p. 111). They add that the phases of life merge into one another and consist of complex patterns that vary from one individual to another,
rather than progress as a “fixed sequence of stages toward a common goal” (p. 97). In
addition, they explain that childhood as a stage human development is conceived differently,
depending on historical period and social culture. Therefore, because of the ambiguity in
determining where the boundaries between childhood and adulthood lie, I would argue that it
is legitimate to include adult learning theories that have evolved from research into learning
theories developed for children.

Characteristics of Adults as Learners (CAL)

This theory makes an effort to integrate other theories of adult learning such as
andragogy (Knowles), experiential learning (Rogers), and lifespan psychology. Principles of
this theory that are relevant to this study include:

• Adult learning should capitalise on the experience of participants (theme 2 -
  experience).

• Adults should be challenged to move to increasingly advanced stages of personal
development (theme 6 – transformation).

(Biswalo, 2001; Cross, 1981; Kearsley, 2001).

Andragogy

Knowles emphasises that adults are responsible and self-directed. On that basis, his
theory makes the following assumptions that are relevant to this study.

• Self-directed learning involves gaining an awareness that something needs to be
  learned, e.g., a trigger event (theme 6 – transformation).

• Experience provides the basis for learning activities (theme 2 – experience).
• Adult learning is problem-centred, task- or life-centred (theme 2 – experience; theme 6 – transformation).
• Adults are generally motivated to learn due to intrinsic or internal factors (theme 6 – transformation).
• Self-direction is the dominant means for learning. Individuals take the initiative, with or without the help of others (theme 6 – transformation).


Anchored Instruction

The goal of anchored instruction theory is to create interesting, realistic contexts that encourage the active construction of knowledge by learners. Anchors for all subsequent learning utilise stories that are designed to be explored, and which provoke the kinds thoughtful engagement that help learners develop effective thinking skills that, in turn, contribute to effective problem solving and critical thinking. Anchored instruction is closely related to Situated Learning Theory and Cognitive Flexibility Theory. Principles of this theory that are relevant to this study include (Chen, 2000; Kearsley, 2001; Open Learning Technology Corporation, 1996; Ruzic & O’Connell, 2001):

• Learning and teaching activities should be designed around an “anchor,” which may be some sort of context, such as a case-study, story, adventure, situation, or problem issue (theme 2 – experience).
• Instructional materials should include rich resources (theme 2 – experience).
• Learners need to be provided with opportunities to think about and work on problems (theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.).

• Instruction and exploration occur in a shared environment (theme 3 – community).

Cognitive Domain Model

This theory is based on Maslow’s (1970, cited in Blum, 1999) research, which asserts that humans have a number of needs that are innate. These needs are arranged in hierarchy in terms of their potency. Based on this research, Bloom and his colleagues (Bloom, Englehart, Furst, Hill, & Krathwohl, 1956; Blum, 1999) then developed a taxonomy of Cognitive Domain Model, which suggested that adults have six levels of cognitive learning in a similar hierarchical order. Cognitive is defined as “having to do with mental processes such as sensation and perception, memory, intelligence, language, thought, and problem solving (Pomerantz & Benjamin, 2000, cited in Raiskums, 2001, p. 14). Principles of this theory that are relevant to this study include (Bloom, Englehart, Furst, Hill, & Krathwohl, 1956; Blum, 1999; Kearsley, 2001):

• There are six levels of cognitive learning which include knowledge, comprehension, application, analysis, synthesis, and evaluation (theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.).

• An effective environment allows students to progress through these levels when it allows student self-reflection and understanding (theme 6 – transformation) through discussing the experiences and understandings of others (theme 1 – communication; theme 3 – community).
Cognitive Constructivism Theory

Piaget’s (1929, 1932, 1970) Cognitive Constructivism Theory, initially developed for children, has application to adults in distance learning situations (Blum, 1999). Constructivism is a tradition that emphasises “the way people learn how to construct and deconstruct their own experiences and meanings” (Brookfield, 2000, cited in Raiskums, 2001, p. 16). Based on this theory the idea of cognitive domain is instrumental and is knowledge- or mind-based. Principles of this theory that are relevant to this study include (Blum, 1999; Cerney, 1998, cited in Blum, 1999; Piaget, 1929, 1932, 1970):

• The fact level is a single concept and uses verbs like define, identify, and list (theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.).
• The understanding level puts two or more concepts together like comparing and contrasting (theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.).
• The application level puts two or more concepts together to form something new (theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.; theme 6 – transformation).

Cognitive Flexibility Theory

Cognitive Flexibility Theory supports the assumptions of Constructivist theories proffered by Bruner, Ausubel, and Piaget, and is also related to the work of Salomon (Blum, 1999). As defined in the previous theory, constructivism is based on the premise that the learner constructs his/her knowledge and meaning about a topic or situation (Brookfield, 2000, cited in Raiskums, 2001; Kearsley, 2001; Lancefield, 1999). Cognitive Flexibility Theory is concerned with the transfer of knowledge and skills beyond the initial learning
situation. It stresses the presentation of information from multiple perspectives and the use of multiple case studies that present different examples. The theory is suited to learning in complex and ill-structured areas such as medicine, history, and art (Blum, 1999; Kearsley, 2001). Principles of this theory that are relevant to this study include:

- Learning activities must provide multiple representations of content (theme 2 – experience; theme 4 – emotion).
- Instructional materials should avoid oversimplifying the content domain and support context-dependent knowledge (theme 2 – experience).
- Instruction should be case based and emphasise knowledge construction (theme 2 – experience; theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.).
- Knowledge should be highly interconnected (theme 1 – communication; theme 2 – experience; theme 3 community).

(Blum, 1999; Kearsley, 2001).

Conditions of Learning

This theory specifies that there are different types, classifications, or levels of learning. Each different classification requires different types of instruction, which in turn, require different internal and external conditions. Gagné has identified the following five major categories of learning.

- verbal information (theme 1 – communication),
- intellectual skills (theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.),
- cognitive strategies (theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.),
- motor skills,
Principles of this theory that are relevant to this study include:

- Different instruction is required for different learning outcomes (themes 1 – 7).
- Events of learning operate on the learner in ways that constitute the conditions of learning (themes 1 – 7).
- The specific operations that constitute instructional events are different for each different type of learning outcome (themes 1 – 7).
- Learning hierarchies define what intellectual skills are to be learned and a sequence of instruction (themes 1 – 7).


**Constructivist Theory**

Constructivist Theory is based on the belief that learning is an active process in which learners construct new ideas or concepts based on their own knowledge and experience. Presentation of context is a significant characteristic of teaching adults. According to constructivists, learners gain deep understanding when they act on new information with present knowledge and resolve any discrepancies that arise (Brookfield, 2000, cited in Raiskums, 2001; Kearsley, 2001; Lancefield, 1999). Research suggests that constructivist theory assists in promoting relevancy, student-to-student interdependence, and self-directed learning (Clay & Grover, 1995, cited in Blum, 1999; DeCavalho, 1991, cited in Blum, 1999; Jones, 1997, cited in Blum, 1999).

Principles of this theory that are relevant to this study include:
• Instruction must be concerned with the experiences and contexts that make the student willing and able to learn in a self-directed manner (theme 1 – communication; theme 2 – experience; theme 4 – emotion).

• Instruction should be designed to facilitate extrapolation and/or fill in the gaps (theme 6 – transformation).

• Instruction must be structured so that it can be easily grasped by the student (theme 1 – communication).

• Individuals construct their own understanding of the world as they acquire knowledge and reflect on experience (theme 2 – experience; theme 6 – transformation).


Discovery learning is a theory that is also based on the constructivist approach. Principles of this theory that are relevant to this study include:

• Discovery learning is most useful for higher-order thinking and problem solving (theme 2 – experience).

• Instructors should engage learners (theme 1 – communication).

• Learning activities should be done both independently and collaboratively (theme 3 – community; theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment).

• Information is most meaningful when learners come to understanding on their own (theme 6 – transformation).

(Lancefield, 1999).
Experiential Learning Theory

For Dewey (1930) and Lindeman (1926), all learning is the result of the experience of the learner. Experiential learning consists of “the acquisition of knowledge and skill through the learner’s direct involvement with the realities being studied; it may involve affective, somatic, and rational engagement involving prior or new activities” (Van der Veen, 2000, cited in Raiskums, 2001, p. 30). “A quality experience is one that arouses curiosity, strengthens initiative, and sets up purposes” (Dewey, 1930, p. 38), leading to growth. Experiential learning provides a process that enables learners to draw from their past experiences to acquire new knowledge, skills, and/or attitudes (Schuguresnky, 2001). It can occur when an individual derives a fresh outlook on a problem or issue, by reflecting on an experience or series of events (Stilbourne & Williams, 1996). It is called experiential learning because the change has occurred in the awareness of the learner cannot be ascribed to anything other than the learner’s experience. Experiential education is more than just learning by doing; it values the process of learning as much as the product (Herbert, 1995; Joplin, 1995; Luckner & Nadler, 1992). Experiential learning occurs when individuals engage in an activity, reflect upon that activity, and develop new understanding that can be transferred to other situations (Luckner, & Nadler, 1992). Crew contends that “the best teaching-learning situation is the proper blend of actual and vicarious experiences, of theory and practice, each enriching the other” (1987, p. 147, cited in Wittmer & Johnson, 2000). When effectively and appropriately used, experiential adult education has the power to transform student’s worldviews, move them to critical reflection, and hence action (Wittmer & Johnson, 2000). The narrative perspective has frequently been used to enhance group
learning in experiential education (Cassidy, 2001), in an effort to address problems and potentially initiate social and individual change (Bouchard, 2001).

Carl Rogers’ (1951, 1994) Experiential Learning Theory emerges from his views about psychotherapy and humanistic approach to psychology. He sees experiential learning as being much the same as personal change and growth. He views the role of the teacher to facilitate learning through five phases:

1. setting a positive climate for learning (theme 2 – experience);
2. clarifying the purposes of the learner(s);
3. organising and making available learning resources (themes 1 – 7);
4. balancing intellectual and emotional components of learning (theme 4 – emotion; theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.);
5. sharing feelings and thoughts with learners (theme 4 – emotions) (Kearsley, 2001).

Rogers’ learning theories apply to distance education, in that learning is based on personal growth, self-direction and that the learner is active in the learning process, (Jones, 1997, cited in Blum, 1999).

Principles of this theory that are relevant to this study include:

- Significant learning takes place when the subject matter is relevant to the personal interests of the student (theme 2 – experience).
- Learning which is threatening to the self (e.g. new attitudes or perspectives) are more easily assimilated when external threats are at a minimum (theme 2 – experience; theme 4 – emotion).
- Learning proceeds faster when the threat to the self is low (theme 2 – experience; theme 4 – emotion).
Self-initiated learning is the most lasting and pervasive. (Blum, 1999; Kearsley, 2001; Rogers, 1951; Rogers & Freiberg, 1994).

David Kolb has also contributed to Experiential Learning Theory. His theory is established on the ideas of “experience-based learning provided by John Dewey, Kurt Lewin, and Jean Piaget” (Schugurensky, 2001). It is a theory which is based on the premise that knowledge is created through the transformation of experience. This occurs with the application of the information received by the learner being applied to the experiences of the learner (Bouchard, 2001). Through this process the learner is constantly taking new information and testing against their real-life experiences. Hence, the learner transforms both the information and the experience into new knowledge (Bouchard, 2001; Brookfield, 1995; Jarvis, 1987, cited in Brookfield, 1995; Schugurensky, 2001). The Kolb Cycle consists of four phases:

1. the educator involves the learner in an experience (theme 1 – communication; theme 2 – experience).
2. In the second phase of reflective observation, the learner is then asked to review the experience from many perspectives (theme 6 – transformation).
3. During the third phase of abstract conceptualisation, the learners develop theories and look at patterns (theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.).
4. The final phase is active experimentation where learners suggest ways that they can apply the principles they have learned (theme 6 – transformation) (Schugurensky, 2001).

Principles of this theory that are relevant to this study include:

- Learning is best conceived as a process (theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.).
• Learning is a continuous process grounded in experience (theme 2 – experience).
• Learning requires the resolution of conflicts between dialectically opposed modes of adaptation to the world (theme 6 – transformation).
• Learning is a holistic process (themes 1 – 7).
• Learning involves transactions between the person and the environment (theme 2 – experience).
• Learning is the process of creating knowledge (theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.).

(Bouchard, 2001; Brookfield, 1995; Schugurensky, 2001; Stilbourne & Williams, 1996).

Levels of Processing

According to the Levels of Processing framework, stimulus information is processed by the brain at multiple levels simultaneously depending on its characteristics. The more penetrating the processing, the more that will be remembered. Strong images or many associations with existing knowledge will be processed by the brain at a deeper level. The theory supports the finding that we remember things that are meaningful to us because this requires more processing than meaningless stimuli (Kearsley, 2001).

This theory has potential for applications in verbal learning settings (i.e., memorisation of words) and to reading and language learning (Cermak & Craik, 1979). Principles of this theory that are relevant to this study include:

• The greater the processing of information during learning, the more it will be retained and remembered (theme 1—communication; theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.).
- Processing will be automatic unless attention is focused on a particular level (theme 1 – communication; theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.).

**Multiple Intelligences Theory**

Multiple Intelligences theory is a pluralistic way of understanding the intellect (Kallenbach, 1999). According to Gardner (Gardner, 1982, 1983, 1993a, 1993b), the implication of Multiple Intelligences Theory (MI) is that learning/teaching should focus on the particular intelligence of each individual. Recent research in developmental psychology and neuroscience suggest that an individual’s level of intelligence is made up of autonomous faculties that can work individually or in concert with other faculties (Carvin, 2000; Coustan & Rocka, 1999). The intelligences are languages (metaphorically speaking) that can be tools for learning, problem-solving, and creating (Sherman, 2001). MI theory claims that there are many ways to be smart and it describes what the learner brings to the task to learning (Gardner, 1993a; Viens, 1999). Gardner emphasises the role of context in his theory, as each culture tends to emphasise certain intelligences (Kearsley, 2001; Sherman, 2001; Viens, 1999). As a whole MI approaches can be characterised as constructivist, since they allow students to construct their own meaning through problem solving and the media of their intelligence strengths (Kallenbach, 1999). In addition, MI theory suggests to distance educators that a range of activities should be provided to ensure learners the opportunity to develop abilities in a range of intelligence areas, as well as building on their own unique intelligences (Kallenbach, 1999; Viens, 1999). Principles of this theory that are relevant to this study include:
- Individuals should be encouraged to use their preferred intelligences in learning (themes 1 – 7).
- Instructional activities should appeal to different forms of intelligence (themes 1 – 7).
- Assessment of learning should measure multiple forms of intelligence (themes 1 – 7).
- Intelligences relevant to the themes of this study include: linguistic (theme 1 communication); musical (themes 1 – 7); interpersonal (theme 1 – communication; theme 2 – experience; theme 3 – community; theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.; theme 6 – transformation); intra-personal (theme 1 communication; theme 2 – experience; theme 4 – emotion; theme 6 – transformation; theme 7 – exhibit a transcendent nature).


**Social Development (Constructivism) Theory**

The main idea of Vygotsky’s Social Development Theory is that cultural contexts and social interaction play a fundamental role in the development of cognition (Vygotsky, 1962, 1978, cited in Blum, 1999). “Social Development Theory is complementary to the work of Bandura on social learning and a key component of situated learning theory” (Kearsley, 2001). This theory is an attempt to explain consciousness as the end product of socialisation (Kearsley, 2001). Although the theory of Social Constructivism is a general theory of cognitive development in the context of language learning in children (Vygotsky, 1962), later
applications have been broader (Kearsley, 2001). Reil (1990, cited in Blum, 1999) suggests that this theory has benefits for distance learners, especially for those female students who may prefer to learn in a more connected and collaborative way (Strommen & Lincoln, 1992, cited in Blum, 1999). Principles of this theory that are relevant to this study include:

- Cognitive development is limited to a certain range at any given age (theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.).
- Full cognitive development requires social interaction (theme 1 – communication; theme 3 – community).

(Blum, 1999; Kearsley, 2001; Vygotsky, 1962, 1978;).

**Situated Learning Theory**

Situated Learning Theory is based on the critical component of social interaction (Kearsley, 2001), where knowledge and skills are learned in the contexts that reflect how knowledge is obtained and applied to everyday situations (Stein 1998). It has been seen as a way to relate subject matter to the needs and concerns of learners (Shor, 1987 cited in Stein, 1998). To situate learning means to place thought and action in a specific time and place, to involve others, the environment, and the activities to create meaning. For adults “to situate learning means to create the conditions in which participants will experience the complexity and ambiguity of learning in the real world” (Stein, 1998). To successfully implement this theory, educators must select situations that will absorb the learner in complex, realistic, social environments made up of actors, actions, and predicaments that will support the desired outcome(s). Learners then create their own knowledge based on what they have
experienced in the situation (Kearsley, 2001; Stein, 1998). Principles of this theory that are relevant to this study include:

- Knowledge needs to be presented in an authentic context (theme 2 – experience).
- Learning requires social interaction and collaboration (theme 1 communication; theme 3 – community).

(Kearsley, 2001; Stein, 1998).

**Transformative Learning**

Some researchers and theorists have argued that adults need both informational and transformative learning (Kegan, 2000, cited in Kerka, 2001). Transformational learning attempts to change the how we know by altering our existing frame of reference and our ways of making meaning (Imel, 1998; Kerka, 2001; Taylor, 1998). It can occur “anywhere that the why question is asked” (Scott, 2001, p. 255). Others declare that learning is transformative because it has the potential for developing change (MacKeracher, 1996; Scott, 2001). Learning requiring transformation of previous experience is most effective through the use of facilitating activities such as analogies, simulations, metaphors, case studies, stories, etc. (Fidishun, 2000; MacKeracher, 1996). Through these activities, the learner looks for connections among the ideas generated, then identifies and narrows these through cognitive procedures (MacKeracher, 1996). Understanding the meaning of past experience based on the totality of individuals’ cultural and contextual experiences that influence how they interpret events is a fundamental element in transformational learning. This, in turn, can be used as a base for new learning (Fidishun, 2000; Keegan, 2000, cited in Kerka, 2001; MacKeracher, 1996; Taylor, 1998). Past experience can also be an “unavoidable potential
obstacle” that the learner must deal with when confronted with challenging new experiences or knowledge (MacKeracher, 1996, p. 36). This requires the learner to adopt a questioning or reflective stance which can lead to learning (MacKeracher, 1996). A critical step in the process of transformation involves a questioning of assumptions and a fundamental rethinking of premises based on previous experience (Cranton, 1994, cited in Blum, 1999; Imel, 2000; Kerka, 2001). Transformational learning theory provides a useful framework for determining inner change. It views adult learning as a complex process of “replacing limiting beliefs, and actions with enhanced views of life, work, relationships, and personal potential” (Patteson, Upitis, & Smithrim, 2002a, p. 4). Collectively, the works of Freire, Cunningham, Daloz and Mezirow, among others, speak to the social-cultural and personal extent of transformative learning (Dirkx, 2000). For the purposes of this study, three theories of transformational theory or critical reflection will be examined.

The first is based on the work of Mezirow. According to Mezirow (1990, cited in Blum), adult learning theories should be concerned with facilitating critical reflective and transformative processes, where an individual learns to negotiate meanings, purposes, and values critically, reflectively, and rationally, rather than passively accepting what has been defined by others. Mezirow (1991, 1995, 2000 cited in Patteson, Upitis, & Smithrim, 2002a) describes incremental stages or kinds of transformations. Principles of this theory relevant that are to this study include:

- A new experience (such as a disorienting dilemma) is encountered that demands that the learner examine previous notions of self or life’s possibilities (theme 1 – communication; theme 2 – experience).
• Our meanings (beliefs, attitudes, and emotional reactions) can be transformed by modifying our knowledge, skills or values (theme 6 – transformation).

• Our premises can be transformed by critically reflecting and modifying the process which underlie our meanings (theme 6 – transformation).

• Our perspectives can be transformed by reflecting on and modifying its premises or underlying assumptions. Becoming critically aware of how and why our assumptions have come to constrain the way we perceive, understand, and feel about our world (theme 6 – transformation).

Mezirow’s theory describes a logical learning process that is rational, analytical, and cognitive (Imel, 1998). Through the process of these transformations, a learner’s model of reality is wholly or partially transformed, and their premises are then revised. Meaning transformations occur as this new experience changes the learner’s view of reality. (Fidishun, 2000; Imel, 1998; MacKeracher, 1996; Mezirow, 1991, 1995, 2000 cited in Patteson, Upitis, & Smithrim, 2002a).

The principles of Mezirow’s “line of action” theory that are relevant to this study include:

• Ongoing action (in the learning environment) (theme 1 – communication; theme 2 – experience).

• Problem posing (awareness of trigger event such as a life crises or transition, a disorienting dilemma, or an accumulation of transformation in meaning schemes over a period of time) (theme 1 – communication; theme 2 – experience; theme 4 - emotion).
• Critical Reflection (self-examination, critical assessment of assumptions, recognition that others have shared similar transformations) (theme 2 – community; theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.; theme 6 – transformation).

• Perceptual interpretation (development of a plan for action, acquisition of knowledge and skills for implementing the play) (theme 5 – cognition; theme 6 – transformation).

• Empirical validation by means of the senses (tryout of the plan) (theme 4 – emotion).

• New interpretation (development of competence and self-confidence in new roles, reintegration into life on the basis of new perspectives) (theme 6 – transformation).


Brookfield (1995) offers a theory of transformation that has many similarities to Mezirow. Brookfield states that critical reflection is context or domain-specific and may be associated with certain personality characteristics. The following five phases of Brookfield’s (1995) critical thinking theory consist of the following principles that are relevant to this study:

• Critical thinking begins with a trigger event prompting a sense of inner discomfort or perplexity (theme 1 – communication; theme 2 – experience; theme 4 – embody emotion).

• This is followed by a period of scrutiny (theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.; theme 6 – transformation).
Then the learner begins a search for new explanations (theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.; theme 6 – transformation).

The learner then explores and tests alternative perspectives among the new perspectives, to make sense of the new situation (theme 5 – cognition; theme 6 – transformation).

Finally, there may be a process of integrating the new perspectives, the self-concept may be strengthened as a result of this re-integration process (theme 6 – transformation).

(Brookfield, 1995; Neufeld, 2001).

Another view of transformative learning theory is based on analytical or depth psychology has been put forth by Boyd (1989, 1991; Boyd & Myers, 1988). It focuses on deeper emotional and spiritual dimensions of learning that are underdeveloped in dominant conceptions of transformative learning (Dirkx, 2000; Imel, 1998; Merriam & Caffarella, 1999). Boyd’s research on the nature of adult learning is reflected in a commitment to comprehending the emotional, psychosocial, and spiritual dimensions of learning. His work is based on a belief in the powerful role that the unconscious plays in shaping human thoughts, feelings, and actions (Boyd, 1989; Dirkx, 2000; Taylor, 1998). Boyd’s theory recognise the powerful feelings, emotions, and affect that arise within individuals’ learning experiences, that in turn draw attention and energies to unconscious issues or concerns seeking to gain voice (Dirkx, 2000). The process of discernment is central to this view of transformative learning (Boyd & Myers, 1988). Discernment calls upon extra-rational sources such as symbols, images, fantasy, myth, stories, poetry, rituals, performing arts,
imagination, and feelings (Boyd & Myers, 1988; Cranton, 1994, cited in Imel, 1998; Dirkx, 2000). Principles of this theory that are relevant to this study include:

- Images represent our imaginative engagement with the world at an unconscious level, deep-seated emotional or spiritual issues, and concerns which are not known or knowable through words alone (theme 1 – communication; theme 2 – experience; theme 4 – emotion; theme 7 – transcendent / spiritual).

- Images may also be evoked or activated through emotionally laden aspects of interactions with others or with the text being studied (theme 1 – communication; theme 2 – experience; theme 3 – community; theme 4 – emotion).

- Emotions and images are given voice, expression, and elaboration (theme 4 – emotion; theme 6 – transformation; theme 7 – transcendent / spiritual).

- Imaginative engagement with the images and symbols accompanied by critical reflection provide a deeper understanding of self and relationships to the world occur. This engagement reflects an ongoing dialogue between ego consciousness and unconsciousness (theme 6 – transformation; theme 7 – transcendent / spiritual).

- Transformative learning leads us back to the soul. The learner focuses on images which represent powerful motifs at an unconscious level, revealing deep-seated emotional or spiritual issues and concerns. (theme 6 – transformation; theme 7 – transcendent / spiritual).

There are a number of commonalities connecting the preceding theories of transformation. These include humanism, emancipation, autonomy, communication, discourse, critical reflection, equity, self-knowledge, and participation (Dirkx, 2000; Imel, 1998; Kerka, 1997b).

**Feminist Learning**

Feminist learning theory includes all of the components of adult and transformational learning but takes them further. Feminist learning theory is labelled as feminist since it has evolved from gender-based studies on how women learn (Clover, Follen & Hall, 2000; Tisdell, 1993). It encourages other ways of looking at social issues and problems and seeing them through the eyes of women or others (including men) who view things differently or who face marginalisation (Clover, Follen, & Hall, 2000). Research has borne out that many women have different ways of knowing (Belenky, Clinchy, Goldberger & Tarule, 1986; Cross, 1981, cited in Blum, 1999; Blum, 1999; Tisdell, 1993) and communicating (Labov, 1966; Goodwin, 1980; Trudgill, 1972, cited in Blum, 1999; Tisdell, 1993). Many women also have different experiences in traditional education (Spertus, 1992, cited in Blum, 1999; Tisdell, 1993), and as a result have different learning needs from men (Tisdell, 1993). Adult educational principles, transformational learning theory, and feminist learning theory do share vital values and approaches which relate to establishing an environment of mutual trust and respect, and focusing on the concerns and interests of learners (Mackeracher, 1996, 2001). Principles of this theory that are relevant to this study include (Belenky, Clinchy, Goldberger & Tarule, 1986; Blum, 1999; English, 1999; Kerka, 1993; Mackeracher, 2001; Tisdell, 1993):
Focus of attention. Feminist pedagogy calls for a focus on the individual and her personal real-life experiences as well as the collective experiences of women (theme 2 – experience; theme 3 – community).

The way learners establish personal learning objectives. Individuals are encouraged to identify the connection between their identity and their concerns, and are encouraged to question just what they want to learn and how they wish to learn (theme 2 – experience; theme 6 – transformation).

Emphasis on maintaining a holistic connection between thinking and feeling, experience and ideas, theory and practice, reflection and action (themes 1 – 7).

Feminist theory hopes to facilitate other connected learning, whereby learners see themselves as creators of knowledge and builders of theory constructed from experience, and by relating new knowledge to experience in the context of relationships (theme 2 – community; theme 3 – experience; theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.).

Transformation and evaluation as valued processes (theme 6 – transformation).

Holistic Learning

Transformative learning has been criticised as a process that is overly dependent on critical reflection, such that it reduces the role of feelings and overlooks change through the unconscious development of thoughts and actions (Taylor, 2001). Alternatively, holistic learning theory recognises the interconnectedness of body, mind, emotions, and spirit (Hayes, 1989; MacKeracher, 2001; OISE, 2002). Griffin (2001) asserts that through holistic learning it possible that learners can learn to use a greater range of their natural capacity.
Griffin explains that the more of our senses, sight, hearing, smell, taste, and touch that “we can use in learning the more likely we are to understand and remember it” (p. 116). She argues that, since we are feeling beings before we are thinking beings, emotions can play the primary role in enabling our learning and the cognitive aspects of learning are more passive. Based on this reasoning, she contends that the ideal learning situation should begin with an emotional nuance (Griffin, 2001). Principles of this theory that are relevant to this study include:

- **Rational learning** - the capability we are most familiar with and have the most experience with, where we assume that learning is a rational, intellectual, and logical activity. (theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.).

- **Emotional learning** - acknowledging and accepting that emotions play a role in learning, and are considered valuable in aiding the learning process. This includes accurately naming the emotion, accepting them, and then taking steps for change, so our learning can have personal meaning (theme 4 – emotion).

- **Relational learning** - recognising that learning is enhanced through relationships with others (theme 3 – community).

- **Physical learning** - realising that learning can be enhanced or inhibited by our physical state. Griffin explains that the more of our senses, (sight, hearing, smell, taste, and touch) that “we can use in learning the more likely we are to understand and remember it” (Griffin, 2001, p. 116) (theme 1 – communication; theme 5 – cognition, enlightenment, etc.).

- **Metaphoric learning** - learning can be enhanced through symbol, metaphor, intuition, stories, poetic analogies, and narrative thinking. Its role is to invent, to
create, and to challenge conformity. It is different from the rational mind in the way it perceives information, the information it perceives, the way it processes information, the way it retrieves information, and the way it expresses itself (theme 1 – communication).

• Spiritual learning - accepting a deep sense of awe of the present and the potential of persons or nature. It is a connection with everyone and everything. Spiritual awakening and transformation allow individuals a glimpse of reality beyond the logical, rational and physical world. New perceptions are accompanied by strong emotions. New patterns of understanding are created and values change. Individuals become more open to transpersonal values ethical, aesthetic, heroic, humanitarian, altruistic, and creative. Spiritual learning may take many forms dependent on each individual (themes 1 - 7).


Summary

It is evident that the themes discovered relative to popular narrative song do have relationship to some adult learning theories. The connection with each theory clearly varies. For some theories there is only connection with one theme, whereas others, such as Transformational, Feminist, and Holistic learning, the connection is widespread. As well, there is also the issue of the interconnectedness among several of the theories listed that contributes to a degree of repetitiveness.
Adult learning is an activity that is constant across many settings, and is the cement holding together a field that is diverse in content, clientele, and delivery systems (Merriam, 1993; Hayes, 1990, Collins, 1998). Brookfield (1995) states that culture, ethnicity, personality, and political ethos assume great significance in explaining how learning occurs and is experienced.

No single theory of adult learning provides a comprehensive picture of adult learning; however, each adds another dimension, thus expanding the basis for understanding the complex and dynamic process of adult learning. Learning is more complex than simple explanations allow. Catterall (2002, p. 156) declares that future research “would ultimately need to accommodate growing evidence and beliefs that learning is situational, interactive, and extremely complex.”

Merriam and Brockett (1997) contend that adult learning is “a cognitive process internal to the learner; it is what the learner does in a teaching-learning transaction, and also includes the unplanned, incidental learning that happens in everyday life” (p. 5, cited in Nania, 1999). “Each learner is different from other adult learners…they each possess different beliefs, values, needs attitudes, self-concept and past experiences that must be considered in planning the learning experience processes” (Verduin & Clark, 1991, cited in Nania, 1999, p. 164). Adults come to learning to a learning situation with their own personal goals and objectives, which may be different from those that underlie the learning situation (Caffarella, 1994, cited in Nania, 1999).

Caffarella (1994, cited in Nania, 1999) provides a convenient summary of the basic principles of adult learning theory:

- Adults can and do want to learn, regardless of their age.
- Adults have a rich background of knowledge and experience and tend to learn best when this knowledge is built on.
- Adults are motivated to learn based on complex internal and external forces.
- All adults have preferred styles of learning.
- Adults prefer content which is meaningful to them.
- Adults have their own personal learning goals and objectives.
- Adults are motivated to learn when a variety of teaching methods are used.
- Adults learn in both independent and collaborative ways.
- Adults are more receptive in a psychologically comfortable situation.
- What, how, and where adults learn is affected by their many roles.

What is apparent in this segment of the study is that there is a relatively high degree of interconnectedness among several of the adult learning theories listed which contributes to a sense of repetitiveness. However, what is evident is that the themes discovered in this study of popular narrative song do have a relationship to several adult learning theories. The connection with each theory varies. For some, as is the case with transformational, feminist, and holistic learning theory, the connection is substantial. For others such as levels of processing or situated learning the connection is evident but much weaker.

The next and final stage of this study will analyse how the relationship between popular narrative song and adult learning theory can be placed in the context of distance adult learning. Chapter VI concludes this thesis, with a collective reflection of the study and its educational implications.
CHAPTER VI
THEMATICS

“I think of music as the ultimate form where thought and feeling, idea and instinct most effortlessly and naturally join.” (Arthur Miller)

The purpose of this study has been to explore whether expressive culture in the form of popular music, specifically narrative song, through its unique characteristics, can play a constructive role as an instrument or agent for learning in the context of the process of distance adult education. I have proposed that if a relationship could be found between popular narrative song and distance adult learning, this study might provide validation for the use of popular narrative song as a vehicle for or another tool in the distance educators’ repository of techniques and technologies.

Chapter IV of the study explored the views of musicians, especially the writers and performers of songs, about the capability and potential of song to "educate"; that is, to fundamentally change the perceptions and behaviour of human beings, by altering their understanding of themselves, others, and the world. The views of these musicians and songwriters were captured through audio-tape recorded interviews. The conversations and viewpoints which were recorded were then analysed using Grounded Theory methodology, compared with those of other musicians in the study, as well as literature related to music, song and learning.

Chapter V examined whether the characteristics, qualities, or themes associated with popular narrative song discovered through Grounded Theory had any relation to various theories of adult learning employed by distance educators that apply to distance adult learning environments.
The final facet of Educational Criticism is the dimension of Thematics (Eisner, 1998). This stage of the methodology is where the researcher or educational critic develops a work around a particular insight or issue, in this case, popular narrative song and distance adult learning. This chapter will then include a brief overview of each of the themes described in Chapter IV, a review of the adult learning theories which relate to each them, as well as an account of how each theme applies to adult distance education and learning. At this point of the critical analysis, the essential features and insights that speak to value of the connection between popular narrative song and distance adult education will be folded into the text, in an attempt to provide coherence and unity in the study. Next, the tentative process of generalizing this study will be included, which may assist in understanding of how this phenomenon may be employed in a variety of educational situations (Barone & Eisner, 1997: Eisner, 1998). A brief appraisal of this study conducted by the research validation committee will be provided, as well as some concluding remarks from the participants of the study. The chapter will conclude with suggestions for further research.

Overview of Themes

The findings of this research suggest that popular music and song is a broad and complex phenomenon. I believe the comments and observations of the participants in this study verify how complicated human beings’ encounters with music and popular narrative song can be. The comments and observations of the participants interviewed for this study provided several categories that made up each of the eight themes. Table 1 highlights the findings discussed in Chapter IV and Chapter V by displaying the correlation between the themes related to song and the previously outlined theories of adult learning.
Table 1.

Correlation Between Themes Related To Song and Theories of Adult Learning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme:</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Characteristics of Adults as Learners (CAL)</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andragogy</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anchored Instruction</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cognitive Domain Model</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cognitive Flexibility Theory</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conditions of Learning</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constructivist Theory</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experiential Learning Theory</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Levels of Processing</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple Intelligences Theory</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Development (Constructivism) Theory</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Situated Learning Theory</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transformative Learning</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feminist Learning</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holistic Learning</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Each of these themes will now be sequentially examined in order to determine how they might relate to distance adult learning.
Theme 1: Song is a Means of Communication

Based on the testimony of the participants interviewed for this study, as well as the associated research literature, popular narrative song possesses numerous attributes that contribute to its ability to tell, inform, impart feelings, evoke understanding, or bring an experience to one’s attention. That is, to communicate.

The testimony of the informants of this study established that song was a means of communication that consisted of several attributes, characteristics, or qualities. Based on the data gathered, song was found to incorporate symbol content in the lyrics that works in combination with the expressive dimensions of melody, rhythm, and rhyme. As a result, narrative song has the ability to create, share, convey, or communicate a view of life, a feeling, or mood as well, as was as to illuminate, record, and analyse human insights. Thus, meaning as communicated through song can then be shared with other individuals. Table 1 summarises the correlation of the attributes of song as means of communication and various theories of adult learning.

Eisner’s (1998) observations confirm that there are multiple ways in which the world can be known, and there are also multiple forms humans can use to represent their view of the world. In addition, he states that the form that humans use to represent their view of the world have a significant influence on what they are able to say about it and influences what others are likely to experience. Popular narrative song as a means of communication has a several potential applications. Since each person learns in their own unique way, in the same way song might provide an alternative medium for individuals or segments of the population which prefer alternatives to various forms, print or visual communication. As previously explained in Chapter IV, popular narrative song has been used as a potential method of
communication among listeners with an oral tradition. It has also been previously stated that songs have a wide reach, and are a powerful medium for information dissemination and education in a memorable and appealing manner. As well, song has been used to help focus learners’ attention, and has also been used to provoke an interest in other peoples, cultures, and countries.

**Theme 2: Song Reflects Human Experience**

Both the observations of the informants and the associated research literature viewed song as revealing, disclosing or providing some insight into life’s nature, including both the past and present experience of individuals, or social groups. In essence, song was seen as reflecting human experience. As well, narrative song was seen as providing a structure for meaning-making which, as mentioned in Chapter IV, is a crucial element of adult learning. Since songwriters at times employ metaphorical in references narrative song, those interviewed cautioned that each song can potentially have a multiplicity of meanings. However, song was seen as having the capability of placing an individual in a particular time period, or taking an individual back to prior memories, thereby providing an individual a method of connecting to the past, present, and future. Song was also seen as having the ability to inform our sense of place or physical setting.

Since humans recount their experience through narrative, a story portrayed in song can become a metaphor for life. Hence, narrative song has the potential to reveal something about human nature, since each song is the story of events in which individuals or groups have participated either literally or metaphorically. Song may also provide an arena where many affairs of life are played out. This, in turn, can be a source of definitions and images of social reality. It can also provide a medium where culture and the values of societies and
groups are constructed, stored, and shared. The ability of song to reflect or portray human experience raises important questions, such as whose experience or perspective is being represented, and what meaning is being constructed through the narrative of each song. The answers to these questions are critical to the understanding of how song can be understood relative to history and culture. Based on both the informants and the literature reviewed, there seems to be no right or wrong way to interpret songs. An important issue to remember is that the same narrative song can be told from a number of different vantage points, and can be interpreted from a variety of perspectives. Accordingly, studying song is an undertaking of extraordinary complexity and an interpretative process in which each listener must make personal sense of the music and the lyrics. In addition, the deepest understanding is dependent on learners inherently valuing the experience as it is happening within and for themselves. The characteristic relating to song reflecting human experience would require serious scrutiny regarding the multitude of possible meanings for each song. Due to the potential for multiple interpretations of what a particular song means, each song would have to be carefully scrutinised for multiple meanings since the song might be interpreted or read differently by individual learners.

It was Dewey (1973) who said “…amid all uncertainties there is one permanent frame of reference: namely the organic connection between education and personal experience” (p. 225). Dewey also maintained that what is needed is more and better structuring of the experiences available to learners (1930, cited in Bouchard, 2001). As previously cited, Brookfield (1986), Habermas, (1971), and Mezirow (1990) state that meaning-making is a crucial element of adult learning. Consequently, if all learning is based on the experience of each learner, educators would then need to devise ways to incorporate learners’ previous
experiences into new material, and build in ways for learners to share their ideas and experiences with one another (Stilbourne & Williams, 1996). Therefore, if song reflects human experience, it should have the potential to provide examples of human experience that could be used to enhance learning situations and activities. Table 1 summarises the correlation of the attributes of song reflecting human experience and various theories of adult learning.

The potential for using popular narrative song as a means of reflecting human experience is considerable. Since songs embrace a multitude of subjects that represent human experience, these experiences have the potential to be communicated and in turn to be shared amongst individuals. As quoted by an informant in Chapter IV, songs “can come right at you.” They can evoke a mood of being there, bringing an individual right into the scene. Music and song can also activate prior meaning and knowledge. Hence, song might be used to provide an introduction to a wide variety of topics, situations, or ideas, and hence stimulate an interest in these learning experiences. Popular narrative song also allows us to use the emotional eyeglasses of other people. It allows us to travel through an entire life in a sort time. In addition, we can attempt to answer questions about the person in the narrative who is speaking the line. We can imagine how the person felt when they were saying the line. One could ask what the point of the song is, or how the problems stated in the song might be solved. These kinds of questions, and others, allow individuals to enter into the domain of feeling for the person who is speaking through the lines in the song. Hearing the voices and situations of others through song may also allow learners to appreciate the variety of human experience in a safe context.
With song, educators could select situations that would engage the learner in complex, realistic, problem-centred activities. In turn, these experiences could potentially support a wide range of educational goals and objectives. Based on this premise and the observations and reflections of the participants in this study, popular narrative song has considerable potential to provide engaging and meaningful experiences for distance adult learners.

Theme 3: Song Fosters Community

Both the reflections of the informants and the literature support the contention that narrative song has the ability to foster community by allowing groups to construct an identity, convey an understanding of an idea, desire, or feeling, and include others so that they can become involved. As has been previously outlined in Chapter IV, a number of researchers have noted that music and song can unlock the human potential for creativity, as well as stimulate exchange, promote sharing, friendship, and community, encourage social bonding, as well as strengthen values of mutual respect and solidarity (Atiali, 1985; Catteral, Chapleau, & Iwanaga, 2000; Clark & Greer, 1991; Crafts, Cavicchi & Keil, 1993; Frith, 1996; Jensen, 2001; Kelly, 1997; Kerka, 1997; Morris, 1999; Murrillo, 1995; Swanwick, 1999; Walker, 1990). In addition, through the preservation of traditional forms and heritage, song has the ability to hold groups together through social bonding, thereby separating them from outsiders. As well, through the universality of music, song also has the potential to increase harmony and shared understanding, as well as giving voice to the invention of new visions among both individuals and groups. Table 1 summarises the correlation of the attributes of song fostering community and various theories of adult learning.
Popular narrative song as a means of fostering community has several potential applications. To begin, “music can be a consequence-free means of exploring social interaction” (Cross, 2001, p. 99). Music and song can develop leadership, communication skills, a positive self-image, and can contribute to a sense of solidarity and pride in a group’s heritage, as well as providing inspiration and sustained hope (Carter, 1994; Clark & Greer, 1991; Lyshon, Matless, & Revill, 1998; Morriss, 1999; Schlesinger, 1991). Music and song can also contribute to participatory development that fosters the capability of people to do more for themselves (Arnold, Burke, James, Martin, & Thomas, 1991; Freire, 1973; Giroux, 1990; Horton, 1972; Shor, 1992; Spronk, Fall 1994; Williams, 1993). For example, at the Highlander Folk School, Ziphia and Myles Horton used song to reflect the hopes, dreams, struggles, and learning in the lives of many adults. They viewed song as a vehicle to arouse individuals, to develop awareness, and foster a sense of community (Carter, 1994; Rowland, 1999). Since music is a collective human activity, popular narrative song also has the potential to demonstrate respect for community cultural values and enhance group spirit, as well as make information accessible and relevant (Kerka, 1997b). For example, by sharing a portion of one’s life story through song, other individuals are invited to participate in a particular experience. Through this participation individuals can then become involved in the story which can, in turn, augment their own knowledge and experience with the knowledge and experience of others (Gillette, 1990, cited in Cassidy, 2001; Witherell, Tran & Othus., 1995, cited in Cassidy, 2001).

Theme 4: Song Embodies Emotion

Both the informants of this study and the attendant literature viewed music and song as a form of expression that shared deeply felt thoughts, ideas, and experiences amongst
individuals and groups. Song was uniformly viewed by the informants of this study as a natural means of self-expression and a vehicle for communicating feelings, emotions, sentiments, affects, responses, and reactions. The research literature related to narrative theory that was presented in Chapter IV maintained that emotions are a significant component of narrative that contributes to the meaning of a story. In addition, the literature presented in Chapter IV from the study of musicology declared that a good performance or song communicates emotion and feeling. This was also supported by the research literature relating to the study of psychology, which acknowledged that music and song can prompt emotional reactions. Literature associated with recent brain research found some connections between emotion and cognitive processes. This research seems to demonstrate that emotion can be a gateway to human thinking, and that stories and songs can open that gate (Carroll, 2001; Jensen, 2001). In addition, current research into emotional intelligence has recognised the benefits of the connection between cognition and expressions of emotion (Golman, 1995, cited in Upitis & Smithrim, 2002a; Jensen, 2001). There is growing evidence that learning requires emotional involvement (Goleman, 1995, cited in Upitis & Smithrim, 2002a; Upitis Smithrim, Patteson, MacDonald, & Finkle, 2003). Other research has provided support for the contention that emotion can affect the processes of reasoning, and has been found to be indispensable for rationality to learn (Barer-Stein & Draper, 2001; Paget, 1999; Taylor, 2001). Some researchers have found that appropriate emotions are capable of speeding up decision-making (Damasio, 1994, cited in Jensen, 1998), while others have found that individuals also remember that which is most emotionally laden, because emotions provide a more activated and stimulated brain, which, in turn, helps individuals to recall things better (Cahill, Prins, Weber, and McGaugh, 1994, cited in Jensen, 1998; MacKeracher, 1996).
Emotions have been found to be an essential source of information for learning (Dirkx, 2001; Draper, 2001; LeDoux, 1993, cited in Jensen, 1998; MacKeracher, 1996). This happens because all emotional events receive preferential process, and the brain is over-stimulated when strong emotions are present (Christianson, 1992, cited in Jensen, 1998). Pert (1997, cited in Jensen, 1998) explains that this occurs because, when emotions are expressed, the functions of the brain become united. Brookfield (1995) maintains that this connection between emotion and cognition is significant for adult learning, and invites much greater attention. Table 1 summarises the correlation of the previously mentioned qualities of song embodying emotion as they relate to various theories of adult learning.

Popular narrative song offers several potential applications corresponding to its ability to embody emotion. Inasmuch as humans are thinking, feeling, and active beings, learning involves both our thoughts or cognition, and our feelings or emotion (Draper, 2001; Keough, 1995, cited in Clover Follen & Hall, 2000; Paget, 1999). Therefore, as previously cited by Eisner (1981), human beings have the ability to acquire knowledge through various processes, and in each process there exists the opportunity to learn. Hence, if one of the central ideas in creating learning opportunities for adults is the recognition that human beings have many senses with which they perceive the world, as well as diverse learning styles, one could argue for the inclusion of emotion and feeling in the learning process. In order to draw on these emotions and personalise learning, techniques utilising drama, poetry, songs, and stories have, at times, been found to be effective (Bates, 1996; Crew, 1987, cited in Wittmer & Johnson, 2000; Fidishun, 2000; Kerka, 1997b; Proulx, 1993; Scott, 2001). Since people learn in different ways, integrating multiple activities such as those mentioned may be useful for stimulating emotion, creativity, imagination, and learning leading to action (Clover,
Fellon & Hall, 2000). Through its emotional characteristics, it would seem that popular narrative song has the potential to solicit affect that can move individuals to change opinions and understandings, or drive people to action (Brooks & Clark, 2001). Based on this premise, popular narrative song may have the potential advantage for igniting a passion for learning in adults. Finally, Rumble (1992) maintains that learners can be taught in the affective domain through both writing and audio. He contends that the vital element of this process is to engage the emotions as well as the intellect or cognitive processes. Narrative song might be one way of achieving this.

**Theme 5: Song Stimulates Cognition, Enlightenment, and Learning**

Based on the informants’ views and the associated literature reviewed in Chapter IV, song provides a unique way of knowing. It provides a distinctive way of processing and understanding a particular kind of non-verbal information. The unique strengths of song have been outlined in the previous two chapters. Song may potentially strengthen attention, cognitive, emotional, and motor capacities, as well as social and personal competencies that set learning in motion. The unique characteristics of song might also promote imagination, affect spatial-temporal reasoning, work on long- and short-term memory that activates processes which makes learning last, as well as providing a unique manner of communication that has the potential to fill in gaps left by other forms of communication. Table 1 summarises the correlation of the previously mentioned qualities associated with cognition, enlightenment, and learning as they relate to various theories of adult learning.

There are various potential applications of popular narrative song that may be associated with the stimulation of cognition, enlightenment, and learning. MacKeracher
(1996, p. 93) states that “learning is more effective when ideas, information, and knowledge can be stored in both verbal and non-verbal forms.” Since the use of music and song seems to be consistent with theories of multi-sensory cognitive learning, song may have the potential to encourage participation and learning by appealing to different modalities, learning styles, or intelligences (Kerka, 1997b). Additional reported benefits of song for learning include contributions to the development of the imagination (Greene, 1995), greater motivation to learn (Csikszentmihalyi, 1997), increased learner creativity, lower drop out rates from academic institutions, and increased social skills (Catterall, 1998; Luftig, 1995 cited in Upitis & Smithrim, 2002a). Positive links have also been made between song, listening skills, and language awareness, because perception, imagination, and insight that can be cultivated by art are central to both reading and writing (Smithrim & Upitis, 1996). Song has also been successfully used in adult English as second language learning situations (Crawford, 2001; Coromina, 1993; Kazemek & Rigg, 1997; Lems, 2001; Lowe, 1995, cited in Scripp, 2002; Murphey, 1992; cited in Lems, 2001; Schoepp, 2001). In these situations song has been used as a mnemonic device to aid recall of information. It has also been used to create a learning environment as well as, build listening comprehension enlarge vocabulary; improve speaking, reading, and writing skills and expand cultural knowledge.

**Theme 6: Song Facilitates Transformation**

The characteristics of popular narrative song relating to transformational learning were explained in Chapter IV. Song was seen as assisting in communicating ideas and alternative views of the world to individuals and groups. As a result of the communication of these alternative views, there is a potential for perspective changes as a result of seeing the world in a new or different way. Both informants of this study and the associated literature
saw song as having the potential for providing new or unique experiences, as well as opening new vistas, while being grounded in a more intuitive or emotional sense of human experience. Hence, by allowing individuals to imagine alternative or competing representations of the world, song may have the potential to promote self-examination and critical reflection on the part of the learner. In Table 1, the previously mentioned properties of song relating to transformation have been correlated with various adult learning theories.

Song used as a means of facilitating transformation has been used in a variety of learning situations. The process of analysing a song has been employed to empower students, while helping them to acquire insight, knowledge, and critical thinking skills (Abod, 1998; Chase, 2002). Song can also serve as a vehicle for learners to reflect upon and analyse their own experiences, as well as the experiences of others, and to begin to address stereotypes and misconceptions (Abod, 1998, Chase 2002; Fowler, 1996). For example, McDonnell (1999) cites examples of women listening to music for empowerment. As well, as previously mentioned in this chapter, Highlander Folk School used song as part of the process of critical reflection and social transformation (Carter, 1994; Rowland, 1999). In situations such as these, song was used to help the marginalized find their voice and acquire critical literacy, since the act of making art exposes society to itself (Baird, 1999; Balait, 1999; Freire, 1971; Gilmore, 1998; Kerka, 1997). Havens (1999) spoke of how songs can teach an individual something new, or allow one to think about things they have never considered before. He also described how song was universal in nature, as serving a higher purpose, and as something people can recognise the world over (Havens, 1999). He also related how song has been used to speak to the under-history of a people, lift some part of the weight humans seem to carry, and help clarify the path individuals take (Brown, 2001; Havens, 1999). Song has
the ability to go to the core of one’s being, regardless of differences in class, geography, ethnicity, and religion (Goodale, 2000). As well, because music and song are so universal, they have the potential of launching engaged dialogue that might not occur otherwise (Upitis, Smithrim, Patteson, MacDonald, & Finkle, 2003).

In addition, music and song have always been implicated in the social and political world, signifying both power and subversion (Attali, 1985; Martin, 1998). McClary (1999, p. 441) notes that “Plato feared that unsanctioned music will instill a thirst for liberty. Such music, he claims, encourages the populace to value its own judgements and to resist authority, whether familial or governmental.” The ability of music to carry ideologically explicit meanings, yet remain open to various interpretations, has made it a potent political force (Leyshon, Matless, & Revill, 1998). To many musicians, and many listeners, music and song has been seen as a weapon in a crucial battle against the status quo (Vivian, 1989; University of Wales, 1997). Music and song has also contributed to participatory development that fosters the capability of people to do more for themselves (Arnold, Burke, James, Martin, & Thomas, 1991; Carter, 1994; Freire, 1973; Giroux, 1990; Horton, 1972; Shor, 1992; Spronk, Fall 1994; Williams, 1993). Both storytelling and song have been used as “educational tools to re-enforce the strength of participants to positive action” (Clover, Follen & Hall, 2000, p. 106). “Even using songs that offend serves an important purpose, when it ‘moves’ a student to examine a critical issue facing our society” (Chase, 2002). At the same time it must be recognised that, as well as having the potential to contribute to personal and social transformation, music and song can also be used by those in power to maintain the status quo (Attali, 1985; Leyshon, Matless, & Revill, 1998; Morris, 1999).
To determine how transformational learning might be used in distance adult learning, it would be useful to revisit Scott’s observation that “transformative learning can occur anywhere the why question is asked” (2001, p. 255). Reflective learning activities may assist distance adult learners through examination of their biases and habits, and move them towards a new understanding of their experience (Blum, 1999; Fidishun, 2000). Meaningful activities might involve messages from popular culture, including vignettes, stories, drama, poetry, music, or case studies and scenarios, thereby giving song a place in the learning process (Bates, 1996; Crew, 1987, cited in Wittmer & Johnson, 2000; Fidishun, 2000; Kerka, 1997b; Proulx, 1993; Scott, 2001). However, for the process of transformation to be effective, any critical learning activity would require that the learner engage in dialogue with others. Through dialogue, the learner is assisted in recognising their disorientation, which becomes a key factor in the process of transformation (Brookfield, 1986; Casteli, 1994; Imel, 1998; Kerka, 1997b; Mezirow, 1978; Mezirow & Associates, 1990, cited in Blum, 1999; Scott, 2001; Taylor, 1998). Song, through its ability to reflect human experience and grab people emotionally, can illuminate how others have experienced similar situations, which in turn can be used as a component of the transformational learning process.

Clover, Follen and Hall (2000, p. 14) state that “learning environments must nurture, but they must also provide the opportunity to challenge assumptions and create new ways of understanding the world around them.” Through the use of popular narrative song, educators might be able to initiate transformative learning by involving very personal and imaginative ways of knowing, grounded in a more intuitive and emotional sense of human experiences. If music and song plays such an important role in the lives of people, it presents an opportunity to discuss a wide range of issues. When associated with critical reflection or transformative
education, song may also have the potential to contribute to the empowerment of learners at a
distance (Evans & Nation, 1989; Evans & Nation, 1992; Evans & Juler, 1992; Williams,
1993). For those distance adult education programs or undertakings that focus on
understanding adult development and transformative learning, there might also be a benefit
in understanding the way popular narrative song affects various cultures, ethnic groups, or
other forms of social organisation. The potential for using music to expand critical thinking
of basic beliefs and assumptions might also foster new ways of thinking and viewing the
world. “It is difficult to evaluate the extent to which transformative learning occurs. Just
offering the opportunity, though, for engaging at a depth beyond the normal way of operating
is useful and whether it can be evaluated or not seems irrelevant” (Scott, 2001, p. 155). As
with other theories of adult learning, the differences in learning contexts, learners, and
educators can all affect the process of transformative learning, and would have to be taken
into consideration in any distance adult learning venture hoping to use popular narrative song
(Imel, 1998).

Theme 7: Song Exhibits a Transcendental or Spiritual Nature

In Chapter IV, informants frequently referred to the unexplainable or mystical nature
of song, as well as the spiritual or transcendental way songs impact listeners. Tisdell (2001,
p. 1) explained spirituality as being about each individuals’ “belief and experience of a
higher power or higher purpose.” The literature associated with adult learning confirms that
spirituality is an important element of human experience, and is an important component in
the construction of knowledge and meaning (Brown, 1983; Ferguson, 1980; Griffin, 2001;
OISE, 2002). The researchers and theorists cited in Chapter IV maintain that narrative song
has the capability of presenting a spiritual or transcendent character, that works in conjunction with the affective, rational, cognitive, and unconscious aspects of learning. Table 1 summarises the correlation of the qualities associated with song exhibiting a transcendental or spiritual nature as they relate to various theories of adult learning.

While the literature does not comment specifically on song and the transcendent or spiritual aspects of learning, there are some references which link them. MacKerarcher (1996, p. 12) notes that “much of learning is subconscious (below or beyond conscious awareness) and may use feelings or images.” The focus on meaning-making is closely related to the spiritual quest of adults. It recognises the human connection to something greater than ourselves, as well as the importance of being concerned about and caring for humans and the environment (Clover, Follen & Hall, 2000; English, 1999; Horton & Freire, 1990; Lerner, 2000 cited in Tisdell, 2001; Walters & Manicom, 1996). With this in mind, there may be a place for the use of song in learning experiences when one considers song’s transcendental or spiritual attributes. Zanzig (1936, cited in Rowland, 1999, pp. 365-366) declares that “music tends, even without the aid of teachers or courses, to be profoundly educative. It seems to reach directly to those innermost layers of our natures which the purely intellectual subjects are likely to leave untouched, and yet which are the very basis of what we are and what we shall become.” Holistic learning theory supports the interconnectedness of body, mind, emotions, and spirit in the learning process through the use of creative communication tools such as song (OISE, 2002). Dewar (1996) contends that Griffin’s theory of holistic learning is especially important in distance learning. Merriam & Heuer (1996, cited in English, 1999) add that educators can contribute to the transcendent, spiritual, or holistic learning process by
exposing adults to a wide variety of experiences. Based on the research conducted for this study, I would argue that this could include the use of song.

**Theme 8: Song Overcomes Distance**

As previously stated in Chapter IV, none of the informants saw distance as being a hindrance to communication through song. They declared that it was not necessary for an individual to be face-to-face with another person in order to share a song. In fact, song was viewed by the informants of this study as a superior form for overcoming distance when compared other forms of communication. Song was seen as not being limited by time or place, nor was it deemed necessary that an individual be with anyone else while listening to a song. Several informants noted that, historically, song was communicated by word-of-mouth, but technology such as recordings, radio, and the Internet has since allowed songs to be transmitted over vast distances.

In Chapter V, the connection between the themes discovered through this study and several adult learning theories were examined in some detail. At this juncture, it is now time to examine how the themes derived from the analysis of the participants’ contributions and the theories of adult learning examined in this study relate to distance adult learning.

As outlined in Chapter V, several learning theories have relevance to distance education (Blum, 1999; Evans & Nation, 1989; Evans & Nation, 1992; Evans & Juler, 1992; Hayes, 1990, cited in Collins, 1998; Williams, 1993). These include humanistic models, such as learning theories which consider the learner in an active role, more complex cognitive learning theories such as constructivist, social constructivist, other learning theories based on the cognitive domain, as well as gender based or transformational learning theories, and theories that are holistic in nature. Nania 1999 asserts that “distance education as a vehicle is
supported by many of the principles of adult learning.” As well, Hayes contends that (1990, cited in Collins, 1998, p. 25) the literature on adult education can provide distance educators with a better understanding of the programs with which they may work, the characteristics of their adult students, and desirable educational practices for these learners.”

Van de Wall (1938, cited in Rowland, 1999) held adult educators responsible for not including music as part of the curriculum in education. Van de Wall (1938, p. v) wrote, “There is in education circles today some confusion as to the significance and place of music in Adult Education. It is also attributable to the fact that music specialists and teachers have not escaped the isolation which seems to be the penalty for specialisation; neither have all of them yet learned to exchange ideas and work amicably side by side.” He raises issues that are still pertinent today, which this thesis attempts to address. More recently, Wolfensohn & Williams (1993) have argued that the power of the arts must be understood and used throughout education. Regleski (1998) goes further by claiming that music exists to be put into action for its fullest potential in enhancing life. One challenge educators face, including those who specialise in distance adult learning, in the development and refinement of their educational approaches, is to change their practice as they gain new knowledge and experience. That change in teaching practice has far reaching ramifications (Upitis, Smithrim, & Soren, 1999). The themes discovered as a result of this thesis yield a number of potential implications for the field of distance adult education. The findings of this thesis have the potential for enlightening distance educators, practitioners, and administrators who have previously been unaware of the educational power of popular narrative song. Drawing on the methods, theories, and principles of a wide range of adult learning theories, a number of recommendations have been included in this study, in order to support the use of popular
narrative song in appropriate distance adult learning situations. Songs, especially narrative songs, add other dimensions to stories, such as rhythm, rhyme and melody. These dimensions can help provide important channels for facilitating learning, behavioural change, people’s participation, and dialogue (Carroll, 2001; Carter, 1994). As this study demonstrates, song also sheds light on our past history and heritage, as well as informing us about common assumptions and cultural concerns (Colombo, 2002). Using song to address sensitive, complex issues adds a level of immediacy and accessibility. One of the most significant aspects of this research is that popular music and song can be creatively adapted to a wide range of learning environments, and are applicable across a wide variety of educational objectives (Neuenfeldt, 1997; Scripp, 2002).

The arts, including song, have frequently been used to explore other subject areas (Upitis, 2000a). Examples include how World Music has been used to provoke interest in a country, thereby becoming a useful tool in teaching intercultural communication (Kelly, 1997). Songs have also been used to communicate on a wide variety of rural development, health and population issues (IRC, 2000; Silver, 2001). In the context of distance learning, music and song may have the potential convey educational messages memorably and attractively, since songs and stories are the most fundamental ways human beings reach each other’s minds and hearts (Carroll, 2001; Thomas, 2001b). Morin (2003) and Cooper (1998) contend that music and song is best understood within a holistic curriculum, where an interdisciplinary approach has the potential to offer powerful educational encounters for students (Morin, 2003). Interdisciplinary inquiry involves integrating ideas about how the world works (content areas) with ways to represent how we see and make sense of the world (communication symbols such as language, music, art, mathematics, etc.). Several creative
educators working outside of the field of distance education have initiated learning experiences covering a wide range of topics, ideas, situations, and events through song. For example, educators focusing on language arts, (Andrews, 1997, cited in Scripp, 2002; Butzlaff, 2000; Cooper, 1996; Crawford, 2001; Lems, 2001, Murphey, 1992; Schoepp, 2001; Taylor, 1981), literature (Coromina, 1993; Fay, 2001; Moi, 1994) and intercultural communication (Kelly, 1997) have used song to support learning. Culture, history (Brown, 2001; Cooper 1982; Longrie, 1997; Wald & Junkerman, 1999; Wright & Wellner, 2000), geography (Bowen, 1997; McLeay, 199; Morine, 2003; Patterson, 1991), cultural imperialism (Cooper & Cooper, 1990), and war (Cooper, 1986; 1992) have been studied through song. Social movements (Cooper, 1986; 1999), health issues (Cooper, 1986, 1994; Cooper & Schurk, 1994; Silver, 2001), censorship (Cooper, 1993), and economics (Tinari & Khandke, 2000) have been scrutinised through song. Personal identity and social relationships (Cooper, 1997), as well as many other subjects, have also been investigated through song (Cassara & Gates, 2000; Chase, 2002; Cooper, 1998; Hallam, 1999, cited in Scripp, 2002; Jedynak, 2000; Materson, 1994, and Morine, 2003). Distance adult educators and practitioners may also consult several additional song related educational resources. There is a comprehensive and regularly up-dated Internet web site that focuses on popular music and song that may be a useful as a starting point (Rodman & Coates, 2001). As well, the Rock and Roll Hall of Fame and Museum in Cleveland, Ohio provides over seventy lesson plans, programs for educators, and additional resources “intended to stimulate learner interest and creativity, to develop higher order thinking skills, and to promote inter-disciplinary learning” (Rock and Roll Hall of Fame and Museum, 2003). The lessons are wide ranging and cover such topics as: the Civil Rights movement, apartheid, the Protestant
Reformation, the Vietnam War, social protest in the 20th century, literary devices, communication, problem-solving, slavery, Salem witch trials, poetry, pop art, fashion, the Cold War, feminism, economics, positive thinking, and personal identity crises, to list a few. In addition, the *Experience Music Project*, in Seattle, Washington, is another source of learning resources and programs designed for educators wishing to integrate popular music and song into educational experiences (Experience Music Project, 2003). Both the *Experience Music Project* and the *Rock and Roll Hall of Fame and Museum* have educational institutes, which are partnered with academic institutions, aimed at assisting educators incorporate popular song and music into their educational programs.

**Implications of this Research to the Field of Distance Adult Learning**

Crew (1987, p. 147, cited in Wittmer & Johnson, 2000) explains that “the best teaching-learning situation is the proper blend of actual and vicarious experiences, of theory and practice, each enriching the other.” With this in mind, any use of popular narrative song in the context of distance adult learning would have to be implemented in light of the criteria for best practice in the field of distance education. Kegan (1996) has remarked that it is imperative that prior to implementing the use of new tools or strategies distance educators must employ good instructional practices, based on the solid grounding of the basic principles of distance education. He adds that this is “essential to overcoming barriers to acceptance” (Keegan, 1996, p. 27). “Best practice can be defined as that combination of structure, educational technology and content of a learning opportunity, which in certain contexts and for particular groups of learners, is most likely to achieve the purposes of the main stakeholders” (Calder, 2000, p. 3).
This first criterion of best practice is related to the learner. MacKeracher (1996, p. 3) reminds us that “the more we know about the basic processes of learning and the unique strategies used by individual learners to carry out learning activities, the more effectively we can design appropriate activities and resources to facilitate learning.” Before considering the use of popular narrative song in the context of distance education, educators and practitioners must pay attention and cater to the differences or variables among adults (Rowntree, 1994). These variables include experience, individual learning styles, preferences for acquiring new knowledge and skills, and levels of maturity or ways of responding to new learning situations. (Caffarella, 1994; cited in Nania, 1999; Kerka, 1993; MacKeracher, 1996; Rowntree, 1994; Sherry, 1996; Verduin & Clark, 1991, cited in Nania, 1999). Several researchers state the importance of recognising and accommodating physical, psychological, and mental characteristics, as well as those characteristics based on local, cultural, ethnic, and geographic contexts (Clover, Follen & Hall, 2000; Flannery, 1995, cited in Rowland, 1999; McIssac & Gunwardena; Ross-Gordon, 1998; Rothwell & Cookson, 1997; Smith, 1982, cited in Dewar, 1996 Verduin & Clark, 1991, cited in Nania, 1999). This may be accomplished through advanced preparation, by creating profiles of learners prior to implementing a new learning strategy, vehicle or tool (Rothwell & Cookson, 1997; Rowntree, 1994; Sherry, 1996). This would apply to the use of popular narrative song, as well as any other teaching/learning techniques. The next step would be to implement a plan that is congruent with what is known about the learners for the specific situation. This plan must attempt to make a match between the modes of learning, the content to be learned, as well as the resources to be selected and used (Eisner, 1997; Kerka, 1993; MacKeracher, 1996; Rothwell & Cookson, 1997; Sherry, 1996). When teaching adults, educators need to be
flexible, open to differing ways, differing ideas, and a variety of techniques, in order to create suitable learning experiences for students, (Barer-Stein & Draper, 2001; Paget, 1999). Popular narrative song may have a potential role to play here.

The next component of best practice to consider with regard to the use of popular narrative song in the context of distance adult learning is that of systematic instructional design (Sherry, 1996). Learning gains are based on effective instructional design principles that create a blueprint or sequence for effective instruction (Kirkwood, 1998; McIsaac & Gundawardena, 1996; Rowntree, 1994; Sisco & Cochenour, 1998). Making the aims and objectives of the learning experience clear to the learner is an important component of the design process (Rowntree, 1994; Rothwell & Cookson, 1997). Strategies which are effective include “developing appropriate methods of feedback and reinforcement, optimising content and pace, adapting to different student learning styles, using case studies and examples which are relevant to the target audience, being concise, supplementing courseware with print information, and personalising instruction” (Sherry, 1996). Hayes claims that (1990, cited in Collins, 1998, p. 25) “a broad perspective can give distance educators greater insight into influences on their own practice, suggest new avenues for research and program design.” It is possible that popular narrative song may have a role to play in contributing to this broad perspective. In any case, the use of popular narrative song would require that the distance educator help adult learners find their way through the learning experience presented through each song. Distance educators would have to create suitable devices to aid learners to find something out about each song that relates to the aims and objectives of the learning experience (Rowntree, 1994). The use of song would also require that the distance educator find a convenient form for packaging those songs used in the learning experience (Rowntree,
Ultimately, the primary role of the distance educator is to create the conditions in which learning through song can occur (Bugleki, 1971; Collins, 1998).

Active involvement in the learning process is another critical component in adult learning, as well as in distance education (Caffarella, 1994; cited in Nania, 1999; Dillon, Hengst & Zoller, 1991). Adult learning is a “process internal to the learner; it is what the learner does in a teaching-learning transaction, and also includes the unplanned, incidental learning that happens in everyday life” (Merriam and Brockett, 1997, p. 5, cited in Nania, 1999). This is because the integration of new knowledge with previous knowledge requires active participation on behalf of the learner (Zemke, 1988, cited in Dewar, 1996). After participating in a song related learning experience, each learner would be expected to do something with the song(s) they have encountered (Rowntree, 1994). With this in mind, distance adult educators must ensure that they employ popular songs with characteristics that will engage learners. Active participants in the learning process must be both willing and able to receive instructional messages. The mental effort which a learner will invest in a learning task depends on his own perception of two factors: the relevance of both the medium and the message which it contains, and the ability to make something meaningful out of the material presented. (Sherry, 1996). At times, a degree of arousal may be necessary for learning to occur (Brundage & MacKeracher, 1980, cited in Dewar, 1996). Anything that captures the learners’ attention and gets their minds engaged has the potential to produce learning. If there is no attention and no engagement, there will be no learning (Wolfe, 1996).

This word comes from the French term engagé, which, when used to describe the writer or artist, means morally committed. Engagement in a learning experience means the sense of being wholly involved. That includes the involvement of the sensori-motor or physical,
emotional, cognitive, and social dimensions (Clover, Follen & Hall, 2000; Csikszentmihalyi, 1997; Noddings, 1992, cited in Upitis & Smithrim, 2002a; Upitis, Smithrim, Patteson, MacDonald, & Finkle, 2003). Depending on the objectives of the learning experience some kind of activity would have to be created that would enable each learner to remember ideas, understand ideas, make use of ideas, think, memorise, or relate the learning to their own experience. Each learning experience using song would also have to incorporate some opportunity for the learner to reflect on their own thoughts and feelings, and apply what they have experienced through song to their own life, as well as to the aims and objectives of the learning experience (Rowntree, 1994). In order for a learner to gain the most from a song-related learning experience, each learner would have to be provided with some method of responding to the song and acknowledge any benefit received from the experience (Rowntree, 1994). Simply listening to a popular narrative song will not suffice, active learning must be incorporated into each learning experience. While Wolfe (1996) contends that anything that captures the learners’ attention and engages their minds has the potential to produce learning, whether or not learning goes on depends more on the learner than on the teacher (Bugleski, 1971; Collins, 1998; Newcomb, et al., 1986, cited in Collins, 1998;).

Interaction is another fundamental component of best practice for distance education (McIsaac & Gunawardena, 1996). “Successful distance education systems involve interactivity between teachers and students, between students and the learning environment, and among students themselves”(Sherry, 1996, p. 339). Since adults learn in both independent and collaborative ways, interactivity should include of some form of dialogue among the participants, as well as various forms of support during and after the learning.
Kirkwood (1994) asserts that distance educators’ “often underestimate the contribution that sounds, music, and the spoken word can make to open and distance learning. They can be used for direct teaching, tutoring, or simply to provide some variety in the materials being studied; they can also be conveyed to learners by a variety of means” (p. 64). Kirkwood (1998) states that when considering the differences between media one must acknowledge that their unique characteristics are more important than their similarities. He recommends that distance educators select a medium for a particular learning situation, because no other medium can achieve the learning outcomes desired. Some students have very limited backgrounds in formal education. Some may not be literate. Some cultures favour oral presentations. Others favour pictorial representations rather than text. Such differences need to be taken into account (Rumble, 1992). As well, Rumble (1992) contends that teaching of understanding requires the use of redundancy, or discussion, or preferably both. Redundancy simply means teaching the same idea in several different ways—using pictures as well as words, analogy as well as models, etc. The purpose is to drive new concepts and thought processes through the learner’s mind several times and in different contexts. Therefore, in some situations more than one medium may be required. Music in the form of popular narrative song might, in some contexts, be useful for the purposes of redundancy.

As previously mentioned, in the criterion related to instructional design any learning experience designed to make use of popular narrative song would need to be packaged in a manner that is convenient for the learner to access and use (Rowntree, 1994). Each medium
has its own unique way of organising and presenting knowledge (Au & Chong, 1993; Bates, 1995; Kirkwood, 1998; McIsaac & Gunawardena, 1996). Technological development is increasing the range of media and the way in which media can be combined (Rumble, 1992). However, research on the effects of various media does not point to any one form having the best effects on learning (Gagne, 1985; Rowntree, 1994; Schramm, 1977). Bates (1995) and Rumble (1992) have outlined the various factors which planners and managers of distance learning need to take into account when deciding which medium to use. One of the challenges in choosing the ideal media for distance education is to accurately analyse the geographical and demographic information in light of what is known about access to educational technologies by the learner (Au & Chong, 1993; Bates, 1995; Heinich et al., 1999; Kirkwood, 1998; McIsaac & Gunawardena, 1996; Potter, 1990; Rumble, 1992; Schramm, 1977; Sherry, 1996). Whatever technology is used, it must be presumed that it has been chosen to match the needs of the learner and the delivery organisation (McIsaac & Gunawardena, 1996). If education is viewed as a process of information flow, discussion, critical thinking, and application, then the role of the deliverer and the technology used have great impact (Dede, 1996; Rumble, 1992; Thach, 1993). Technological hardware and software can contribute much to distance education, but the most important issues relate back to the individual and his or her learning needs and personal commitment (McIsaac & Gunawardena, 1996; Paul, 1995; Rowntree, 1994; Rumble, 1992; Schramm, 1977). The challenging and viable option of implementing the use of popular narrative song in the context of distance education presents a number of practical considerations (Ruippo, 1998). For example, the distribution of songs through such distance education technologies as radio and the Internet would need serious examination (Balit, 1999; Bates, 1983, 1995; Cabrera-
Issues such as copyright would also have to be addressed when using song in distance learning situations (Baggaley, 1999; Crawford, 2001; Willdorf, 2000).

The final component of best practice is evaluation. Those distance educators wishing to incorporate song into learning experiences would have to plan and initiate an assessment strategy, including formative, summative, and follow-up evaluation, to measure the effectiveness of incorporating song into the distance adult learning experience (Rothewell & Cookson, 1997; Rowntree, 1994).

Garrison (2000) has stated that “the study of distance education has shifted to educational issues associated with the teaching-learning transaction” (p. 2). Miller (1989, cited in McIsaac & Gunawardena, 1996, p. 15) contends that “it is vital that distance education be informed with the work done in other disciplines.” Others add that the real success of distance education is its opportunity to develop and use new learning models, some of which are based on existing learning models which may be successful in the field of distance learning (Clark & Verdun, 1991, cited in Blum, 1999; Moore & Thompson, 1990). Garrison (2000) explains that theory can describe current activities, and provide direction for new approaches that are essential for the vitality of a field of practice. He adds, “theory in distance education must evolve to reflect current and innovative practices of designing and delivering education at a distance” (2000, p. 14). I believe, as this study demonstrates, popular narrative song may have the potential to provide a valuable contribution to distance adult learning theory and practice. I do not perceive popular narrative song as a panacea for every distance adult learning experience. Upitis (2000a, p. 3) maintains “that there is a time
and place for learning through the arts.” However, where appropriate, popular narrative song may provide a refreshing and worthy enhancement to distance adult learning.

Research Validation Team Appraisal

As stated in Chapter III, a research validation team is comprised of colleagues who comment on the conclusions of the study (Chenail, 1995). In this study, the role of the research validation team was to verify the relevance of the categories and/or themes generated from the data, and to ascertain if the themes were deemed faithful to the data. They were to also determine if the relationships between distance adult learning theories and the themes generated from the data assembled were legitimate. Given that the two research validation team members are practising music educators and professional musicians, it would be deemed reasonable that their conclusions would be understandable and meaningful to other educators.

This portion of the thesis will present some of the observations, reflections, and comments made by the Research Validation Team, and will also identify how these observations and comments have been addressed in this thesis. Over a four-month period, the Research Validation Team reviewed the raw data and the contents of this thesis. The team provided both written comments and participated in an audio-tape recorded meeting with the researcher. The team contributed the following observations, reflections and comments.

The first issue raised by one of the team members dealt with the methodology of the study. Based on the experience of this member of the team, who was unfamiliar with this form of qualitative research methodology, there was a concern with regard to the role of empirical evidence in this study.
• The whole idea of empirical evidence is really hard to land on in this kind of study. You can’t ever say completely that this happened.

• Is this the real thing? Is this hard and fast? Is this solid? Initially, I had a hard time accepting that going into this.

Upon meeting with the team this issue was dealt through the elucidation that this thesis is an exploratory study which attempts to develop theory rather than an experimental or quantitative study. I reminded the team that as noted in Chapter III “one of the reasons for conducting a qualitative study is that the study is exploratory, not much has been written about the topic being studied” (Cresswell, 1994, p. 21). In addition, I pointed out to the team that this study while being qualitative in nature was still a systematic investigation of an issue that followed a clearly defined set of procedures. I also reminded the team that there were other studies cited in this thesis, such as those being undertaken by Smithrim, Upitis, and associates, that were examining the relationship between music and learning from both a quantitative and a qualitative perspective. In addition, the section of this chapter suggesting further research indicates that long-term empirical studies would be a useful future step.

With regard to expanding the informant pool the research validation team made the following observations and comments.

• I think that it is important that these questions be asked of some people that have nothing to do with music.

• Is this for everyone?

• Many people are not “into” music. What about those who have not been brought up in a musical environment?
• Why is feminist learning included, what about blacks, gays, or other social groups?

This concern will be addressed later in this chapter, with the suggestion that those conducting future research related to this topic might approach other demographic groups asking similar questions. With regard to the inclusion of feminist learning, this learning theory was expanded to encompass other marginalised groups as well as women. However, the label for this theory was retained, since it has been used in much of the literature consulted.

Another observation dealt with other forms of song, such as the profound impact of religious music.

• Both you and your informants stayed away from religious music, the impact of nationalistic, and serious religious music in terms of learning.

• The impact of religious music to derail learning, to totally infuse and to bang into your head a life philosophy that you can’t, you shouldn’t, you are not allowed to engage in whatever, to encourage guilt was not dealt with.

• As well, how about race, metal, R & B music? Other forms of music and song may have different results.

The response to this observation was based on the premise that this study focused on popular narrative song in an attempt to limit or narrow the focus of the study. The portion in this chapter outlining suggestions for further research addresses this issue by recommending further research into the use of musical forms other than popular narrative in order to expand the knowledge base.

In summary the team made the following comments.
• The energy and time needed to develop programs using song may be considerable.

• You have mentioned that getting to know the learner, getting to know their background, and going from there is important. The creation and development of profiles of your learners, as you have said, is important.

• Music is a more direct avenue for learning for those individuals who are into music and song, such as those who have been brought up in a musical environment.

• Music and song is everywhere. You have to work hard not to be in contact with it.

• If you start talking to students what was going on in the Sixties for example, what do you do? Immediately you reach for some music. Little else needs to be said.

• I think that there are many angles that this could be worked from. It is a huge project in itself. I don’t think there is any debate, there are people who have been doing it for years. I don’t think that it is at all debatable.

• It’s a tool in a toolbox. Music and song may work for this person and maybe visuals may work for that person. It’s nice to have it in your back pocket as a learning device. Where written word will not work for one person, perhaps music and song might. To say it will work for everybody is unlikely. To have it as a valuable option, let’s not waste the opportunity to use it for learning purposes.

• This is a huge project. The ramifications of it go out just like a spider’s web. I would agree with the premise and the thesis without a doubt. Music teaches in the most obvious and subtle terms.
• I think what you have presented here is really fertile ground. It has a lot of potential to be pushed and shoved. It legitimises what a lot of people have been doing for years.

The involvement of the Research Validation team in study has been extremely valuable. The team assisted me by reviewing the data collected and my interpretations of that data. They acted as a sounding board, looked at my conclusions from different and fresh perspective, and at times challenged some of my conclusions. Through their efforts my confidence in this thesis was increased. Their involvement helped validate my conclusions, as well as ensure that this study was undertaken with openness and truthfulness. Barone & Eisner (1997) explain that validation “occurs when the observations that are made through artistically grounded qualitative research are acknowledged and valued by a competent, critical community” (p. 85). I would highly recommend the use of a research validation team for similar exploratory studies in areas where little research has been undertaken.

Concluding Thoughts and Reflections

Meeting and talking to the individuals that constitute the basis for this study was a treat for me, that was relived each time I reviewed the tapes, reread transcripts, and amended the manuscript. This study has been unique in that it addresses aspects of music and distance adult education that have not previously been systematically and thoroughly studied. The intent of this study was to provide a contribution both to the building of theory and to the provision of tentative solutions in the form of tools or guides for the use of song in the field of distance adult education. It is my hope that this study provides evidence and insights that contribute to the existing scholarly literature about music and song, as well as providing a
meaningful contribution to the field of distance adult education. I further hope that distance adult education theory and practice will be enhanced through other individuals and educational organisations realising the educational potential and pleasure of popular song.

The great thing about song is that it can take you somewhere and nurture your imagination. Song transports us to other historic periods, sites, inside emotions, sensations, values, social circumstances, political responses, and personal memories. Sometimes songs can take us inside souls and spirits. That is a remarkable human possibility, that you might know something about another person, group, human experience, place, situation, or idea, simply by listening to a well-crafted song.

I will now return to the words of the participants in this study:

- Music relates to the whole spectrum of life.
- In most cultures there is no concept of the non-singer or non-performer. Everyone is a singer, de-facto. So you get a merging of the values, and a reinforcing of the values of the old people with the wisdom of having been translated directly to the young children in the village, or compound wherever you are.
- You know music is very important in every aspect. Like even at a funeral you need music. At a party you need music. Wherever you are.
- There are many societies in the world that use song as a daily instrument for work, for play, for history. It even goes back to creating songs that imitate the environment so you can eat.
- When we go to Bali and see how the music of that culture stems, not only from every age group, but every occupation. To whole villages. Every person in the village is involved.
• There is a whole realm of music that soothes and communicates on a personal level in terms of relationships and family and community and there is this broader picture of politics and social change.

• In terms of the sorts of things that can be communicated, just about anything can be communicated. Whether it is the whole ecological movement. Whether it is healing and the need for self-healing and the need for self-awareness. Whether it is how to express anger. You can teach about another culture.

• You can learn from songs, all sorts of things about language, about slang, information, the great subjects of life.

• Even if you are talking about the most popular things all the time, they do reflect the times. They are instructive because they reflect the mood of the time.

• But also to lift people’s spirits, to connect people with divinity. However you want to define divinity. To give people hope. To educate people.

Suggestions for Further Research

This section suggests priorities for further research. While I must once again emphasise that this study represents but an initial investigation, the findings of this thesis seem to suggest that popular narrative song does have some potential as a learning tool or vehicle in the context of distance adult learning. Further research would be required to validate this hypothesis. Due to the homogeneous nature of the sample, the small sample size, and the use of convenient sampling methods, generalising is difficult. There remains much work to be done before researchers and educators can fully understand the educational potential of popular song. If my contention about the potential of popular song as a learning
tool or vehicle for distance adult learning is reasonable, it is my hope that this study emphasises a need for further attention, careful research, and various methods of experimentation. However, this study can be used as a foundation for future research in this area. Based on what was discovered from this study, there are a number of points of departure for further research.

1. As this study centred on examining popular narrative song from the perspective of those who were intimate with the use and nature of songs, other perspectives regarding song may be gained by studying other groups of people or individuals in other settings. One informant made an astute observation. “I think that it is important that you ask these questions to some people that have nothing to do with music. Because it seems like you are asking people who are passionately involved. The real answer to this is on the outside world, that isn’t passionately involved. By asking people that are at the other end, that aren’t that interested what kind of an effect does this have on them. Would probably be a really good question to ask as well. To see if that is true or not.” Based on this informant’s observation, presenting similar questions to a different and broader participant base, including those not intimately involved with song, would expand the knowledge base regarding the transfer of learning through song. One method of gathering this data might be to utilise a research methodology that employs the use of a survey aimed at music consumers. Similarly, since this research focused on adults, it might be advantageous to explore if there are differences among various demographic groups based on age, gender, or other cultural specifics that may have an impact on the potential use of song as a learning tool or vehicle.
Several participants saw some potential in learning from songs that were not necessarily narrative in nature. A comparative study examining the learning implications of both narrative song and other forms of music might also expand the knowledge base. An extension of this might include comparative studies of song and other expressive art forms such as poetry, forms of narrative other than song, drama, or, perhaps, visual art forms.

The compilation of a subject based bibliography and/or discography of popular narrative songs for use by researchers to test the learning potential of song might be become an initial step of future research. The next step would be to complete an analysis of the use of popular song and music in non-distance learning environments, in an attempt to gather together a core of relevant applications that may also be useful in distance learning situations. This, in turn, could provide a foundation for experiments and testing in various distance learning situations.

A more thorough understanding of the transfer of learning through popular narrative song would also require further studies and different research methodologies. If it were possible to organise a number of studies, comparative longitudinal investigations focusing on whether and how popular song could contribute to changes in learning patterns could be undertaken. As well, longitudinal studies might ascertain how effective learning through the use of song might be, the longevity of changes in learning, and those investigating might also illuminate other, as yet undiscovered, traits associated with learning through the use of song.

Research demonstrating how popular narrative song might be integrated into distance adult learning situations. This could include well documented, practical examples of
the use of song in distance education situations, where distance educators with an interest in examining the potential of song volunteered to use popular narrative song as a teaching or learning tool. This type of research project would require gathering the views of learners, distance educators, and administrators with regard to the impact of the use of song and learning. Munby and Russell (1995, cited in Upitis, Smithrim, & Soren, 1999) argue that connections between research and practice have to be addressed within research, with educators developing knowledge and practice through a research project. Projects of this nature would have to incorporate evaluation procedures to measure the success of using song in a specific learning situation. Several researchers contend that more research is needed in the area of media selection, the contribution of each medium to the learning process, and the effectiveness of different technologies which deliver similar content to similar audiences (Garrison, 2000; Kirkwood, 1998; McIssac & Gunawardena, 1996; McNabb, 1994, cited in Sherry, 1996). By conducting empirical studies, in both the face-to-face learning and in the context of distance learning, the feasibility of using songs as a learning vehicle or tool could be assessed in an attempt to determine if and to what degree individuals can learn from popular narrative songs. Keegan (1996, p. 15) concurs when he states “problem-based case-studies can provide guides to good practice.” These, in turn, could provide validation for the use of song in distance adult learning.
REFERENCES


http://www.athabascau.ca/policy/research/ethicpolicy.htm


http://www.nova.edu/sss/QR/QR5-3/brearley.html


http://www.ed.uiuc.edu/EPS/Educational-Theory/Contents/45_1_Bresler.asp


http://nlu.nl.edu/ace/Resources/Documents/AdultLearning.html


Cantwell, R. (1996). When we were good: The folk revival. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.


http://www.col.org/ODLIntro/introODL/htm


http://www.col.org/ODLIntro/glossary1.htm


http://www.findarticles.com/cf_0/M2822/2_22/54504608/print.jhtml


231


http://www.leeds.ac.uk/music/Info/CMJ/Articles/1998/01/01.html


Guy, R. (1991). Distance education and the developing world: Colonisation, collaboration, and control. In T. Evans & B. King, (Eds.), *Beyond the Text: Contemporary Writing in Distance Education*, (pp. 152-175).


http://www.georgetown.edu/irvinemj/english016/syllabus.html


http://www.educause.edu/pub/er/review/reviewarticles/32126.html


http://gseweb.harvard.edu/ncsall/fob/1999/viens.htm


http://www.philosophypages.com


http://www.ed.gov/databases/ERIC_Digests/


http://www.ericacve.org/docgen.asp?tbl=tia&ID=104


www.ericave.org/docs/dig185.pdf


www.ericave.org/docs/dig229.pdf


http://members.tripod.com/~Roberta/methods.htm


Learning Insights. (June 13, 2002). *The power of storytelling.* Retrieved November 27, 2002 from the World Wide Web:

http://www.learninginsights.com/press/Article_Display.cfm?ArtID=56


http://www.leeds.ac.uk/music/Info/CMJ/Articles/1998/02/01.html


Murrillo, A.C. (1995). An experience in student human development at the Distance Education University. Costa Rica: (UNED). In David Stewart (Ed.), *One world, many voices: Quality in Open and Distance Learning, Volume 1*, pp. 277-278.


http://ericae.net/edo/ED250698.htm


from the World Wide Web:


the World Wide Web: http://educ.queens.ca/~arts/papers.html

http://www.ai.mit.edu/people/ellens/Gender/p2.html


Spronk, B. (Fall, 1994). Distance learning for participatory development: A case study.


education/therapy objectives. Journal of Research in Music Education, 44 (2), 105-
133.


September 13, 2000 from the World Wide Web:


Stilbourne, L. & Williams, L (1996). Meeting the needs of adult learners in developing
courses for the Internet. Retrieved November 3, 2000 from the World Wide Web:
http://www.isoc.org/isoc/whatis/conferences/inet/proceedings/c4/c4_2.htm


College. Retrieved November 13, 2001 from the World Wide Web:

http://www.col.org/audiohandbook/audiohandbook.htm


http://www.col.org/knowledge/ks%20radio.htm


http://www.ericacve.org/pubs.asp


Retrieved December 4, 2001 from the World Wide Web:
http://www.nserc.ca/programs/ethics/english/policy.htm


[http://www.aber.ac.uk/~mm/97/sheff2.html](http://www.aber.ac.uk/~mm/97/sheff2.html)


Upitis, R. & Smithrim, K. (2001). The effects of an enriched elementary arts education program on teacher development, artist practices, and student achievement: Baseline student achievement and teacher data from six Canadian sites. *International Journal*


*Contemporary methods for research in education* (2nd ed., pp. 325-369). Washington,

University. Retrieved May 29, 2002 from the World Wide Web:

http://www.royalroads.ca/stl/topics/brainbased/theory.htm


http://www.icfw.org/study-power.html


http://www.uwsa.edu/olit/ttt/tttv4n2.htm


*Training*, 57-61.
Appendix 1 – Research Instrument: Interview Guide/Schedule

The following questions constitute a launching point for the interviews I conducted with participants/informants in order to understand their point of view and guide my inquiry into their attitudes and thoughts about the use of popular narrative song as a tool or vehicle for distance learning.

Opening questions
1. I’d like to know a little about your background… how you came to be involved with music and, especially, songs.
2. I wonder if you could tell me something about the nature or significance of song to you personally? To society?

Intermediary questions
1. Can one know anything from listening to a popular song?
2. Can you think of any personal experiences where a song served as a learning tool or vehicle for you?
3. What factors, events, people or thoughts stand out in your mind as being significant for songs to be used for the purposes of enlightenment or learning?
4. What are your thoughts with regard to popular narrative songs possessing any qualities or characteristics that can contribute to an adult’s learning?

Closing Questions
1. Do you have any thoughts or insights with regard to the possibility or potential of transferring the qualities or characteristics you have identified to a situation where individuals or groups were not face-to-face?
2. Why do you do this? Why do you perform or write.
Appendix 2 – Ohio

Tin soldiers and Nixon’s coming
We’re finally on our own
This summer I hear the drumming
Four dead in Ohio

Gotta get down to it
Soldiers are gunning us down
Should have been done long ago
What if you knew her
And found her dead on the ground
How can you run when you know?

La la la…
La la la…

Gotta get down to it
Soldiers are gunning us down
Should have been done long ago
What if you knew her
And found her dead on the ground
How can you run when you know?

Tin soldiers and Nixon’s coming
We’re finally on our own
This summer I hear the drumming
Four dead in Ohio

Four dead in Ohio

Neil Young © 1970 Cotillion Music, Inc. & Broken Arrow Music
Appendix 3 – Comin’ in on a Wing and a Prayer

Comin’ in on a wing and a prayer
Comin’ in on a wing and a prayer
Thought there’s one motor gone
We can still carry on
Comin’ in on a wing and a prayer

What a show, what a fight
Yes we really hit our target for tonight

How we sing as we limp through the air
Look below, there’s our field over there
With our full crew aboard
And our trust in the Lord
We’re comin’ in on a wing and a prayer

One of our planes was missing
Two hours overdue
One of our planes was missing
With all it’s gallant crew
The radio sets were humming
They waited for a word
Then a voice broke through the humming
And this is what they heard

Comin’ in on a wing and a prayer
Comin’ in on a wing and a prayer
Thought there’s one motor gone
We can still carry on
Comin’ in on a wing and a prayer

Harold Adamson & Jimmy McHugh © 1943 Robbins Music Corp. NYC
Can’t see nothin’ in front of me
Can’t see nothin’ coming up behind
I make my way through this darkness
I can’t feel nothing but this
chain that binds me
Lost track of how far I’ve gone
How far I’ve gone,
how high I’ve climbed
On my back’s a sixty pound stone
On my shoulder a half mile of line

Come on up for the rising
Come on up, lay your hands in mine
Come on up for the rising
Come on up for the rising tonight

Left the house this morning
Bells ringing filled the air
Wearin’ the cross of my calling
On wheels of fire I come
rollin down here

Come on up for the rising
Come on up, lay your hands in mine
Come on up for the rising
Come on up for the rising tonight

Li, li, li, li, li, li, li, li

There’s spirits above and behind me
Faces gone black, eyes burnin’ bright
May their precious blood bind me
Lord, as I stand before your fiery light

Li, li, li, li, li, li, li, li

I see you Mary in the garden
In the garden of a thousand sighs
There’s holy pictures
of our children
Dancin’ in a sky filled with light
May I feel your arms around me
May I feel your blood mix with mine
A dream of life comes to me
Like a catfish dancin’ on
the end of my line

Sky of blackness and sorrow
(a dream of life)
Sky of love, sky of tears
(a dream of life)
Sky of glory and sadness
(a dream of life)
Sky of mercy, sky of fear
(a dream of life)
Sky of memory and shadow
(a dream of life)
Your burnin’ wind fills my
arms tonight
Sky of longing and emptiness
(a dream of life)
Sky of fullness, sky of
blessed life

Come on up for the rising
Come on up, lay your
hands in mine
Come on up for the rising
Come on up for
The rising tonight

Li, li, li, li, li, li, li, li

Bruce Springsteen © 2002 ASCAP
Appendix 5 -- You Are My Sunshine

The other night dear
As I lay sleeping
I dreamed I held you in my arms.
When I awoke, dear
I was mistaken
And I hung my head and cried;

Chorus
You are my sunshine
My only sunshine
You make me happy
When skies are grey
You’ll never no dear
How much I love you
Please don’t take my sunshine away.

I’ll always love you
And make you happy
If you will only say the same
But if you leave me
To love another
You’ll regret it all some day;

Chorus

You told me once, dear
You really loved me
And no one else could come between
But now you’ve left me
And love another
You have shattered all my dreams;

Chorus

Louisiana my Louisiana
The place where I was born.
White fields of cotton
green fields clover,
the best fishing
and long tall corn;

Chorus
Crawfish gumbo and jambalaya
The biggest shrimp and sugar cane
The finest oysters
And sweet strawberries
From Toledo Bend to New Orleans;

Chorus

Jimmie Davis & Charles Mitchell © 1940 Peer International Corporation. Copyright renewed.
Appendix 6 – Helter Skelter

When I get to the bottom I go back to the top of the slide
Where I stop and I turn and I go for a ride
Till I get to the bottom and I see you again.

Do you, don’t you want me to love you
I’m coming down fast but I’m miles above you
Tell me tell me tell me come on tell me the answer
You may be a lover but you ain’t no dancer.

Helter skelter helter skelter
Helter skelter

Will you, won’t you want me to make you
I’m coming down fast but don’t let me break you
Tell me tell me tell me the answer
You may be a lover but you ain’t no dancer.

Look out helter skelter helter skelter
Helter skelter

When I get to the bottom I go back to the top of the slide
And I stop and I turn and I go for a ride
And I get to the bottom and I see you again

Well do you, don’t you want me to make you
I’m coming down fast but don’t let me break you
Tell me tell me tell me the answer
You may be a lover but you ain’t no dancer.

Look out helter skelter helter skelter
Helter skelter
Look out helter skelter
She’s coming down fast
Yes she is
Yes she is

John Lennon/Paul McCartney © 1968 Northern Songs Ltd.
Appendix 7 – Wouldn’t it be Loverly

All I want is a room somewhere
Far away from the cold night air
With one enormous chair
Oh, wouldn’t it be loverly?

Lots of chocolate for me to eat
Lots of coal makin’ lots of heat
Warm face, warm hands, warm feet
Oh, wouldn’t it be loverly?

Oh so lovely sittin’ abso-bloomin-lutely still
I would never budge till Spring crept over me window sill

Someone’s head restin’ on my knee
Warm and tender as she can be
Who takes good care of me
Oh, wouldn’t it be loverly?

Who takes good care of me
Oh, wouldn’t it be loverly? (loverly)
Loverly (loverly)
Oh, wouldn’t it be loverly?

Alan Jay Lerner and Frederick Loewe © 1956 Chappel & Co., Inc.
Appendix 8 – Masters of War

Come you masters of war
You that build the big guns
You that build the death planes
You that build all the bombs
You that hide behind walls
You that hide behind desks
I just want you to know I can see through your masks

You that never have done nothin’ but build to destroy
You play with my world like it’s your little toy
You put a gun in my hand then you hide from my eyes
Then you turn and run farther when the fast bullets fly

Like Judas of old you lie and deceive
A world war can’t be won, and you want me to believe
But I see through your eyes and I see through your brain
Like I see through the water that runs down my drain

You that fasten all the triggers for the others to fire
Then you sit back and watch while the death count gets higher
You hide in your mansions while the young people’s blood
Flows out of their bodies and gets buried in the mud

You’ve thrown the worst fear that can ever be hurled
Fear to bring children into the world
For threatening my baby, unborn and unnamed
You ain’t worth the blood that runs in your veins

How much do I know to talk out of turn
You might say I’m young, you might say I’m unlearned
But there’s one thing I know, though I’m younger than you
Even Jesus would never forgive what you do

Let me ask you one question: is your money that good?
Will it buy you forgiveness? Do you think that it could?
I think you will find when your death takes its toll
All the money you made won’t ever buy back your soul

And I hope that you die and your death will come soon
I’ll follow you casket through the pale afternoon
And I’ll watch while you’re lowered into your death bed
Then I’ll stand over your grave till I’m sure that you’re dead

Bob Dylan © M Whitmark & Sons (ASCAP)
Appendix 9 – Strange Fruit

Southern trees bear a strange fruit,
Blood on the leaves and blood on the root,
Black body swinging in the Southern breeze,
Strange fruit hanging from the poplar trees.

Pastoral scene of the gallant South,
The bulging eyes and the twisted mouth,
Scent of magnolia sweet and fresh,
And the sudden smell of burning flesh!

Here is a fruit for the crows to pluck,
For the rain to gather, for the wind to suck,
For the sun to rot, for a tree to drop,
Here is a strange and bitter crop.

Lewis Allen (pseudonym for Abel Meeropol) © 1940
Appendix 10 – The Wreck of the Edmund Fitzgerald

The legend lives on from the Chippewa on down
Of the big lake they called ‘Gitche Gumee’
The lake, it is said, never gives up her dead
When the skies of November turn gloomy
With a load of iron ore twenty-six thousand tons more
Than the *Edmund Fitzgerald* weighed empty.
That good ship and true was a bone to be chewed
When the gales of November came early.

The ship was the pride of the American side
Coming back from some mill in Wisconsin
As the big freighters go, it was bigger than most
With a crew and good captain well seasoned
Concluding some terms with a couple of steel firms
When they left fully loaded for Cleveland
And later that night when the ship’s bell rang
Could it be the north wind they’d been feelin’?

The wind in the wires made a tattle-tale sound
And a wave broke over the railing
And every man knew, as the captain did too,
T’was the witch of November come stealin’.
The dawn came late and the breakfast had to wait
When the Gales of November came slashin’.
When afternoon came it was freezin’ rain
In the face of a hurricane west wind.

When suppertime came, the old cook came on the deck sayin’
Fellas, it’s too rough to feed ya.
At Seven P.M. a main hatchway caved in, he said
Fellas, it’s been good ti’know ya
The captain wired in he had water comin’ in
And the good ship and crew was in peril.
And later that night when his lights went outta sight
Came the wreck of the *Edmund Fitzgerald*.

Does any one know where the love of god goes
When the waves turn the minutes to hours?
The searches all say they’d have made Whitefish Bay
If they’d put fifteen more miles behind her.
They might have split up or they might have capsized;
May have broke deep and took water.
And all that remains is the faces and the names
Of the wives and the sons and the daughters.
Lake Huron rolls, Superior sings.
In the rooms of her ice-water mansion.
Old Michigan steams like a young man’s dreams;
The islands and bays are for sportsmen.
And farther below Lake Ontario
Takes in what lake Erie can send her,
And the iron boats go as the mariners all know
With the Gales of November remembered.

In a must old hall in Detroit they prayed,
In the Maritime Sailors’ Cathedral
The church bell chimed till it rang twenty-nine times
For each man on the *Edmund Fitzgerald*.
The legend lives on from the Chippewa on down
Of the big lake they call ‘Gitche Gumee’.
Superior, they said, never gives up her dead
When the gales of November come early!

Gordon Lightfoot © 1976 Moose Music Ltd.
Appendix 11 – Canadian Railroad Trilogy

There was a time in this fair land when the railroad did not run,
When the wild majestic mountains stood alone against the sun
Long before the white man, and long before the wheel
When the green dark forest was too silent to be real

But time has no beginnings and histr’y has no bounds,
As to this verdant country they came from all around.
They sailed upon her waterways and they walked the forests tall
Built the mines, mills and factories for the good of us all.

And when the young man’s fancy was turning in the spring
The railroad men grew restless for to hear the manners ring.
Their minds were overflowing with visions of their day
And many a fortune won and lost and many a debt to pay

For they looked in the future and what did they see
They saw an iron road running from the sea to the sea
Bringin’ the goods to a young growin’ land
All up from the seaports and into their hands.

Bring in the workers and bring up the rails
We gotta lay down the tracks and tear up the trails.
Open her heart let the life-blood flow
Gotta get on our way ‘cause we’re moving too slow.

Get on our way ‘cause we’re moving too slow.

Behind the blue Rockies the sun is declinin’
The stars they come stealin’ at the close of the day.
Across the wise prairie our loved ones lie sleeping
Beyond the dark forest in a place far away.

We are the plowboys who work upon the railway
Swingin’ our hammers in the bright blazin’ sun.
Living on stew and drinking bad wiskey
Layin’ down track ‘til the long days are done.

Yeah, bendin’ our backs ‘til the railroad is done.

Now the song of the future has been sung,
All the battles have been won,
On the mountain tops we stand,
All the world at our command,
We have opened up the soil
With our teardrops and our toil

There was a time in this fair land when the railroad did not run,
When the wild majestic mountains stood alone against the sun
Long before the white man, and long before the wheel
When the green dark forest was too silent to be real

When the green dark forest was too silent to be real,
And many are the dead men too silent to be real.

Gordon Lightfoot © 1967 Warner Bros Inc.
Appendix 12 – The Hurricane

Pistol shots ring out in the barroom night
Enter Patty Valentine from the upper hall
She sees the bartender in a pool of blood
Cries out, “My god, they killed them all!”
Here comes the story of the Hurricane
The man the authorities came to blame
For something’ that he never done.
Put in a prison cell, but one time he could-a been
The champion of the world

Three bodies lyin’ there does Patty see
And another man named Bello, movin’ around mysteriously.
“I didn’t do it,” he says, and throws up his hands
“I was only robbin’ the register, I hope you understand.
I saw them leavin’,” he says, and he stops
“One of us had better call up the cops.”
And so Patty calls the cops
And they arrive on the scene with their red lights flashin’
In the hot New Jersey night.

Meanwhile, far away in another part of town
Rubin Carter and a couple of friends are drivin’ around.
Number one contender for the middleweight crown
Had no idea what kinda shit was about to go down
When a cop pulled him over to the side of the road
Just like the time before and the time before that.
In Paterson that’s just the way things go.
If you’re black you might as well not show up on the street
“Less you wanna draw the heat

Alfred Bello had a partner and he had a rap for the cops.
Him and Arthur Dexter Bradley were just out prowlin’ around
He said, “I saw two men runnin’ out, they looked like middleweights
They jumped into a white care with out-of-state plates.”
And Miss Patty Valintine just nodded her head.
Cop said, “Wait a minute, boys, this one’s not dead”
So they took him to the infirmary
And though this man could hardly see
They told him that he could identify the guilty men.

Four in the mornin’ and they haul Rubin in,
Take him to the hospital and they bring him upstairs.
The wounded man looks up through his one dyin’ eye
Says, “Wha’d you bring him in here for? He ain’t the guy!”
Yes, here’s the story of the Hurricane,
The man the authorities came to blame
For somethin’ that he never done.
Put in a prison cell, but one time he could-a been
The champion of the world.

Four months later, the ghettos are in flame,
Rubin’s in South America, fightin’ for his name
While Arthur Dexter Bradley’s still in the robbery game
And the cops are puttin’ the screws to him, lookin’ for somebody to blame.
“Remember that murder that happened in a bar?”
“Remember you said you saw the getaway car?”
“You think you’d like to play ball with the law?”
“Think it might-a been that fighter that you saw runnin’ that night?”
“Don’t forget that you are white.”

Arthur Dexter Bradley said “I’m really not sure.”
Cops said, “A poor boy like you could use a break
We got you for the motel job and we’re talkin’ to your friend Bello
Now you don’t wanna have to go back to jail, be a nice fellow.
You’ll be doin’ society a favor.
We want to put his ass in stir
We want to pin this triple murder on him
He ain’t no Gentleman Jim.”

Rubin could take a man out with just one punch
But he never did like to balk about it all that much.
It’s my work, he’d say, and I do it for pay
And when it’s over I’d just as soon go on my way
Up to some paradise
Where the trout streams flow and the air is nice
And ride a horse along a trail.
But when they took him to the jailhouse
Where they try to turn a man into a mouse.

All of Rubin’s cards were marked in advance
The trial was a pig-circus, he never had a chance.
The judge made Rubin’s witnesses drunkards from the slums
To the white folks who watched he was a revolutionary bum
And to the black folks he was just a crazy nigger.
No one doubted that he pulled the trigger.
And though they could not produce the gun, The D.A. said he was the one who did the deed
And the all-white jury agreed.

Rubin Carter was falsely tried.
The crime was murder “one,” guess who testified?
Bello and Bradley and they both badly lied
And the newspapers, they all went along for the ride.
How can the life of such a man
Be in the palm of some fool’s hand?
To see him obviously framed
 Couldn’t help but make me feel ashamed to live in land
Where justice is a game

Now all the criminals in their coats and their ties
Are free to drink martinis and watch the sun rise
While Rubin sits like Budda in a ten-foot cell
An innocent man in a living hell.
That’s the story of the Hurricane,
But it won’t be over till they clear his name
And give him back the time he’s done.
Put in a prison cell, but one time he could-a been
The champion of the world.

Bob Dylan & Jacques Levy © 1975 Ram’s Horn Music
Appendix 13 – Deportee (Plane Wreck at Los Gatos)

The crops are all in
And the peaches are rotting
The oranges are stacked
In their Creosote dumps
They’re flying them back
To that Mexico border
To pay all their wages
To wade back again

Chorus
Goodbye to you Juan, goodbye Rosalita
Adios mis amigos, Jesus and Maria
You won’t have a name
When you ride the big airplane
All they will call you
Will be deportee

My father’s own father
He waded that river
They took all the money
He made in his life
My brothers and sisters
Come working the fruit trees
And they rode on the trucks
‘til they took down and died

Chorus
Somos ilegales {Well some are illegal}
Y mal recibidos {And some are not wanted}
Se a caba el contrato {Our work contracts out}
Y de alli a caminar {And we’ve got to move on}
Six hundred miles To that Mexico border
They chase us like outlaws
Like rustlers, like thieves

Chorus
We died in your hills
And we died on your deserts
We died in your valleys
We died on your plains
We died ‘neath your trees
And we died in your bushes
Both sides of that river
We died just the same
The sky caught fire
Over Los Gatos Canyon
Like a fireball of lightning
And shook all our hills
Who are all those friends
All scattered like dry leaves
The radio says
They are just deportees

Chorus
Is this the best way
We can grow our big orchards?
I this the best way
We can grow our good fruit?
To fall like dry leaves
And rot on my topsoil
And be known by no name
Except deportee

Chorus

Appendix 14 – If I had a Hammer

If I had a hammer
I’d hammer in the morning
I’d hammer in the evening
All over his land
I’d hammer out danger
I’d hammer out a warning
I’d hammer out love between my brothers and my sisters
All over this land

If I had a bell
I’d ring it in the morning
I’d ring it in the evening
All over this land
I’d ring out danger
I’d ring out a warning
I’d ring out love between my brothers and my sisters
All over this land

If I had a song
I’d sing it in the morning
I’d sing it in the evening
All over this land
I’d song out danger
I’d sing out a warning
I’d sing out love between my brothers and my sisters
All over this land

Well I’ve got a hammer
And I’ve got a bell
And I’ve got a song to sing
All over this land
It’s the hammer of justice
It’s the bell of freedom
It’s the song about love between my bothers and my sisters
All over this land

Appendix 15 – Nkosi Sikelel’ iAfrika/ iAfrika and Die Stem

Nkosi sikelel’ iAfrika
Maluphakanyisw’ uphondo lwayo,
Yizwa imithandazo yethu,
Nkosi sikelela, thina lusapho lwayo.

Morena boloka setjhaba sa heso,
O fedise dintwa le matshwenyeho,
O se boloke, O se boloke setjhaba sa heso,
Sethaba sa South Afrika – South Afrika.

Uit die blou van onse hemel,
Uit die diepte van ons see,
Oor ons ewige gebergtes,
Waar die kranse antwoord gee,

Sounds the call to come together,
And united we shall stand,
Let us life and strive for freedom,
In South Africa our land.

This is the official version of the national anthem of South Africa, combining Nkosi sikelel’ iAfrika and Die Stem / The Call of South Africa.(Act No. 108 of 1996).
Appendix 16 – Bells of Rhymney

Oh what will you give me?
Say the sad bells of Rhymney
Is there hope for the future?
Say the brown bells of Merthyr
Who made the mine owners?
Say the black bells of Rhondda
Who robbed the miners?
Say the grim bells of Blyna

They will plunder willy nilly
Say the bells of Caerphilly
They have fangs, they have teeth
Shout the loud bells of Neath
Even God is uneasy
Say the moist bells of Swansea
And what will you give me?
Say the sad bells of Rhymney

Throw the vandels in court
Say the bells of Newport
All would be well if-if-if-if
Say the green bells of Cardriff
Why so worried sisters why?
Say the silver bells of Wye
And what will you give me?
Say the sad bells of Rhymney

Idris Davies and Pete Seeger © Ludlow Music, Inc. (BMI)
Appendix 17 – They Dance Alone (Gueca Solo)

Why are these women here dancing on their own?
Why is there this sadness in their eyes?
Why are the soldiers here
Their faces fixed like stone?
I can’t see what it is that they despise

Chorus
They’re dancing with the missing
They’re dancing with the dead
They dance with the invisible ones
Their anguish is unsaid
They’re dancing with their fathers
They’re dancing with their sons
They’re dancing with their husbands
They dance alone They dance alone

It’s the only form of protest they’re allowed
I’ve seen their silent faces scream so loud
If they were to speak these words
they’d go missing too
Another woman on the torture table
what else can they do

Chorus

One day we’ll dance on their graves
One day we’ll sing our freedom
One day we’ll laugh in our joy
And we’ll dance

Ellas danzan con los desaparecidos
Ellas danzan con los muertos
Ellas danzan con amores invisibles
Ellas danzan con silenciosa angustia
Danzan con sus padres
Danzan con sus hijos
Danzan con sus esposos
Ellas danzan solas
Danzan solas

Hey Mr. Pinochet
You’ve sown a bitter crop
It’s foreign money that supports you
One day the money’s going to stop
No wages for your torturers
No budget for your guns
Can you think of your own mother
Dancin’ with her invisible son

Chorus

Appendix 18 – **Hard Times Come Again No More**

Let us pause in life’s pleasure and count it’s many tears  
While we all sup sorrow with the poor  
There’s a song that will linger forever in our ears;  
Oh, hard times come again no more

Chorus  
‘tis the song, the sigh of the weary  
Hard times, hard times come again no more  
Many days you have lingered  
Around my cabin door  
Oh hard times come again no more

While we seek mirth and beauty and music light and gay  
There are frail forms fainting at the door  
Though their voices are silent, their pleading looks will say;  
Oh, hard times come again no more

Chorus

There’s a pale sorrowed maiden who toils her life away  
With a worn heart whose better days are o’er  
Though her voice would be merry, ‘tis sighting all the day  
Oh, hard times come again no more

Chorus

‘tis a sigh that is wafted across the troubled wave  
‘tis a wail that is heard upon the shore  
‘tis a dirge that is murmured around the lowly grave  
Oh, hard times come again no more

Chorus

Stephen Collins Foster (published by Firth, Pond & co., NY., 1854) public domain
Appendix 19 – The Mary Ellen Carter

She went down last October in a pouring driving rain.
The skipper, he’d been drinking and the Mate, he felt no pain.
Too close to Three Mile Rock, and she was dealt her mortal blow,
And the Mary Ellen Carter settled low.
There were five of us aboard her when she finally was awash.
We’d worked like hell to save her, all heedless of the cost.
And the groan she gave as she went down, it caused us to proclaim
That the Mary Ellen Carter would rise again.

Well the owners wrote her off; not a nickel would they spend
She gave twenty years of service boys, then met her sorry end.
But insurance paid the loss to them, they let her rest below.
Then they laughed at us and said we had to go.
But we talked of her all winter, some days around the clock,
For she’s worth a quarter million, afloat and at the dock.
And with every jar that hit the bar, we swore we would remain
And make the Mary Ellen Carter rise again.

Rise again, rise again, that her name not be lost
To the knowledge of men
Those who loved her best and were with her till the end
Will make the Mary Ellen Carter rise again.

All spring, now, we’ve been with her on a barge lent by a frie’d.
Three dives a day in hard hat suit and twice I’ve had the bends.
Thank God it’s only sixty feet and the currents here are slow
Or I’d never have the strength to go below.
But we’ve patched her rents, stopped her vents, dogged hatch and porthole down.
Put cables to her ‘fore and aft and birded her around.
Tomorrow, noon, we hit the air and then take up the strain.
And watch the Mary Ellen Carter Rise Again.

For we couldn’t leave her there, you see, to crumble into scale.
She’d saved our lives so many times, living through the gale
And the laughing, drunken rates who left her to a sorry grave
They won’t be laughing in another day…
And you, to whom adversity has dealt the final blow
With smiling bastards lying to you everywhere you go
Turn to, and put out all your strength of arm and heart and brain
And like the Mary Ellen Carter, rise again.
Rise again, rise again – though your heart is broken
And life about to end
No matter what you’ve lost, be it a home, a love, a friend.
Like the Mary Ellen Carter, rise again.

Stan Rogers © 1979 Fogarty’s Cove Music
Appendix 20 – Greensleeves

Greensleeves was all my joy,
Greensleeves was my delight:
Greensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

Alas my love, ye do me wrong,
To cast me off discourteously:
And I have loved you so long
Delighting in your companie.
Greensleeves was all my joy,
Greensleeves was my delight:
Greensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

I have been readie at your hand,
To grant what ever you would crave.
I have both waged life and land,
Your love and good will for to have.
Greensleeves was all my joy,
Greensleeves was my delight:
Greensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

I bought thee peticotes of the best,
The cloth so fine as might be:
I gave thee jewels for they chest,
And all this cost I spent on thee.
Greensleeves was all my joy,
Greensleeves was my delight:
Greensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

They smock of silk, both faire and white,
With gold embroidered gorgeously:
They peticote of Sendall right:
And thus I bought the gladly.
Greensleeves was all my joy,
Geensleeves was my delight:
Greensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

They girdle of gold so red,
With pearles bedecked sumptuously:
The like no other lasses had,
And yet thou wouldst not love me,
Greensleeves was all my joy,
Geensleeves was my delight:
Greensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

They purse and eke thy gay guilt kniues,
They pincase gallent to the eie:
No better wore the Burgesse wives,
And yet thous wouldst not love me.
Greensleeves was all my joy,
Geensleeves was my delight:
Greensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

Thy crimson stockings all of silk,
With gold all wrought aboue the knee
Thy pumps as white as was the milk,
And yet thou wouldst not love me
Greensleeves was all my joy,
Geensleeves was my delight:
Greensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

Thy gown was of the grossie green,
They sleeves of Satten hanging by:
Which made thee be our haruest Queen,
And yet thou wouldst not love me.
Greensleeves was all my joy,
Geensleeves was my delight:
Greensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

Thy garters fringed with the golde,
And silver aglets haning by,
Which made thee blithe for to beholde,
And yet thou wouldst not love me.
Greensleeves was all my joy,
Greensleeves was my delight:
Greensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

My gayest gelding I thee gave,
To ride where ever liked thee,
No Ladie ever was so brave,
And yet thou wouldst not love me.
Greensleeves was all my joy,
Greensleeves was my delight:
Greensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

My men were clothed all in green,
And they did ever wait on thee:
Al this was gallant to be seen,
And yet thou wouldst not love me.
Greensleeves was all my joy,
Greensleeves was my delight:
Greensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

They set thee up, they took thee downe,
They served thee with humilitie,
They foote might not once touch the ground,
And yet thoug wouldst not love me.
Greensleeves was all my joy,
Greensleeves was my delight:
Greensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

For everie morning when thou rose,
I sent thee dainties orderly:
To cheare they stomack from all woes,
And yet thou wouldst not love me.
Greensleeves was all my joy,
Greensleeves was my delight:
Greensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

Thou couldst desire no earthly thing.
But stil thou hadst it readily:
Thy musicke still to play and sing,
And yet thou wouldst not love me.
Greensleeves was all my joy,
Geensleeves was my delight:
Geensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

And who did pay for all this geare,
That thou didst spend when pleased thee?
Even I that am rejected here,
And thou disdainst to love me.
Greensleeves was all my joy,
Geensleeves was my delight:
Greensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

Wel, I wil pray to God on hie,
That thou my constancie maist see:
And that yet once before I die,
Thou wilt vouchsafe to love me.
Greensleeves was all my joy,
Geensleeves was my delight:
Greensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

Greensleeves now farewel adue,
God I pray to prosper thee:
For I am stil they lover true,
Come once againe and love me.
Greensleeves was all my joy,
Geensleeves was my delight:
Greensleeves was my heart of gold,
And who but Ladie Greensleeves.

Original 1580 lyrics; the tune first appeared in 1652. From a Handful of Pleasant Delights by Clement Robinson and Divers Others (1584). Traditional English lyrics by King Henry VIII (1509-1547).
Appendix 21 – Dawning of the Age of Aquarius

When the moon is in the seventh house
And Jupiter aligns with Mars
Then peace will guide the planets
And love will steer the stars.

This is the dawning of the age of Aquarius,
The age of Aquarius
Aquarius
Aquarius

Harmony and understanding,
Sympathy and trust abounding,
No more falsehoods or derisions,
Golden living dreams of visions,

Mystic crystal revelation
And the mind’s true liberation
Aquarius
Aquarius
Aquarius

When the moon is in the seventh house
And Jupiter aligns with Mars
Then peace will guide the planets
And love will steer the stars.

This is the dawning of the age of Aquarius,
The age of Aquarius
Aquarius
Aquarius
Aquarius

Galt MacDermot, James Rado & Gerome Ragni © 1967
Appendix 22 – The Internationale

Arise ye workers from your slumbers
Arise ye prisoners of want
For reason in revolt now thunders
And at last ends the age of cant.

Away with all your superstitions
Servile masses arise, arise
We’ll change henceforth the old tradition
And spurn the dust to win the prize.

So comrades come rally
And the last fight let us face
The Internationale unites the human race
So comrades, come rally
And the last fight let us face
The Internationale unites the human race.

No more deluded by reaction
On tyrants only we’ll make war
The soldiers too will take strike action
They’ll break ranks and fight no more
And if those cannibals keep trying
To sacrifice us to their pride
They soon shall hear the bullets flying
We’ll shoot the generals on our own side.

No saviour from on high delivers
No faith have we in prince or peer
Our own right hand the chains must shiver
Chains of hatred, greed and fear
E’er the thieves will out with their booty
And give to all a happier lot.
Each at the forge must do their duty
And we’ll strike while the iron is hot.

Words: Eugene Pottier – 1871 – Public Domain
Music: Pierre Degeyter – (1888) – Public Domain
The Internationale (alternate version)

Stand up, all victims of oppression
For the tyrants fear your might
Don’t cling so hard to your possessions
For you have nothing, if you have no rights
Let racist ignorance be ended
For respect makes the empires fall
Freedom is merely privilege extended
Unless enjoyed by one and all

Chorus:
So come brothers
For the struggle carries on
The Internationale
Unites the world in song
So comrades come rally
For this is the time and place
The Internationale ideal
Unites the human race

Let non one build walls to divide us
Walls of hatred nor walls of stone
Come greet the dawn and stand behind us
We’ll live together or we’ll die alone
In our world poisoned by exploitation
Those who have taken, now they must give
And end the vanity of nations
We’ve but one Earth on which to live

And so begins the final drama
In the streets and in the fields
We stand unbowed before their armour
We defy their guns and shields
When we fight, provoked by their aggression
Let us be inspired by like and love
For though they offer us concessions
Change will not come from above

Words: Billy Bragg © Billy Bragg  Music: Pierre Degreyter (Public Domain)
Appendix 23 – Homeless

Cardboard sign old and bent, says “Friend for Life 25c”
When did this start makin’ sense man it’s really getting cold
Sometimes I forget things I get confused
I could still be working but they refuse
Now I’m livin’ with the bums, the whores and the abused
Man I hate getting old

Betty sings a song that no one hears
As the wind begins to freeze her tears
She says God it’s been so many years
She’s way past complainin’
She sings a heartfelt melody
No it’s not what she thought it’d be
But he it could be rainin’

Homeless…get away from here
Don’t give ‘em no money they’ll just spend it on beer
Homeless…will work for food
You’ll do anything you gotta do when you’re homeless

Life ain’t easy it takes work
It takes healin’ cause you’re gonna get hurt
Lose your way some time
You never really have control
Sometimes you just gotta let it go
When the final line unfolds
It don’t always rhyme

Homeless…get away from here
Don’t give ‘em no money they’ll just spend it on beer
Homeless…will work for food
You’ll do anything you gotta do when you’re homeless

Cardboard sign old and bent says “Friend for Life 25 c”

Guy Clark and Ray Stephenson © 2002 EMI April Music Inc. / GSC Music / East Valley Music (ASCAP)